Australian and New Zealand Association for Research in Music Education

Magnetic Resonance and Research Conversations
Proceedings of the 2010 XXXVIInd and 2011 XXXIIIrd Annual Conferences

3 - 6 July, 2010 - Townsville, Australia
6 - 8 July, 2011 - Gold Coast, Australia
Publishing Details

All published papers and abstracts have been subject to blind peer review process.

Publisher
Australian and New Zealand Association
For Research in Music Education
(ANZARME Australia)

Editors
Dr David Salisbury & Dr Kay Hartwig

Review Panel
Dr Geoffrey Lowe, Edith Cowan University
Dr Anne Power, University of Western Sydney
Dr David Forrest, RMIT University
Dr Dawn Bennett, Curtin University
Dr Pamela Burnard, University of Cambridge, England
Dr Harry Burke, Monash University
Dr Amanda Watson, Department of Education, Victoria
Dr Patrick Shepherd, University of Canterbury, New Zealand
Dr Roger Buckton, University of Canterbury, New Zealand
Dr Ryan Daniel, James Cook University
Dr Christopher Klopper, Griffith University
Dr Scott Harrison, Griffith University
Dr Deidre Russell-Bowie, University of Western Sydney
Dr Mark Fonder, Ithaca University, USA
Dr Neryl Jeanneret, University of Melbourne
Dr Renee Crawford, Monash University
Dr Nerelee Henry, Monash University
Dr Bradley Merrick, Bradley College
Dr Jennifer Rosevear, Elder Conservatorium of Music, University of Adelaide
Mr Rohan Netshinghe, Monash University
Mr Graham Sattler, University of Sydney

Printed by
James Cook University

Format
CD ROM

ISBN
978-0-646-57042-6
Contents

Publishing Details .................................................................................................................. 2

Contents.................................................................................................................................. 3

Refereed Abstracts 2010 Conference .................................................................................. 5
Samantha Diekmann: University of Sydney ................................................................. 5
Marretje van Wezel: Australian National University....................................................... 5
Graham Sattler: University of Sydney .................................................................................. 6
David Sell: University of Canterbury .................................................................................. 6
Peter de Vries: Monash University ...................................................................................... 7
Julia Bowden: James Cook University ................................................................................ 7
Roger Buckton: University of Canterbury ........................................................................ 8
Jane Southcott: Monash University .................................................................................... 8
Dawn Joseph & Marina Heading: Deakin University ....................................................... 9
Cade Bonar: Griffith University .......................................................................................... 10
Angela Lee: Transworld Institute of Technology ............................................................ 10
Leah Daniel & Ryan Daniel: James Cook University ...................................................... 11
Dawn Joseph: Deakin University ...................................................................................... 12
Jane Southcott: Monash University ................................................................................... 13
Judith Brown: Central Queensland University .............................................................. 13
Kay Hartwig: Griffith University ....................................................................................... 14
Jill Ferris: Monash University ............................................................................................ 14
Rowena Riek: Griffith University ....................................................................................... 14

Refereed Papers 2010 Conference ..................................................................................... 16
Anne Power: University of Western Sydney ................................................................. 16
David Salisbury: James Cook University .......................................................................... 23
Geoffrey Lowe: Edith Cowan University ......................................................................... 31
Geoffrey Lowe: Edith Cowan University ......................................................................... 41
Kim Kirkman & Judith Brown: Central Queensland University ................................... 50

Refereed Abstracts 2011 Conference ............................................................................... 60
Beatrice Siew Yong Cheah: Kuala Lumpur ...................................................................... 60
Stuart Wise: University of Canterbury ............................................................................ 61
Judith Brown: Central Queensland University .............................................................. 61
Helen Lancaster: Griffith University .................................................................................. 62
Peter DeVries: Monash University .................................................................................... 62
Harry Burke: Monash University ..................................................................................... 63
Patrick Shepherd: University of Canterbury .................................................................... 64
Dawn Bennett: Curtin University ..................................................................................... 64
Julie Tann: Griffith University .......................................................................................... 65
Tim Nikolsky: RMIT University ....................................................................................... 66
Cade Bonar: Griffith University ....................................................................................... 66
Cade Bonar: Griffith University ....................................................................................... 67
Marilyn Chaseling: Southern Cross University .............................................................. 67
David Forrest: RMIT University ....................................................................................... 68
Kay Hartwig: Griffith University ....................................................................................... 69
Dawn Joseph and Jane Southcott: Deakin and Monash Universities ......................... 69
Rowena Riek: Griffith University ....................................................................................... 70
Jennifer Rosevear: Elder Conservatorium, University of Adelaide ................................ 71
David Sell: University of Canterbury ............................................................................... 71
Jane Southcott: Monash University ................................................................. 72

Refereed Papers 2011 Conference .................................................................. 73
 Maree Macmillan: RMIT University ............................................................... 73
 Malcolm Cole: James Cook University .......................................................... 82
 David Salisbury: James Cook University ....................................................... 101
 Jill Ferris & Berenice Nyland: RMIT University and Jan Deans: University of
 Melbourne ...................................................................................................... 113
 Amanda Watson: Department of Education, Victoria .................................... 123
 Joan Pope: Dalcroze Australia ...................................................................... 135
 Pam Burnard: University of Cambridge ...................................................... 146
Refereed Abstracts 2010 Conference

Samantha Diekmann: University of Sydney

*Inside Resettlement and Detention: Community Music Programs with Refugees and Asylum Seekers*

**Abstract**

This paper discusses the results of a multi-case study conducted in field locations in Sydney, Australia throughout 2007. The study examines the ways in which refugee and asylum seeker learners benefit from engaging in community music programs during resettlement or detention. It explores the means by which music learning can address the social, emotional and cultural challenges often experienced after forced migration. This study examines three specific case study contexts: a choir, a general music education program and drumming workshops. As an intrinsic study, this thesis examines the circumstances particular to each case. Using participants’ accounts, observations of learning experiences and program documents, it explores the impact of the organisers’, teachers’ and learners’ expectations of and approaches to the programs. In addition, this project presents successful pedagogical principles on which others working with exiled communities can reflect. A close investigation of factors such as the learning environment, participants’ perceptions of music and motivations for involvement reveals self-identity as a core issue through which the various social, emotional and cultural challenges may be addressed.

Marretje van Wezel: Australian National University

*“The sound before the symbol - A New Approach to the Teaching and Learning of Tonal Harmony and Analysis to Pre-Tertiary Students”.*

**Abstract**

This paper hypothesises that many candidates studying music for AMEB or equivalent exam systems write their harmony mathematically and often cannot hear what they are writing. It will be shown that students first need to hear and understand the function of triads before attempting to write basic progressions. Knowing and understanding the function of each chord makes harmony easier to learn and teach. This paper examines the progression of students in harmonic aural and written skills as they explore each chord and the effect each progression creates. A basic knowledge of spelling triads on all scale degrees is presumed.

New to the approach is that the student is introduced to the sound of basic chord progressions and learnt the function of chords before writing harmony exercises. Keyboard improvisation and analysis of works by great composers from the baroque period to popular songs is an important part of this course. The basis of this approach is to focus first on the three primary triads. These are the tonic (T), subdominant (S) and dominant (D). These three triads function as the pillars of all
tonal harmony. Other chords are merely elongations in time or substitutions of those three primary triads. When students understand this concept and can aurally perceive it, their written work becomes musically interesting and coherent.

Graham Sattler: University of Sydney

*Mapping Local government cultural policy to understand the provision of music education in marginalised NSW communities*

**Abstract**

The NSW State Government requires councils to develop and implement strategies to promote and enable the cultural growth and well-being of its communities. Within this context, frameworks for community music activity are variously developed; by way of supporting inclusive, participatory activity for self-expression, connectedness, and group and self-esteem. This paper investigates and compares cultural policy across four Local Government Areas, with reference to NSW State legislation and current Australian Government cultural policy, positioning the provision of music education within those communities.

The four Local Government Areas were chosen with reference to their jurisdiction over the seven participant communities taking part in the research project: *Socio-cultural development through music programs in marginalised communities*. The Local Government areas are all in regional NSW, with population bases ranging from less than 2,000 to over 40,000: with cultural composition varying from majority indigenous, through multicultural, to largely monocultural.

For the purpose of this paper, and the overarching project, communities are defined as marginalised by virtue of indigeneity, ethnicity, distance, health and socioeconomic status. The researcher tracks the cultural values down through three levels of government; identifying the impact of agenda, ownership, and transmission at the various stages along that pathway; and makes observations in relation to the end cultural environments within which music education sits and operates.

David Sell: University of Canterbury

*From air to ear – the beginnings of music broadcasts to schools in New Zealand*

**Abstract**

After decades of discovery and experimentation, the first public radio broadcast in New Zealand was in 1925, just five years after the USA, and one year after Britain. It took only two further years for the education and broadcasting authorities in New Zealand to recognise the potential of radio to reach the schools of its small, scattered population. From the beginning, music was the most consistently
successful subject in New Zealand educational broadcasts. In this paper the origins and influence on education and the community of broadcasts to schools in New Zealand are described and critically assessed, and related to current comment on technology in music education. The reasons given by one leading music educator in 1937 for opposing schools broadcasts are examined in the light of music educational attitudes and practices seventy years later. Excerpts from some early broadcasts will be played and discussed.

Peter de Vries: Monash University

The role of music in the lives of two older Australians: A phenomenological analysis of self-reported descriptions

Abstract

The role that music plays in the lives of two older Australians is explored. Based on interview data, the lived musical experiences of a professional musical performer whose life has been immersed in music is contrasted with an amateur listener of music who later in life has turned to presenting music appreciation to retirees. Despite their very different ways of engaging with music in later life, similar themes in their musical experiences emerged, namely: their engagement with music is a social experience, a sense of agency in the way they engage with music is valued, music is an integral part of their lives, there is an emphasis on the importance of learning and maintaining music knowledge and skills, and music is seen as being important in the lives of other people.

Julia Bowden: James Cook University

The intermediate piano student: an investigation of the impact of learning material on motivation.

Abstract

The intermediate piano student is often neglected in terms of systematic research inquiry, despite the fact that this level is a pivotal stage in learning. Attempting to define the intermediate piano student is challenging and complex, primarily because the word intermediate is ambiguous, implying that the student is neither beginner nor advanced. Hence, while there are some texts about the piano student and the process of learning, the majority refer to either the beginner or advanced student. At the same time there is a variety of learning materials available for the intermediate piano student and teacher to use, including method books, external examination syllabi, existing repertoire, and literature guides. There is, however, little guidance on what programs of learning to follow or the extent to which this same learning material impacts on an intermediate student’s motivation. In order to investigate this issue, the perceptions of key stakeholders were sought,
including those from current intermediate piano teachers and students, method book authors, external examination bodies, contemporary composers and literature guide authors. This paper overviews the current learning programs relevant to intermediate piano teaching, synthesises the perceptions of key stakeholders, and offers directions and insights for those involved in the teaching of intermediate piano students.

Roger Buckton: University of Canterbury

_Pakeha New Zealand: Where have all the folk songs gone?_

Abstract

The International Folk Music Council (1955) defined folk music as the product of a music tradition that has evolved through the process of oral transmission. Continuity, variation and selection by the community were noted as factors that shape the traditions. This paper considers the inheritance of English folk music within the context of a multi-cultural New Zealand society and in a technological age.

The 19th century settlers, predominantly from Britain and many of these, from rural village life arrived in New Zealand with a tradition of songs and singing. Not only are these songs long gone but there have been few New Zealand songs, known by the population at large, that have replaced them. Ironically some of the tunes that have survived have been those adopted, translated and adapted by Maori to their own unique style of waiata so that a song like “Hoki hoki tonu mai” is known as a Maori waiata with the original ‘Little Brown Jug’ well gone, at least in New Zealand. In other words, it has been the Maori community which has provided the essential features of a folk song such as continuity, variation and selection noted above.

Is it possible, or even desirable, to try and recapture some of purposes and contexts of folk song from the traditional village setting? Is there a place in schooling to foster a love of singing that can work in tandem with the community?


Jane Southcott: Monash University

_Music and positive ageing in contemporary Australian society_

Abstract

According to the 2006 Census, the Australian population of nearly 21 million included 13% aged over 65 years of age and 18% aged between the years of 50 and 64. Comparatively recent Australia-wide data reported that Australians of 65 years of more are a heterogenous group from a diversity of backgrounds with a
variety of lifestyles, backgrounds, social, cultural and spiritual circumstances. Music plays a significant role in the lives of many older Australians. In this research we have undertaken a national survey in which we sought to explore musical engagement by older Australians, particularly active older citizens who find that music has the potential to enhance the quality of life. Our survey, advertised through seniors’ newspapers and public online sites, involved the completion of an questionnaire, designed to investigate involvement with music via closed and open questions. The quantitative data is presented statistically, the qualitative data is analysed using Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis which is presented thematically. A recent study of a group of older community musicians identified that music engagement provided as sense of purpose, valuing, community and formed opportunities for extended friendships and supported the maintenance of cognitive function. This current survey seeks to extend and refine earlier studies and identify the benefits of musical engagement for older Australians.

Dawn Joseph & Marina Heading: Deakin University

Professional Learning and Teacher Identity: Linking Music Theory to Practice

Abstract

Pre-service teachers need opportunities to develop and expand their professional knowledge where they can be reflective about the knowledge base they gained from the university. Although, the ‘hands-on’ approach to teaching and learning on-campus and when on school placement provide pre-service teachers with knowledge, skills and understanding, the continued support of professional learning is well recognised as pre-service teachers create their own professional identity. At Unnamed University (Melbourne, Australia) the ‘Arts’ are core units within the Bachelor of Education Primary Degree. This paper shares some reflective data from my desk as tertiary music educator preparing my generalist primary pre-service teachers to engage, explore and experience music education within the ECA409 and ECA410 core units. The article also offers a snapshot as a form of case study of one student’s experience teaching class music at a primary school during her school placement in 2009. During this experience she moved from student identity to teacher identity in what she calls ‘putting theory into practice and thinking on your feet’. As pre-service teacher, the school placement gave Unnamed a sense of professional identity where she engaged in music teaching that can be described as professional and reflected on her identity through a new construct of ‘teacher’s voice’. The paper focuses on (Unnamed) narrative reflection on her teaching with (Unnamed) the music lecturer, to improve her professional learning in order to find new ways to teach as she builds her teacher identity.
Abstract

Music is an enjoyed and influential factor in the lives of many young adolescents, as well as a prominent part of adolescent culture; however, many models of formal classroom music education do not acknowledge or reflect this. Western models of music education have perpetuated traditional systems of music learning by means of strictly controlled pedagogic systems and ordered curricula. As Regelski (2006) notes, “the praxis of music, otherwise so relevant to their [young adolescents’] existential Being, gets reduced to a mere ‘academic subject!’” (p. 14). Young adolescents’ musical lives outside of the school often sharply contrast with many models of music education, and their ways of musicking (Small, 1977) are neither passive or lacking intensity; as a result, formal music education and what for students is ‘real music’ exist at some considerable remove. The important praxial role of music in students’ lives outside of school, when set against formal systems that fail to provide accessible and relevant learning, can promote detrimental tensions and subsequently the disengagement and alienation of young adolescents from formal music education.

This review of the literature will examine the tensions inherent in providing accessible and meaningful music education to students in the middle years of schooling. It will synthesise findings from recent research and contemporary curriculum documents and seek to identify ways in which music education can better acknowledge young adolescents’ values of music and incorporate their informal musical learnings into rigorous, relevant and meaningful structures that support formal learning.

Abstract

The main purpose of this study is to examine and describe music teachers’ beliefs and teaching practices and to determine how these impact the manner in which teachers implement the Orff-Schulwerk approach in their classroom. The research uses in-depth individual interviews of three teachers who are qualified Orff teachers. These three teachers were invited to participate in this study based on recommendations. The interviews were analyzed using Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA). Three variables were considered: the related literature in terms of teachers’ beliefs and
teaching practices, the teachers’ endorsement and use of the Orff approach in the classroom (and how this impacted classroom practice), and the possible factors besides teacher recommendations which influence teachers’ teaching practices in terms of implementing the Orff approach in their classroom. The triangulation method was used to collect and analyze data that was based on non-participant observation, document collection, and in-depth interview.

Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA) indicated that three experienced Orff music teachers adapted and established a program for the teaching of the Orff approach that was suitable for a specific cultural context. The possibility for children to have a rich musical curriculum at an Orff school depends on their teachers’ beliefs and teaching practices. The interview findings revealed that the three teachers introduced this method to Taiwan after studying overseas; they also organized private music schools, where they now work as the Directors.

Secondly, the impact and benefit of this approach and its significance to the education potential of the children is clearly recognized by the three advocates of the approach. Thirdly, the three teachers’ beliefs do impact their teaching practices. The influencing factors are far more complicated and affected by their teaching beliefs, related experiences from the past to present, and teaching situation. Fourthly, this research contributes to a better understanding of teachers’ beliefs and teaching practices with regard to Orff musical instruction.

Finally, such findings as this research would certainly stimulate government and local community organizations awareness about the musical education of young children. This will hopefully ensure that three teachers will improve their own teaching practices thereby provides a more effective preschool music education.

Leah Daniel & Ryan Daniel: James Cook University

Can quality music education take place online?

Abstract

The arts continue to be critical to the fabric of any society and consequently it has become increasingly important for music educators to increase access to and participation in music making by students of all levels and locations. Given the practice-based nature of music and musicianship, and regardless of whether it occurs in formal or informal environments, the formal learning of music has typically involved a student or students interacting with teachers in classrooms and music practice environments. However, the emergence of new technologies and software programs has meant that there is an increasing diversity of ways in which learners can access and engage with content. Therefore, to envisage, create and deliver a meaningful online or external program of learning and study for students in the area of music practice is potentially complex and challenging. This paper overviews the process recently undertaken when converting a face to face music making for children subject to an external (online) environment, and includes an
overview of the curriculum transformation process, the views of the educators involved in the delivery, as well as perceptions and evaluations presented by the students involved in this new method. The results offer insights into how students adapt and respond to an online environment as well as provide educators with strategies by which to consider the ways in which they may transform their approach to the delivery of music education.

Dawn Joseph: Deakin University

Beliefs and Attitudes of what pre-service teachers say about music teaching

Abstract

As Australian society becomes increasingly multicultural and the demographics of classrooms change, tertiary educators are challenged to prepare courses for pre-service teachers that would be inclusive and also prepare them for good classroom practice. Pre-service teachers’ views are often confronted at tertiary level in regards to theories of teaching and learning, which can through discussion and reflection change their perceptions and their understanding of classroom practice. Final year pre-service music specialist teachers from both Unnamed University and Unnamed University (Melbourne, Australia) participated in a research project (2005-2008) entitled Intercultural attitudes of pre-service music education students. Using Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA), this paper only reports on semi-structured interview data from the 2008 cohort. The final questions from the interviews regarding students’ attitudes and beliefs about what makes a good music teacher and their perception of themselves as future music teachers is discussed in this paper. Whilst the findings provide important insights into Australian pre-service teacher attitudes and beliefs about what constitutes a good teacher and their perception of themselves particularly as future music teachers, they also hold similar significance for teacher education in general. As teacher educator, we need to help our pre-service teachers to think in conscious way of their beliefs and attitudes about teaching if not they will perpetuate practices of what may not be good practice. Continued research with our students can only help us as tertiary educators prepare our students to be effective and inclusive teachers.
Jane Southcott: Monash University

Professional correspondents: John Hullah and Sarah Glover

Abstract

Sarah Anna Glover (1786-1867) was a seminal figure in the history of western music education. Her principles and practices were adopted by John Curwen and reformed into the Tonic Sol-fa method which spread across the British colonies and dominions. The correspondence of Glover and Curwen has been described in earlier articles, what is not known is that Glover had a corresponding relationship with John Hullah (1812-1884) another influential music educator. For more than a decade letters were exchanged that explored important ideas in music education. Although the correspondents never met (not for want of trying) there was a warm and respectful tone to their letters. They were in great accord in their ideas of congregational psalmody, class singing and the music education of all. This paper will present and discuss this hitherto unknown collaborative relationship.

Judith Brown: Central Queensland University

In the zone: An autoethnographic study exploring the links between flow and mindfulness for a piano accompanist

Abstract

This paper is part of a broader autoethnographic study of the phenomenon of flow as experienced by a piano accompanist. Flow is a “state of joy, creativity and total involvement with life” (Csikszentmihalyi, 2002, p. 213), that can be experienced when individuals are totally absorbed in a challenging activity. Csikszentmihalyi’s definition of the flow phenomenon describes an experience with seven distinct characteristics, and this paper explores the links between one of these characteristics: focussed attention, and one of the concepts related to flow: mindfulness (Langer, 1989; Wright, Sadlo & Stew, 2006). This paper is part of a broader autoethnographic study of the flow experiences of a piano accompanist that teases out the complex nature of the music performance from a personal perspective. Ellis and Bochner (2000) describe autoethnography as the process where authors use their own experiences in their culture to look more deeply at self and self-other interactions. In these contexts, autoethnography, as a way of studying the self and connecting the personal to the cultural and social (Ellis, 2004), provides a framework for critical self-reflection for me as both a performer and teacher to examine my practice and the effects of my practice on my students’ learning. This critical self-reflection is also informed by the work of Schön (1983, 1987). Through the use of an autoethnographic narrative I aim to shed light on how one of the characteristics of flow - focussed attention, and one of the concepts related to flow – mindfulness, is experienced by a piano accompanist and how this informs my teaching of pianists as collaborative artists.
Kay Hartwig: Griffith University

*How can I sing all day?*

**Abstract**

Does training assist primary pre service school music teachers to maintain vocal health during music practicums? The literature suggests that professional voice users have a high incidence of work-related voice problems and that teachers of music are eight times more likely to seek voice treatment than other voice professionals. Teachers and singers emerge as sub-populations most at special risk. This paper reports on a case study of pre-service primary music specialists who were preparing to undertake their first music teacher placement. The students firstly completed a questionnaire about their general health and were involved in sessions on how to look after their voices. They were interviewed whilst they were on the placement and they also completed personal journals during this time. The paper discusses the journey of two of the students as they reveal how they coped with the demands of singing each day for a continuous four week block.

Jill Ferris: Monash University

*‘But we had no song’: a study of the long-term effects of a staff singing group on the status of music in an early learning centre’s program.*

**Abstract**

This paper reports on-going research into the effects of a staff singing group at an early learning centre. This research arose from a suggestion that staff form a singing group and work with the music specialist to experience for themselves some of the emotions and challenges that children might experience in such everyday activities. The intention was to examine the effect this enterprise would have on the immediate and longer-term status of music in the centre’s program; this paper investigates longer-term effects. Interviews have been undertaken with participants in the singing group project, now two years ago. Data has been considered in the light of the literature regarding ‘social capital’.

Rowena Riek: Griffith University

*Education, values and mandates: where do the arts fit in?*

**Abstract**

This paper examines the literature regarding mandated reforms in Queensland schools and how these reforms are affecting teacher practice and parental interpretation of education and in particular Arts education. The reforms include NAPLAN (National Assessment Program for Literacy and Numeracy), National
Curriculum and other State based policies such as SmartMoves (Education Queensland, 2008).

The guiding curriculum list for schools in Queensland consists of Eight Key Learning Area’s (KLAs) - English, Maths, Science, LOTE, SOSE, HPE, Technology and the Arts. These KLAs have been agreed upon by all State and Territory Ministers of Education as part of the 1999 Adelaide Declaration on National Goals for Schooling in the Twenty First Century (Ministerial Council on Employment, Education, Training and Youth Affairs (Mceetya), 2009).

Primary school teachers are required to teach all eight KLAs. The curriculum must also account for the mandatory reforms. The question ultimately being asked is how will the teaching of key arts subjects (music, dance, drama, visual arts and media) be accommodated in this increasingly regulated and crowded curriculum space? By focusing on the literature in terms of parental values, teacher values, student voice and how these policies influence arts education practice, this paper seeks to provide a foundation for future policy debate.
Abstract

Drawing on a wider study, this paper focuses on the exploration of music in senior years of high school. In 2009, the wider research project, Teachers for a Fair Go, in a NSW Department of Education and Training Priority School investigated 1) whether students deeply valued music learning; and 2) whether students were involved in music learning experiences that would help them become more competent and empowered learners. This paper critiques the ways in which Year 12 students prepared for their performance and viva voce examinations. Students aged between 17 and 18 years of age were interviewed to elicit responses about their learning. Observations and interviews showed that in a school within a low socio-economic community, the teacher raised standards of student musical achievement, creating a classroom environment that is energised and consistently focused on excellence in musical performance.

Introduction

In this paper, two New South Wales policies are under observation. One is the Board of Studies syllabus in which Music of a Culture is a topic of study in the senior years of high school for the Higher School Certificate. The other is the Priority Schools Program in which support is offered to schools where students are drawn from low socio-economic status families. One teacher in a school in the Priority Schools Program provides the context for this study.

Policy of Priority Schools

In New South Wales, government policy on Priority Schools provides that a program support government schools serving the highest densities of low socio-economic status families in New South Wales. These programs provide extra resources, such as funding and staffing supplementation, to improve the literacy and numeracy achievements of students and their engagement in learning. These programs exist because concentration of disadvantage has been found to be the significant driver of educational underperformance (Holmes-Smith, 2006). Data in longitudinal surveys of Australian youth trends point to the fact that the average level of disadvantage of the whole school population contributes to educational disadvantage over and above that contributed by individual students (Erebus International, 2005). Schools are therefore identified and targeted with the support and resources needed to support student learning. The message to these schools is to ‘do things differently with more’ rather than ‘more of the same.’ Innovation is encouraged, supported and expected.
A research project called *Teachers for a Fair Go*, conducted by researchers from the University of Western Sydney (UWS), commenced in New South Wales in 2009, identifying specific teachers who were facilitating success for their students, challenging them with high expectations and engaging them in authentic learning experiences. There is strong early research evidence showing that low SES students shape classroom practices by resisting high level tasks and complying with low level tasks (Haberman, 1991). By contrast, *Teachers for a Fair Go* builds on research that demonstrates that student engagement connects with cognitive, affective and operative aspects of learning at high levels (NSW DET & UWS, 2006). Contributing to that engagement are the powerful classroom messages that students receive daily and that are formative to the way they see themselves as learners (Bernstein, 1996). The aims of the project were to analyse classroom pedagogy and to investigate the causal impact of teachers’ work on the academic outcomes of their students. This paper is about students exploring relationships between traditional and popular music. It is framed by the story of one teacher, ‘Norma,’ who has raised standards of student musical achievement and created a classroom environment that is energised and consistently focused on excellence in musical performance.

**Policy of Board of Studies Syllabus**

In Year 12 in NSW there are two syllabuses on offer, called Music 1 and Music 2. Both syllabuses offer the topic of Music of a Culture for study. In the HSC syllabus for Music 1 in New South Wales (NSW BOS, 1999), Year 12 students have the opportunity to present a *Viva Voce* on a study they have made. The students preparing such *Vivas* choose musical examples from a range of sources. For students coming from diverse cultural backgrounds, this is a significant topic.

**Method**

The method used for the *Teachers for a Fair Go* research began with submission of an application from the teacher and a brief interview providing information about the research. This was followed by intensive field observation guided by the Motivation and Engagement MeE Framework (Munns & Martin, 2005; Munns, Arthur, Downes, Gregson, Power, Sawyer, Singh, Thistleton-Martin & Steele, 2006). This framework particularly refers to learning experiences as high cognitive, high affective and high operative; and it refers to classrooms where students are sent engaging messages about knowledge, ability, control, place and voice. Researchers were in schools for a period of a week in which, having observed classes, they completed observation and reflection guides individually and collaboratively with the teacher. There was a long interview with the teacher and focus groups conducted with students. All of the students were given pseudonyms. Data were analysed using content analysis and checked by the teacher-researcher and research team. Across NSW, 11 senior high school studies were conducted and 11 in the middle years of schooling. This paper reports on one case study school, situated in Sydney’s South West with a population of 1,077 students, of whom 96% were from backgrounds with languages other than English (LOTE).
Case study school participants

‘Norma,’ the music teacher, described her school as calm, a striking quality in a high school of this size. As in any school, recess and lunch are noisy but when the bell goes for class, a quiet settles on the school. Norma believes this is mainly due to the expectation that, in all classes, quality teaching and learning occurs. The physical layout of the school also assists this sense of order and calm. The school has four separate two-storey blocks of classrooms, ensuring that there are usually about 280 students in each block. This layout minimises congestion and eases the flow of students from one class to the next.

The students come from several nationalities: Vietnamese, Chinese, Lao, Thai, Japanese, New Zealand Maori, Pacific Islanders and Anglo-Australians. There is a family ethic of commitment to learning. Students are aware of their parents’ long working hours to achieve the best for their families. In these times of financial downturn, the Year 12 music students (20 of them) all engage with private music lessons so that they can achieve to their highest potential. Most of them have casual jobs so they can pay the fees themselves.

The performance preparation

Norma instituted the music tuition program in this school. She was impressed by the innate musicality, interest and commitment that students displayed, such as was shown by her first group of Year 12 students who, with little musical tuition, had worked well on their chosen instruments. She believed that these students, even though socio-economically disadvantaged, were deserving of quality tuition by professional tutors. Norma sought highly-skilled professionals, told them they would be paid marginally less than they would elsewhere and asked them to give the school a trial. They did and all were ‘sold’ on working with these students. There are two guitar teachers each teaching two days, and a piano teacher, a violin teacher and a vocal teacher each teaching for one day. A cleared-out storeroom, with guitars hanging on the wall and keyboards around the sides of the room, became the studio for the private music teachers and the extra performing space, spilling over from the classroom. In the classroom, there are six keyboards at the back and a drum kit and piano. That leaves space for the Interactive White Board and the sound system. The classroom feels ‘de-cluttered’ and a welcoming space. Norma described her classroom as one which students love to attend. The students engage actively in lessons, working in pairs or small groups to deepen understanding either in discussion or performance.

A vocal student works on a transcription of theme music from the film 'Hero' by Tan Dun. She was supported by an ensemble including drums, keyboard and violin. In another space, a guitar student rehearses a traditional Maori song, Tarakihi, working on keeping the pace lively and charged with energy. In focus groups, all the students could identify what they had learned and valued. They had a sense of their own progress. The Year 12 students described the way that their vocal and instrumental performance learning had been helped by itinerant teachers coming to the school. Eve said: “Before that we had basic knowledge of what we had to do and stuff.” Angela also explained that: “If you don’t understand something you can
always ask the teacher at lunchtime because she’s always there willing to help us.” Pete added: “Everyone does music and everyone tries to help each other.” Sarah continued: “Someone knows this thing that’s really cool, like a bar chord, and you don’t know what it is and then you want to learn it.” Cassie noticed that this often resulted from the teacher’s suggestion: “Say there’s a person you don’t know well and she suggests you group with them to learn.” Tom from Year 12 added: “I don’t know about other classes but here I concentrate a lot.”

Asked if the students felt more capable now than at the start of the year, Dan replied: “Definitely.” When prompted to identify the things that gave them that feeling of being capable, Ben said: “When she asks questions, we start answering them. We understand it now.” When the students began to describe what the work was like, Dan commented: “It’s not typical boring stuff.” Cassie added: “It’s fun…yeah.” When asked if the work was also challenging, many students said that it was. Eve explained: “Challenging is the fun part as well.” The students all agreed that they looked forward to coming to class. Several students agreed that when the lesson completed, they did not want to leave. Eve said: “She encourages us to perform. She’ll put the spotlight on us and say ‘Come on, I want to hear you do it.’ She really, like, pushes you toward the light.” Angela said: “It’s the highlight of my day.”

The classroom has an atmosphere of security because Norma always prepares students for the next phase of the lesson, the next task to be completed for homework or the next assessment. She models organization for her students. Her classroom is a place of stimulation. She draws on the technology of the Interactive White Board to demonstrate video clips. She sends sound tracks to the students on their student email addresses. Her language is “we” not “I”. She demonstrates to students that she respects their ideas, listening to them carefully and always challenging them to deepen their knowledge. Her talk with them is peppered with “Now you’re extending that answer,” “Now I’m getting more information.” She says of her students that “they have an incredible desire to learn – they are committed and focused and driven. I think there’s a culture at home of placing education as a very high priority.”

**The Viva preparation**

In this school, the students had chosen studies that explored relationships of traditional and popular music. One student had developed a strong interest in cultural traditions that used the voice in unique ways. She was studying throat singing, where both melody and drone-like sounds are vocally made by changing the shape of the mouth. She made relationships to her own Islander culture where singing at funerals has a quality of high ‘wailing.’ She also related her study to other specialised uses of the voice such as the ‘tongue-talking’ or ‘mouth music’ that is practised by Australian Indigenous performers of the didjeridu. Finally, she included popular culture with an analysis of the vocal music of Bobby McFerrin whose imitations of instrumental sounds may well have their origins in some of the discoveries she had made.

Another student began her study with the music that accompanied traditional court dance in her culture from Thailand. This repertoire includes dance dramas based
on mythological stories. She explored dance styles where hand gestures have specific meanings and where the face is masked or elaborately painted. She extended her study by exploring the dance dramas that have been created by the Australian Indigenous company, Bangarra Dance Theatre, where the music drawn from popular sources, is largely created by the resident composer, Stephen Page.

It is only natural that students from families who have migrated to Australia should have an interest in their own music. It is ground breaking that students should be encouraged by a forward-thinking teacher to explore the relationships between several different kinds of traditional music and contemporary popular sources. The students engaged in these studies were following directions encouraged within the Syllabus and meeting the challenges of their chosen directions in learning. While the study of contemporary and traditional cultural music is in place through syllabus policy, the quality of teaching lifts the students’ encounter with cultural music to another level.

These examples demonstrate the way the NSW syllabus in Music 1 accommodates the background knowledge of students. The topic in the syllabus that investigates Music of a Culture suggests study of traditional and contemporary music. Moreover, the Quality Teaching Model that is a policy embraced by NSW DET schools (NSW Department of Education and Training, 2003) includes the elements of background knowledge and cultural knowledge. Quality Teaching is a model for pedagogy that can be used in classrooms from Kindergarten to Year 12 across all key learning areas (KLAs). It focuses teachers on reflection about their practice. Building on earlier research, the model identifies three key dimensions of pedagogy: that it promotes high levels of Intellectual Quality, a Quality Learning Environment and makes explicit to students the Significance of their work. Each of these dimensions subdivides into a number of elements. Both background knowledge and cultural knowledge are elements within the dimension of Significance.

**Students’ independent learning and improved HSC results in music**

Norma has been at the case study school for three years as Head Teacher. With senior classes, there is an emphasis on independent learning that leads to sharing within the class. It is co-constructed learning throughout this time. As the class progresses, Norma conducts a mock-Viva exam in the class, exposing students to the nature of the musical conversation that the Viva requires. Reflection, feedback and discussion occur within the class, with this approach proving to be highly successful in lifting the quality of HSC results. From 2000 until Norma’s arrival, there was no student awarded Band 6 in music. There were only two students who achieved Band 5. The majority of students were awarded Bands 4, 3 and 2. In the first year that Norma arrived at the school, the Year 12 class of 8 had one student receive Band 6, two Band 5s, four Band 4s and a Band 3 who was a student receiving learning support. For all of the students, music was their best result. Consequently, the class numbers in senior years have grown.
Themes from the focus group plus observations of classroom interactions between teacher and students together with the students’ perceptions of the teacher’s involvement suggest that there is a relationship between a highly effective classroom environment with engaging messages of support from the teacher with the self concept of ability held by students. Notable improvements in HSC results are external measures of achievement that signify students’ realisation of their self concept. Moreover, it is clear that the students absorb the teacher’s expressions of confidence in them. They also thrive on challenge and find it ‘fun’ when it is presented with imagination and humour. Over all these factors are the self regulatory ones where the students have a voice in the classroom. Their choices tend to be in Music of a Culture. There is no compromise on the intellectual demands made of these students. They can and do contribute to what and how they learn, extending their ideas in shared reflections with their teacher.

The NSW music students who engage with the topic Music of a Culture have the opportunity to explore a culture that may be beyond their experience or may be rooted in their experience. The students in the case study school demonstrated the richness of their learning. When these students embarked on self-directed learning through a study of their own choice, they were energised by it. Their discoveries, whether in contemporary or folk music, in idiomatic vocal sounds or in music for dance, led them to a respect for both traditional and popular styles. The students’ direction of their learning led them to a position where they became mini experts on their chosen field of research. They had become competent and empowered learners. Their engagement in learning was substantial and they viewed themselves, rightly, as both knowledgeable and as capable of gathering knowledge.

References


NSW Department of Education and Training & the University of Western Sydney, (2006). *School is For Me: Pathways to student engagement.* Sydney: Author.
David Salisbury: James Cook University

Title:

I Write the Songs: An appraisal of issues surrounding the composition unit of classroom music, years 10, 11 and 12, in terms of difficulty in delivery and assessment for teachers with limited background in composing.

Abstract

This paper, based on three case studies, looks at differences in teaching approach or delivery models and assessment strategies at a state high school, a private high school in Townsville and an international school in Hong Kong. Through first hand experience working with the students in the classroom and a series of interviews with teachers at each school, this study builds a profile that should have resonance with teachers in Australia, New Zealand and Hong Kong. Initial findings demonstrate that many teachers have difficulties with this stream of assessment due to a limited exposure of compositional methods and techniques in pre-service training. Much of the syllabus outline in Queensland for example, gives very generic descriptions of what is expected from the students, further complicating the teacher’s role in effectively delivering this component. The goal of this study is to forward suggestions and point to resources that may contribute in helping teachers cope with this assessment module.

Key Words: Composition, High School, Assessment, Syllabus, Teacher Training

Background

Beston points to studies in the United States, the United Kingdom and Australia that establish that a greater proportion of teachers have more experience and background in performance than in composition and often shied away or “neglected” to engage in composition in classrooms due to their own opinions and tastes (Beston, 2003 p. 17). This is in contrast to changes in the New South Wales secondary music curricula, at least in Beston’s study, that required students create a two-minute composition in one of their units of study (Ibid. p. 16).

Katherine Strand’s study in the United States surveyed teachers in Indiana and found that most teachers’ involved students in a composition task sometimes with a high percentage that rarely, very rarely or never used composition in the classroom and a very small percentage that often had students composing (Strand, 2006, p. 159). In her article she lists the reasons given for not teaching composition and the percentages of respondents:

The most common reason given was that there were too many other learning activities to include composition in the classroom (56.9%). The lack of access to technology was the second most common reason (28.2%), followed by "Not enough instruments" (26.5%) and "Composing is not an appropriate activity for the types of classes that I teach" (19.9%). Fewer
respondents cited "Not enough time" (9.1%), "I'm not comfortable teaching composing" (8.6%), "Composing is too noisy" (6.6%), "Composing is not a useful learning tool" (3.9%), and "I never thought about it" (3.3%) (Ibid. p. 160).

In addition she lists comments concerning other requirements as a priority, lack of time and equipment:

"Performance has to come first," and "There are too many other standards that must be addressed. I feel there is simply not enough time. Therefore, composing gets shoved to the very bottom of the list." Comments about limitations of time and resources included "Have tried Finale Notepad but so many problems requiring students to use home computers that it didn't work for everyone (Ibid. 161).

Of most interest to this paper is Beston’s survey results which looked at teacher training in three categories of how to compose, how to teach composition and ways in which to assess composition. In addition respondents were asked to specify if they had no composition experience, exposure in their pre-service training or an in-service module, post-graduate or some other experience outside of these main points of instruction. The response indicated that most of the teachers responding got their composition training in pre-service or in-service courses (Beston, 2003 p. 18). However when asked about training in teaching composition in-service and other were the highest percentages. Other was identified as contact with individual composers “through lectures, consultations, demonstrations, and in the performance of new compositions” (Ibid. 19-20). However when asked how they were trained in assessing composition “Other” was the highest percentage with 42%. “Other” included “personal experiences, High School Certificate marking, printed advice from the New South Wales Board of Studies, and discussion with colleagues” (Ibid. p. 20).

Beston also adds in her conclusion that most of the composition training they received was in Western Art music with little or no exposure to contemporary genres such as rock and jazz (Ibid. p. 21).

Aim

The aim of this study is to identify strategies that might help teachers to cope with the demands of teaching and mentoring students in a composition task. This paper presents a preliminary look at what composition experience is likely in a typical pre-service teacher training and if there is a lack in this area how that might be addressed in a curriculum refresh. Some suggestions will be forwarded as to methodologies in how to teach composition and a brief look at assessment schemes will be presented.

Method

This paper looks at three case studies, two in Townsville and one in Hong Kong. There are survey responses from teachers in the two of the case study schools as
well as two other Townsville secondary schools, one private and the other a state high school. Due to a limited response from the survey this will only represent a preliminary study until more responses are generated.

Survey Instrument

The survey questions focused on the teachers’ background in composition; whether they received training in the rudiments of composing during their teacher training course; if they were introduced to contemporary forms of music composition such as rock and jazz; what methods they used in teaching a student to compose; what types of music technology they might employ to aid in teaching composition; if they experienced specific issues or problems in teaching composition and what resources they used to support the delivery of a composition lesson.

Data Collection procedure

The case studies were based on in-service lessons the researcher delivered to the three high schools and my observations of students’ participation and comprehension during each lesson. The surveys were initially emailed to schools in the area and the Hong Kong school but after an insufficient response were hand delivered to teachers individually.

Data Analysis

Survey:

The survey had seven questions relating to the areas mentioned above. The responses to the teacher’s background in composition showed that 3 out of 5 of the respondents got some exposure during their university music degree studies with one teacher stating they got some experience in their teaching qualification and one claiming they received no training but developed their competency in teaching composition through years of experience. One teacher emphatically replied that they received no training in composition during their teaching qualification course. One of the respondents had three degrees in composition.

In response to the more specific question of composition training in their teaching training course only one teacher responded that they had any significant compositional training their course. The rest either got a smattering through a music history subject or theory subject or none at all. When asked about the inclusion of contemporary music in the teacher training they attended, all but one had no exposure to contemporary forms of music with one respondent misinterpreting the question to mean 20th century classical forms.

Question number four asked the teachers what methods they employed to teach composition with all of them demonstrating good teaching approaches through step-by-step delivery that included listening, modelling and theory to support the students in successfully completing the task with one teacher accessing music technology to support the students in realising their compositions.
Responding to the question of using music technology in their classrooms four out of five specifically stated that they used Sibelius and only one non-specific response of using sequencing and notation programs.

When asked to describe some of the issues they face during a composition lesson in their classrooms one teacher proclaimed the benefits of Kodaly training but also accessed technology using Sibelius. One discussed the problem of students with varying degrees of musical background and ability in the same classroom. One simply loved it but acknowledge the degree of patience required. Another respondent referred to the difference between the “rock musicians” and the “AMEB musicians” with rock musicians preferring to create chord progressions and the AMEB musicians following AMEB rules and theory. Finally the teacher who had no formal teacher training but held three composition degrees stated that:

“Teaching time is too short. More students are interested in performing than composing in general. Composing does require a little bit more knowledge of music rudiments that may sound either boring or scary to some students”.

**Case Study: State High School in Townsville**

The state high school in Townsville had the most variance in their degrees of musical background and ability. This school had virtually no technology other than a basic notation program on the library computers with no specialised workstations in the music rooms. During a composition lesson the students were very hesitant to contribute and demonstrated a lack of confidence in their abilities to compose music effectively. Many of the questions that were raised were of a basic musicality nature and lacked a depth of knowledge about composing. The lesson was focused on motive development which the students had little experience with and were unsure how to apply in their own composition which for the most part were more based on contemporary music forms with a focus on chord progressions.

**Case Study: Private High School in Townsville**

The other Townsville School is a private high school that has fantastic resources including specialised workstations in the music rooms with a variety of music technology programs installed. In addition this school had a well developed and attended instrumental program along side a well-integrated classroom program. In a composition lesson the students were very confident in their ability to compose and raised questions that were more focused on compositional issues and problems. The students had access to music technology with computer workstations in the music room and were equally versed in classical and contemporary music styles.

**Case Study: Private High School in Hong Kong**

The Hong Kong school, a private and well-funded school, also had a support of workstations with music technology programs as well. In the Hong Kong school I
was able to work with years 10, 11 and 12 and in the year ten group gave a lecture on song writing that focussed in particular on the challenges of writing lyrics. In the year eleven class the students composed pieces based on indeterminacy concepts working in groups, creating graphic scores and then performing them in class. With the year 12 students I worked with them on compositions they were already involved with, mostly classical, and gave lectures on jazz composition and song writing also.

As was the case with the private school in Townsville, during the composition lesson the students were very confident in their ability to compose and raised questions that were more focused on compositional issues and problems. The students had access to music technology with computer workstations in the music room and were equally versed in classical and contemporary music styles.

Results

So in this very limited comparison the private well-funded schools provided students with more support, making the task of teaching composition more manageable and less problematic. The state high school with limited resources and a more working class demographic had more difficulties in the delivery of composition lessons and students achieving good results.

As for the survey it points to the substantiation that some teacher training courses give pre-service teachers an adequate grounding in composition but many do not. If the teacher did not receive compositional training during their music degree then the likelihood is they will have difficulties in a composition lesson and task. In the area of training in teaching composition there were no responses to indicate that this was part of their course work and the same would be true with experience in assessing composition tasks and assignments.

Discussion

Learning Composition:

As mentioned earlier in the survey responses some of the teachers had little or no experience in composition but then developed strategies and utilized resources to aid them in managing composition lessons and assignments. One of the teachers’ lent me a resource they spoke highly of titled “Music Composition Toolbox” written by Matthew Hindson, Damian Barbeler and Diana Blom all recognised Australian composers. The toolbox is a very thorough and well developed resource to aid classroom teacher in delivering composition units especially in the New South Wales HSC syllabus. The book comes complete with an accompanying CD of examples and is well laid out. One of the other resources mentioned was “The Complete Idiot’s Guide to Composition” by Michael Miller also a well developed book for teachers to access.
Teaching Composition

One approach to teaching composition is by utilizing a method called “Guided Composition” which for the purposes of this discussion, is composing music with as many prescribed parameters as the young composer needs. The ultimate goal is to guide the composer toward the successful notation of his or her composition. To accomplish this, the teacher needs to build into the composition experience as many "controls" as necessary to ensure a successful notation experience (Brophy, 1996).

These controls can include rhythm, length (and repetitions), and scale and clef used. The melody of the composition should never be prescribed; this is the sole creation of the young composer. However, the last note of the composition may be specified if necessary to ensure that each composer ends his or her piece on the tonic pitch. Internal phrase endings may also have specified ending pitches if so desired (Brophy, 1996). Brophy states:

Before the composition experience, (1) determine a rhythm and meter signature commensurate with the students' level of understanding; (2) prescribe the scale or group of notes that are to be used in the composition (pentatonic is good for beginners); (3) determine the number of phrases in the composition and whether or not there will be any repeats; and (4) decide which clef you will use (Brophy, 1996, p 16).

Assessing Composition

Harris and Hawksley's (1989) criteria for assessing music composition include:

- The establishment and maintenance of style;
- Development of material;
- Effective use of different instruments/sound source(s);
- Control of rhythmic, tonal, melodic and harmonic aspects through contrast and/or coherence;
- Control of texture density, spacing through contrast and/or coherence;
- Clear performance directions;
- Resourcefulness and originality; effectiveness and fluency of the composition as a whole;
- Powers of self-criticism; and
- Ability to explain/describe.

Another useful resource is the rubric developed by Hickey (1999) that demonstrates three main criteria for assessing a composition assignment.

Below Needs to be marked as a figure:
## A Rubric for Assessing a Composition by Maud Hickey

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Needs</th>
<th>Work,</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Aesthetic Appeal</strong></td>
<td>Does not present an effective general impression. Musical ideas do not hold the listener's interest</td>
<td>Includes at least one interesting musical idea. Yet, the overall impression is not effective.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Creativity</strong></td>
<td>Musical idea is origi-familiar or a cliche. No variety or exploration of musical elements (range, timbre dynamics, tempo, rhythm, melody).</td>
<td>Musical idea is neither familiar nor a cliche. However there is no development, variety, or exploration of musical elements</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Craftsmanship</strong></td>
<td>Gives no sense of a completed musical idea. Exhibits no clear beginning middle, or end section. Form appears random rather than organized. Musical elements (range, dynamics, timbre, tempo, texture, rhythm, melody) do not connect well or are not used to organize musical ideas or the form.</td>
<td>Presents one complete musical idea. However, composition lacks overall completeness. Fails to use musical elements to organize musical ideas or form.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Conclusion

In this paper we have looked at some of the issues teachers’ face when involved with the composition process, teaching composition and assessing a composition task or assignment. For the most part there is a greater majority of teachers who have a limited background in composition. This is in contrast to the fact that syllabi like that of New South Wales uses composition as a major stream of music assessment. It has been shown that even if teachers have had compositional experience they may not have the tools to teach composition and that there are problems they face when assessing a student’s composition. This paper has presented some suggestions to each of these areas of concern but by no means has exhausted the possibilities available to teachers who are in need of support. It is hoped that more research into this area will help shed light on this subject and area of concern to teachers in the classrooms of today.

References


Retention in instrumental programs in lower secondary school: the student perspective.

Abstract

The National Review of School Music (2005) listed retention in elective instrumental music programs as a key area to be addressed. For example, around 10,000 students commence learning an instrument each year in Western Australia, but only around 3% annually complete the examinable post compulsory music course which contains a large instrumental component. Research from other subject areas suggests that the largest drop-out from any elective program occurs in the first year of secondary school.

This paper reports on a study into the impact of the instrument lesson upon the motivation of Year 8 students to continue their elective instrument studies beyond the first year in secondary school. The study examined the values and competence beliefs of 48 instrumental students across seven secondary schools in Perth. It was based upon the belief that students have a well developed understanding of their motivation for being involved in an instrumental music program, and strong beliefs about learning an instrument.

The study found that while Year 8 student values for playing an instrument appeared relatively stable, competence beliefs were fragile. Students in their first year of secondary school were effectively 'in transition'. Playing an instrument was generally described as fun and personally important, but most students indicated a need for a high level of encouragement from their instrument teacher. The study concludes that interpersonal relationship and attendant instructional practices in the instrument lesson are unique, and there are strong pedagogical implications for teaching students of this age.

Introduction

The National Review of School Music (2005) identified retention in elective instrumental music programs as an area requiring attention. In Western Australia, despite high levels of instrumental service provision across all sectors, only 3% of the total state cohort annually completes the examinable post-compulsory music course which has a large instrumental performance component (Curriculum Council, 2008). This paper examines whether the low participation rates evidenced in post compulsory music are the result of issues which stem from the early years of secondary school. Research in other subject areas indicates a large drop-out from elective programs occurs following the transition into secondary school.
Specifically, this paper reports on a study into the values and competence beliefs of 48 Year 8 students learning instruments in their first year of secondary school in Western Australia. Given that the instrument lesson is the central point of interaction in an instrument program, the study also examined how student values and beliefs for playing are shaped by the instrument lesson (StGeorge, 2004).

**Setting the scene – Learning a musical instrument at school in Western Australia**

In Western Australia, instrument lessons within the government sector are coordinated by the School of Instrumental Music (SIM), a division of the Department of Education. SIM is a large centralised delivery service which employs over 130 qualified instrumental teachers. SIM provides free 30 minute group lessons (up to five students per group) once per week by specialist teachers, and students are selected to participate in the instrumental program via a standardised music aptitude test. String players commence lessons from Year 3, while wind, brass, percussion and guitar students commence lessons in Year 6. Therefore, students within the SIM system have generally been learning for a minimum of two years when they enter secondary school (Year 8). Participation in the SIM program is elective – while students are encouraged to remain in the program throughout their entire school journey, participation is essentially voluntary.

In the private and Catholic systems, lessons tend to be delivered on a one-on-one basis or small group basis by instrumental tutors who often lack formal teaching qualifications. In these systems, students usually pay for their lessons, and participation is not subject to compulsory music aptitude testing, although some schools do undertake testing. Learning an instrument is also elective in these systems.

**Retention in Western Australia**

While only 3% of the total state cohort elect to undertake examinable post-compulsory music each year, further analysis of SIM’s retention figures reveal:

- Only 23% of Year 8 students remain in the SIM program by Year 12, indicating that three out of four students have dropped out of the program, while
- Only 18% of Year 6 students remain in the SIM program by Year 12, indicating that four out of five have dropped out of the program.
While representative of only one sector, SIM's figures confirm a large drop-out rate from Year 8 – 12 within the government program, and that the large drop-out commences from Year 8, the first year of secondary school (SIM, 2010).

First Year, secondary school

Little research has been undertaken in music education as to the impact of the transition from primary to secondary school on the motivation of students to continue learning an instrument. However, research from other subject areas suggests that enrolments in elective programs can decline by as much as 25% per year from the first year of secondary school (Wigfield & Wagner, 2005; Harter, 1990; Eccles & Midgeley, 1989; Bandura, 1994). Reasons cited for declining participation rates include:

- Disrupted social networks upon entry to secondary school,
- Less personal school environments in secondary school,
- The greater use of ability streaming / competitive practices in secondary school, and
- Inappropriate instructional practices for emerging adolescent needs.

The upheaval caused by the transition to secondary school, combined with the emotional uncertainty of adolescence can result in avoidance behaviours, as students seek to disengage from elective areas of schooling which do not meet their emotional needs. Therefore, the drop-out rate from instrumental programs in Western Australia may reflect issues associated with the transition into secondary school, including the instrument lesson itself and teachers’ attendant instructional practices. While acknowledging other factors such as peer pressure, students changing to lessons with private tutors and pressures relating to classroom subject selection, this study chose to focus upon the impact of the lesson itself, as the factors above tend to come into play in the later school years (Lowe 2008).

Research considerations

This project asked the following research question: What are Year 8 student beliefs about playing an instrument, and how does the instrument lesson impact those beliefs?

The study was guided by the need to construct an understanding of the motives of Year 8 students for learning an instrument. Given the quasi-phenomenological nature of the research, it was important to engage with the student voice, to speak
Expectancy-value theory was employed as the theoretical foundation for the study. Expectancy-value theory was developed by Eccles (1983) specifically to explain adolescent motivation for mathematics, and has since been widely used in other subject areas, including instrumental music (Wigfield & Wagner, 2005; De Backer & Nelson, 1999; Wigfield, O’Neill & Eccles, 1999; O’Neill, 1996). Importantly in the context of this study, the values components of the theory have been found to be an accurate predictor of student future enrolment decisions (Eccles, 2005).

Within this theory and research context, values may be paraphrased as ‘why should I engage with this musical activity’, while competence may be paraphrased as ‘what do I think about my abilities to succeed in this musical activity’. The values construct is further differentiated into three components: importance value, intrinsic value and extrinsic value. Importance value is closely linked with notions of identity, including the relevance and challenge of activities to the individual, while intrinsic value relates to the inherent enjoyment gained from undertaking activities and extrinsic value relates to how well activities conform to current and future goals. The values components are mediated by the cost of involvement, including the amount of time and effort required for engagement.

Method

For this study, seven focus groups were convened from seven different secondary schools. The schools represented a mixture of government, catholic and private schools, selected via a random stratified process from across the Perth metropolitan area. A total of 48 Year 8 students took part in the focus groups. All focus group members played an instrument, and learned their instrument through the school instrument program. Each group contained roughly equal numbers of boys and girls. Focus group interviews were conducted by the researcher and lasted approximately one hour each. Data was recorded and professionally transcribed, and was initially grouped under three headings:

- Motivation for playing an instrument
- Positive influence of the instrument lesson
- Negative influence of the instrument lesson

From there, data was compared against the expectancy-value constructs. While acknowledging the unique nature of the research setting and the value of including
Main findings

Motivation for learning an instrument
Eighteen different reasons for learning an instrument were coded. Of these, the majority revolved around importance and enjoyment values. The majority of students described playing an instrument as fun, challenging, important for stress relief, and a valuable tool for self-expression. While some students described extrinsic reasons such as the joy of taking music exams or getting out of class, it became clear that, for the students in this study, playing an instrument was becoming important for their developing notions of self, and was fun and enjoyable. Further, students were able to articulate the reasons why they played an instrument. In this sense, the values associated with playing appeared to be relatively stable.

Positive impact of the instrument lesson
Based upon student responses, five emergent themes were coded relating to the positive aspects of the instrument lesson. These included:

- The provision of a supportive and non-threatening learning environment
- Rapport with and respect from the instrument teacher
- Professional teacher attributes i.e. encouragement and patience to build student competence beliefs
- Professional musician attributes relating to the instrument teacher's playing ability
- The instrument teacher's learning activity selection, relating to repertoire choice and ensemble playing

Of the above, over half the students spoke of the difference between the instrument lesson and regular school classes. The instrument lesson was described as being an intimate environment which allowed a close personal relationship with the teacher. Students enjoyed the unique level of intimacy afforded by the small class size, especially when the instrument teacher was enthusiastic and encouraging. The instrument teacher was described as a powerful figure in the relationship.

Encouragement was described by three-quarters of participants as being the key teaching component of the supportive learning environment. All students described the need to feel competent, and indicated the central role of the instrument teacher in providing positive feedback. In addition, virtually all students indicated a strong desire not to be singled out in lessons. Students drew inspiration from hearing their
instrument teachers demonstrate on their instruments, and indicated the value of teacher modelling in terms of learning how a piece should be played, how the instrument should sound, as a practical application of verbal instructions and for time management. Finally, students spoke positively of a regular turnover of repertoire, and of the enjoyment of small ensemble playing in lessons.

**Negative impact of the instrument lesson**

Based upon student responses, four emergent themes were coded relating to the negative aspects of the instrumental lesson. These were:

- A dislike of technical work,
- Comparative teaching practices in group lessons leading to perceptions of loss of prestige and feelings of incompetence,
- Repetition of teaching strategies and lack of repertoire turnover, and
- Lack of encouragement and rapport between the instrument teacher and students.

The dislike of technical work was perhaps not unexpected, but students spoke particularly of a dislocation between technical work and repertoire. They universally described a failure to see the point of technical work, namely scales, particularly when asked to play the same ones every week. That Year 8 students were particularly aware of their social standing within the group as well of their musical standing became evident in an almost universal fear of being embarrassed or made to feel musically incompetent in front of others in group lessons. Students were quick to affirm teaching pedagogies such as small ensemble learning to cater for a variety of differing playing standards. These student-suggested pedagogies were aimed at reducing the potential for perceived ability comparisons between students, and reducing the potential for competition in group lessons.

Repetition was described in terms of lack of variety in teaching practices, as well as lack of repertoire turnover. More importantly, three quarters of student participants described potential problems associated with a lack of rapport with their instrument teachers. Lack of rapport included a general lack of enthusiasm, lack of a personal interest in students, and most importantly, a lack of encouragement of student efforts by teachers. Lack of encouragement was described as a major contributor to students dropping out, under the guise of ‘boredom’. In this study, students appeared to use ‘boredom’ as an umbrella term which included:

- Lack of stimulation resulting from repetitive teaching practices
- A desire to protect musical-efficacy (belief in one’s abilities to succeed in specific tasks)
Students cited the role of encouragement in building musical efficacy. When encouragement was lacking, students felt unsure of their abilities and often exhibited avoidance behaviours such as non attendance at lessons, rather than confront perceived feelings of failure.

Discussion

When viewed through the expectancy-value lens, student values for playing appeared relatively stable. Students described a strong enjoyment of playing, and while they described the specific motivational impact of repertoire and ensemble playing, for the most part, they appeared to play an instrument for the enjoyment of playing. Further, playing was becoming important to notions of self, such as mood management and self expression. Strong values for playing, as indicated in this study, should be indicative of strong motivation to continue learning an instrument beyond Year 8.

However, competence beliefs appeared much less stable and were very dependent upon external reinforcement from the instrument teacher. The emotional insecurity of adolescence may partly explain the need for high levels of instrument teacher reassurance. Given that playing an instrument is a highly skills based activity, students may require constant encouragement to confirm that they are ‘on the right track’. A lack of positive reinforcement undermines feelings of competence, and thus expectancies that they will improve, by not confirming that they are ‘on the right track’, leading to a reduction in effort. Further, Wigfield (1994) reported an empirical link between competence and importance value; students are less likely to value as important activities they do not feel competent in. Therefore competence beliefs can impact the values associated with playing.

The fragility of Year 8 student competence beliefs are exacerbated in group lessons by a constant fear of appearing incompetent in front of others. Students were well aware of difference in playing standards within their groups, and noted that these were emphasized in competitive and comparative teaching situations. The dangers of competition are well known – students often attribute differences in standard to ability and not effort (Weiner, 1974; Asmus, 1994; Eccles & Wigfield, 2002). While effort is controllable, ability is seen as a fixed attribute. Therefore, students who feel less competent than others can attribute the difference to lack of ability resulting in avoidance behaviours such as skipping lessons, to avoid confronting feelings of incompetence. Further, competence beliefs affect not just musical efficacy but prestige. The desire to protect social standing within the group by not appearing incompetent may be the result of students being placed in new and unfamiliar groups in Year 8.
The impact of dislocation and the emotional challenges of adolescence may contribute to the fragile competence beliefs and the fear of failure detected among participants in this study. The desire of Year 8 students for a non-threatening learning environment may be a reaction to the competitive practices of secondary school in general, while their desire for rapport with the instrument teacher may be reflective of a desire for close and personal reassurance from an adult in an increasingly impersonal school environment. Fear of embarrassment in the group setting may be reflective of the need to rebuild disrupted social networks.

Conclusion

The key finding of this study is that given the primacy participating students attached to the need to feel competent, competence beliefs may be just as important as values in determining lower secondary students’ decisions to continue learning an instrument, at least in school based instrumental programs. Perceptions of levels of support from the instrument teacher in the context of the instrument lesson appear to be highly influential in student decisions to continue learning. Further, because students view their instrument teacher as professional musicians, they view their instrument teacher as the most appropriate person to emulate and provide meaningful encouragement. This finding represents a departure from previously reported expectancy-value finding that values are the best predictor of future enrolment decisions, and help to emphasise the uniqueness of the instrument lesson as a learning environment. Accordingly, it would be valuable to undertake further studies involving expectancy-value theory within instrumental lessons, to examine the role of competence in later years as a key motivational determinant.

The findings of this study have clear pedagogical implications for instrumental music teachers. The first year of secondary school is a time of emotional uncertainty and upheaval. Instrumental students desire a personalised, supportive learning environment where they are not singled out and are encouraged that they ‘are on the right track’. Seen by students as the most appropriate person to provide meaningful feedback and positive encouragement, the instrument teacher is in a unique position to take affirmative action to reduce the drop-out rate from elective instrument programs in Western Australia, at least among Year 8 students. By consciously seeking to provide a supportive and encouraging learning environment, more Year 8 students may be encouraged to continue playing their instruments throughout their time in secondary school and beyond.
References


School of Instrumental Music. (2010) – Retention Statistics. School of Instrumental Music, Maylands: June staff newsletter (internal publication)


Students voting with their feet: The values students attach to class music learning activities in lower secondary school

Abstract

Retaining students in elective class music programs is an issue in Western Australia, particularly in lower secondary school. While class music can enjoy relatively high enrolments in the first year of secondary school (Year 8 in WA), numbers decline sharply into the second year and continue to decline into the post compulsory years. This paper investigates the role of class music learning activities in shaping student motivation towards class music, because values have been found to be accurate predictors of students’ future enrolment decisions. Specifically, this paper reports on a study into the values and beliefs of 222 Year 8 students in their first year in secondary school in WA towards class music learning activities. The initial study indicated a statistically significant decline in 10 out of 12 values measures across the course of Year 8. Follow-up focus group interviews with 56 students from the same schools then explored reasons student attribute for the declines. Based upon focus group responses, the paper concludes by presenting a brief overview of the types of activities which enhance students valuing of class music, and those which contribute towards a decline in students’ values.

Introduction

Retaining students in elective class music programs beyond the first year of secondary school (Year 8 in Western Australia) is an ongoing issue for Western Australian music educators. This paper reports upon the values Year 8 music students attach to their class music activities, because values have been demonstrated to accurately predict future student enrolment decisions (Eccles, 2005; Wigfield & Wagner, 2005). Specifically, the study examined the values of 222 Year 8 music students from eight secondary schools across the Perth metropolitan area. By using task values as the basis for the study, it was hoped to gain some understanding of the impact of class music learning activities upon Year 8 music student’s motivation to continue, and uncover learning activity design principles which may enhance student motivation for class music. Finally, this paper concludes by offering recommendations for teaching practice based upon the findings of the study.

Background – setting the scene

Class music is generally offered as an elective subject in secondary schools in Western Australia. Some secondary schools offer compulsory general music in Year 8, but often only on a term or semester basis as part of an ‘arts’ taster program. Relatively healthy numbers of students enrol into class music in the first year of secondary school (Lowe, 2008). However, classes can often comprise
mixed ability groups of instrumentalists and non instrumentalists. Therefore, classes can include students with a degree of proficiency on a musical instrument and who can read music, and students with no music instrument experiences and no music reading skills. Some schools separate Year 8 classes into ability streams; thus the instrumental students are ‘quarantined’ into ‘specialist’ music classes, and the rest into ‘general’ music classes. Students enter secondary school with a range of previous musical experiences from primary school. While some students have no previous school music experiences, others come from primary schools with strong music programs. As a result, teaching and motivating students in Year 8 class music can present a considerable challenge to music educators.

Problem Statement

While the numbers of students undertaking class music in Year 8 can be encouraging, the numbers of students electing to continue class music into Year 9 can decline by as much as 50% (Lowe, 2008). Ultimately, only 3% of the state cohort in Western Australia complete post compulsory examinable class music (Curriculum Council, 2008). Therefore, this paper considers whether the low numbers of students electing to continue class music beyond Year 8 are symptomatic of issues associated with student valuing of Year 8 class music learning activities, given the diverse musical backgrounds and experiences of many Year 8 students.

The research context - student values

The construct of values as defined by expectancy-value theory was selected as the theoretical foundation for this study. Eccles (2005) defines values as ‘Why should I undertake this task?’, and differentiates them into attainment (importance), intrinsic (interest) and extrinsic (usefulness) components. Attainment value is defined as the personal importance of doing well, including the challenge and relevance of the topic to the individual. Tasks have a higher attainment value if they conform to student beliefs about the subject. Intrinsic value is defined as the inherent enjoyment the individual gets from undertaking the task, and their subjective interest in the task. Finally, Eccles (2005) defines extrinsic values as how well the task conforms to current and future goals.

Values are shaped through engagement and interaction with learning activities (Eccles & Wigfield, 2002). Accordingly, this study set out to measure student valuing of class music learning activities over the course of Year 8 as a foundation for exploration of class music learning activity design principles which enhance or decrease student task values.

Method

The project examined the values of 222 Year 8 students drawn from eight secondary schools across the Perth metropolitan area. Schools were selected through a stratified random selection process (based upon school districts). Student values were measured at the start of the academic year (pre-test) and at the end of the academic year (post-test) via a researcher designed questionnaire.
instrument. Four questions per values component (12 values questions in total) were included on the questionnaire, and for the purposes of this paper, results have been combined to create one values measure per values component. Data was then subjected to two-tailed paired sample t-tests, allowing the researcher to examine whether there had been any statistically significant differences in value component ratings from pre to post test.

The questionnaire was followed by focus group interviews comprising six – eight students in each of the eight research schools (56 students in total). The aim of the interviews was to examine aspects of class music learning activities which may or may not have contributed to changes in the values ratings, and establish learning activity design principles which enhance and decrease motivation for class music. Interviews were semi-structured to allow for a degree of student directed discussion, and focus group questions were based upon expectancy-value theory constructs.

Interview data was manipulated and coded using Nvivo8 qualitative software, and was first categorised under activities which students identified as enjoyable and activities which were not enjoyable. From there, general design principles were extracted, and are reported in the discussion section of this paper.

Results

Student valuing of class music learning activities were measured at the start and end of Year 8, and results including mean and significant differences are presented in table 1.

Table 1: student valuing of class music learning activities across Year 8

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Values components</th>
<th>N = 222</th>
<th>Pre-test</th>
<th>Post-test</th>
<th>Mean diff.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>SD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attainment</td>
<td>3.85</td>
<td>.76</td>
<td>3.56</td>
<td>.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intrinsic</td>
<td>3.80</td>
<td>.80</td>
<td>3.38</td>
<td>.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extrinsic</td>
<td>3.70</td>
<td>.86</td>
<td>3.42</td>
<td>.95</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1 indicated a statistically significant decline in two out of three values components from pre to post-test. Of these, intrinsic value showed the strongest decline over the course of the year, indicating that while student valuing of activities declined overall, their intrinsic enjoyment of the activities declined the most. While not present in this table, two of the four extrinsic values items also indicated a statistically significant decline, but not enough to effect the overall result for extrinsic value. Based on the results of the survey, student valuing of class music learning activities, especially their enjoyment, appeared to decline significantly over the course of Year 8.
From the focus group interview data, three activities emerged which students described as enhancing their values towards class music.

**Performing**
Performing emerged as the most valued learning activity. In short, students described performing as fun and enjoyable. Performing in front of others was seen as a confidence building activity (a life skill), and performing was described as an authentic form of music learning i.e. ‘doing’ music. In addition, students described group based performing as relating to their experiential world, where they identified with the performance model of the ‘rock and pop band’.

**Composing**
Composing also emerged as a valued learning activity. In particular, students described the value of creating music in an experimental and co-operative setting, leading to group performances. Composing was described as a valuable form of self-expression, although the problem of lack of skills development for realising ideas was raised.

**Group activities**
Students also described a valuing of ‘relevant’ project work and musical games. Students defined ‘relevant’ again in terms of the music of their experiential world. It also became evident during focus groups that the emphasis on communal activities at this age placed less emphasis on ‘self’ at the fragile emotional time of adolescence. Students almost universally indicated a desire not to be singled out in learning activities.

Given the declines in values reported in table 1, it was evident that students were not being engaged regularly enough in values enhancing learning activities. From the focus group interview data, three activities emerged which students described as decreasing their valuing of class music.

**Music theory and notation related activities**
Students across all focus groups listed music theory and notation related activities as their least valued activities. The main reasons expressed by students related to: lack of practical application of theoretical knowledge, lack of comprehensibility, relevance to learning in their understanding of how music is created in their experiential world, and repetition (the same types of activities over and over).

**Aural activities**
Students described an aversion to de-contextualised aural training, namely rhythmic and melodic dictations, especially when they were singled out to respond.

**Solo performances**
Students did not value performance activities which emphasised the individual. They commonly described feelings relating to lack of competence and confidence, particularly in the solo instrumental performance setting, and many described typical symptoms of performance anxiety.
Discussion

When focus group interview data was further analysed, three overarching design principles which enhanced student valuing of class music activities emerged. They revolved around notions of relevance & familiarity, achievability and transferability.

In terms of relevance and familiarity, any learning activity content and strategies involving popular music and the use of computers and technology were described in positive value related terms. The enhancing principle of achievability was described in terms of activities in which students felt optimally challenged to succeed. This included the use of music software in the creation of music to overcome their lack of physical performing skills. In addition, learning activities were described as useful when students perceived a direct application to the ‘doing’ of music, particularly transferability to learning an instrument. Transferability was enhanced when repertoire was seen as relevant. Thus transferability became apparent when class music learning activities conformed with student perceptions of music from their experiential realm.

Conversely, four design principles which decreased student valuing of class music activities also emerged. They related to repetition, incomprehensibility, lack of relevance & familiarity, and lack of achievability.

In terms of repetition, students described little variation in the way some activities were presented, leading to monotony and boredom, while incomprehensibility was described in terms of understanding de-contextualised aural and theoretical activities, particularly where there was no immediate and obvious practical application. Further, students described learning activities and learning strategies not based upon their experiences of music as being irrelevant; and in terms of lack of achievability, students described many learning activities as either too challenging, or not challenging enough. Issues associated with challenge included the need to understand, and the need to have the skills to put understanding into practice. Lack of achievability directly stemmed from the diverse primary school music experiences of many Year 8 music students.

While valuable in understanding overarching design principles from the student perspective, it is more important to consider the direct pedagogical implications of these principles for music educators. Accordingly, this paper now presents five recommendations for teaching practice.

Recommendations for teaching practice

Performing and composition – That music teachers understand the motivational appeal of group performing and composing to Year 8 students.

Students in this study described music as a dynamic subject associated with ‘doing music’. It is recommended that teachers acknowledge the value of performing and composing in terms of confidence building of musical and general life skills, self expression and sheer enjoyment. Focus groups described performing and composing activities as ‘just good fun’. In addition, performance and practical
based composition represent an alternative form of learning closely associated with ‘knowing in’ music (Swanwick, 1996), and the development of musical intelligence (Gardner, 1983).

It is recommended that teachers acknowledge the value of both solo and group composing and performing, with group activities building social skills both for music and in general, and building self-esteem. In addition, group based activities can be used to overcome physical skills limitations. Further, group composing by experimenting (trial and error) and performing equates with student perceptions of music making in their world.

While acknowledging the value of composing and performing, teachers may need to reconsider the role of musical skills acquisition, and design learning activities which build physical skills on selected instruments as a prelude to meaningful composing and performing in the classroom.

Link to instrumental teaching – That teachers understand that students see class music as supporting playing an instrument, and not the other way around.

In line with student beliefs regarding music as a practical subject, students in this study described playing an instrument as the main rationale for studying music. Therefore, it is recommended that learning activities reflect a higher degree of relevance and transferability to instrumental performance.

Music educators should consider the greater use of students’ musical instruments in classroom learning activities, aside from formal concert practice contexts. This may help combat issues surrounding relevance and de-contextualisation in that theoretical activities can be directly applied to instrumental performance. In addition, the greater incorporation of instruments could aid the transferability of musical concepts back to the instrumental lesson, and beyond, to performance in the wider setting while helping build technical competence and student confidence on their instruments.

Practical application – That music theory and related activities lead to or derive from practical applications

Students described many theoretical activities as being incomprehensible because they did not understand the practical context in which the activities operated. To avoid issues surrounding comprehensibility, teachers should consider the value of integrating theoretical activities into a practical setting. Further it is recommended that teachers reconsider the order in which theoretical activities and practical applications are delivered. Focus groups described the value in experimenting with ideas. In this sense, it could be appropriate to have student identify a theoretical concept through performance, and theorise later. This method is also closer to the way musical meaning is developed in the contemporary music world, as popular musicians experiment with ideas and formalise them later. Thus, understanding musical concepts derives from aural exploration, not written theorising.
While again acknowledging the limiting factor of student practical and performing skills, the value of computers as a motivational tool needs to be considered.

Content relevance – That music teachers understand the need to relate the relevance of learning activities to the student’s experiential realm

With overarching implications for the above recommendations, students described the need for content and learning strategies to reflect their experiential world, in terms of relevance, usefulness and transferability. With regards content, students live in a contemporary music world and many class music programs in this study were based upon the Western classical canon. Students struggled to see the transferability of knowledge from one area to the other in three ways:

- from classical repertoire to their experiential contemporary music world;
- from theoretically driven learning activities to their understanding of musical process in their contemporary musical world; and
- from theoretically driven learning activities to their instruments.

Music beyond the student experiential realm has little relevance to them, and therefore little value. In the instances when learning activities did incorporate contemporary music and contemporary music practices, focus group responses were uniformly more positive.

It is beyond the boundaries of this paper to examine the philosophical, educational and pedagogical issues surrounding repertoire choice and practice in music education. However, in the context of this study, issues surrounding the Western canon and notation based theory were found to have a de-motivating impact upon students in terms of relevance, usefulness and transferability.

Accommodate ability divide – that music teachers acknowledge the diverse range of past musical experiences of Year 8 students, and plan accordingly.

Focus groups described a variety of different or non-existent musical experiences at primary school. Their experiences of class music in Year 8 often resulted in a culture shock, as they were confronted with an unfamiliar, formal, theoretical study of music.

In addition, widely divergent primary school experiences resulted in widely differing levels of ability. Classes comprised students with little or no formal musical experience through to students with many years of formal musical tuition. The divide also manifested itself in classes containing fluent music readers and non readers, resulting in a major ability divide in all settings.

This study found that the ability divide effected student perceptions of the degree of challenge associated with activities. In general, less experienced and non reading students found formal learning activities too challenging, while more experienced and fluent readers described little challenge. Both impacted upon mastery orientation behaviours.
It is recommended that teachers acknowledge the divide and plan learning activities accordingly. Teachers need to investigate methods and strategies which can accommodate a range of ability levels in the same setting, such as the use of group learning activities which accommodate different ability levels in the one activity, and extension activities for more advanced students.

Conclusion

The declines in student values uncovered in this study may be the direct cause of ongoing low retention rates in Year 9 class music in Western Australia. As such, findings would appear to support previous expectancy-value theory assertions that declining values are an accurate predictor of future enrolment decisions in elective subject settings. Further, this study indicated that it is possible to identify overarching learning activity design principles which may enhance student motivation for Year 8 class music. However, it is important to note that the principles and recommendations presented in this study represent an assessment of the motivational value of class music learning activities from the student perspective, and do not represent an educational assessment of them.

Despite this, it becomes apparent that consideration of the educational in isolation of the motivational in an elective setting presents a real and ongoing danger to any subject, as evidenced in the high and ongoing drop-out rates from class music in Western Australia. Ultimately, this paper argues that a successful ‘marriage’ between the educational and the motivational is required if music educators are going to affect real change in retention rates in class music.

References


Kim Kirkman & Judith Brown: Central Queensland University

**Theatre Bootcamp: Results of a case study examining first-year student learning experiences during an intensive performing arts training project**

**Abstract**

This paper outlines the results of a case study of the learning experiences of first year tertiary music theatre and drama students during an intensive performance program, *Theatre Bootcamp* that occurs at the start of their tertiary studies. The two-week *Theatre Bootcamp*, part of the Bachelor of Theatre program at a regional Australian university, provides the students with intensive training in their core performance skills of singing, dancing and acting. The data for the study consisted of an anonymous survey of students who participated in *Theatre Bootcamp* and the critical reflections of the academic staff associated with the program. The analysis of this data found that *Theatre Bootcamp* addresses a number of broad education goals that are gaining increased attention in the higher education sector: graduate attributes. The term ‘graduate attributes’ refers to the set of qualities and skills that a university defines as core learning outcomes for their students. These provide a foundation for students’ employability as well as underlying the development of their human capabilities. The qualities and skills in these graduate attributes complement students’ discipline specific skills. Most universities around Australia are currently engaged in actively integrating these graduate attributes in all undergraduate courses. The results of this case study found that *Theatre Bootcamp* specifically addresses a number of these graduate attributes at an introductory level, especially in the areas of teamwork and collaborative learning. It also created important opportunities to develop social inclusion and a personal work ethic, which also align to the graduate attributes for performing arts students.

**Background to the Theatre Bootcamp project**

One of the many challenges facing staff and students at the beginning of a tertiary performing arts program is to build a cohesive team from the group of first year students so that they are ready to fully participate in the range of learning experiences that they will encounter at university. These learning experiences include many group activities such as those associated with acting, dance and the staging of theatre productions. In the theatre productions the students assume roles that include stage performance, technical direction and operation, and creative work in areas of design and construction of sets, props and costumes. These productions rely on the students having well developed team-work skills (Brown, 2003, 2007), as well as skills in personal and group communication, problem solving (Cohen, Lotan, Abram, Scarloss, & Schultz, 2002), creative and critical thinking (Moon, 2008) and a strong personal work ethic.

Typically, students arrive from a diverse range of performing arts backgrounds and are full of excitement as they commence their full-time study. This diversity of experience and skills, and the excitement of starting university, brings richness to
the existing student cohort and enhances the performance potential of the whole group of students. Yet it is this diversity that can also be challenging for the staff as they launch the students on their learning journey, each of them starting at a different point with regard to their skills, abilities and personal aptitude. The diversity of experience is also challenging to the existing student cohort as they begin to build a new team of students who can take on the challenge of the many learning experiences that they will be faced with in their university study. 

*Theatre Bootcamp* is designed to specifically address these challenges. In 2010, it was launched for the first time. This paper discusses the outcomes of a case study of this project that found the learning outcomes aligned to some of the important concepts of core learning, or graduate attributes, in the performing arts.

**Graduate attributes in the performing arts**

In order to further contextualise this case study, it is necessary to understand the current approaches to curriculum in the Australian higher education sector. Designers of higher education curriculum are increasingly called upon to incorporate into their degree programs and courses learning outcomes that are not only discipline specific, but address the broader learning outcomes that provide a foundation for students’ employability as well as underlying the development of their human capabilities (Barrie, Hughes, Smith, & Thomson, 2009; Brown, 2009).

The context for the establishment of these learning outcomes is the imminent creation of the Australian Government’s Tertiary Education Quality and Standards Agency (TEQSA), which will require universities and other higher education providers to demonstrate that their degree programs comply with standards that are yet to be established. The government is committed to these standards being owned and implemented by the discipline communities in the context of academic autonomy and peer review. The ALTC has been given responsibility in 2010 for consulting with discipline communities to produce draft sets of standards, defined at this stage as threshold learning outcomes that will capture the expectation we have for all graduates of our degree programs (Holmes, June 2010, p. 2).

In the creative and performing arts, discipline leaders from many higher education providers drafted the learning outcome statements across six broad domains in response to the government call to examine threshold learning standards across all tertiary programs of learning (Holmes, June 2010):

1. Knowledge and skills integration
2. Creative thinking and exploration
3. Realisation and application
4. Interpretation, communication, and presentation
5. Individual and collaborative practice
6. Social engagement and contribution
These statements outline the broad learning outcomes in each domain at the completion of a Bachelor degree in creative or performing arts and also upon the completion of a Masters by coursework degree in creative or performing arts.

**Methodology**

To provide data for this case study (Flyvbjerg, 2011; Stake, 1995; Yin, 2009), at the conclusion of the *Theatre Bootcamp* program, the students were asked to complete an open-ended anonymous questionnaire of seven questions relating to their experiences in the two-week program:

1. What did you like most about the two-week Bootcamp learning experience?
2. What did you find most challenging during Bootcamp?
3. What learning experiences did you find useful? Why?
4. How did the Bootcamp learning experience help you in developing singing skills?
5. How did the Bootcamp learning experience help you in developing acting skills?
6. How did the Bootcamp learning experience help you in developing dance skills?
7. Do you have any comments to give that would help us improve this for the future?
8. Their responses were analysed for themes that are discussed in this case study. Staff involved in the delivery of the *Theatre Bootcamp* program also contributed to a number of professional conversations (Orland-Barak, 2006; Tillema & Orland-Barak, 2006) that informed the analysis and discussion for this paper.

**Overview of the project: Theatre Bootcamp**

The *Theatre Bootcamp* project ran during the first two weeks of term 1, 2010. The first year cohort consisted of students enrolled in both the music theatre and drama specialisations in the degree. All students participated in the same program of training. Each day consisted of up to five hours of intensive, face-to-face group classes with the performing arts lecturers, with the time split between the disciplines of dance, singing and acting. It culminated in a sixty-minute public performance involving all the students showcasing the work they had studied in this two-week period.

**Movement and Dance**

Each day would start with at least thirty minutes of stretching and dance. This segment of the daily programme was taught by one of the senior students in the degree program under the supervision of the dance lecturer. The focus of this session was two-fold. Firstly, the stretching was used to make sure the students were physically warm before they began the intensive activities planned for the day, and this was followed by a dance class designed to teach a basic jazz routine to the whole group. This routine was fun and enjoyable for the group and the
choreography was designed to build on the strengths of those students in the group with strong dance skills, while at the same time build the confidence of those students in the group with less developed dance skills (Taylor & Taylor, 1995).

The second aim of this daily session was to instil a strong personal performance preparation ethic for the students. As theatre performers, the importance of physical preparation for performance through stretching and then appropriate cool-down was specifically taught and demonstrated (Taylor & Taylor, 1995; Warren, 1989). Many students who come from a strong dance background would already be aware of the necessity of this daily routine, but those who had come from a strong drama background may not have been aware of specific exercises that could be used to ensure a healthy and sustained performing arts learning experience. Coupled with the specific teaching of physical preparation exercises, the dance routine itself introduced a fun element that contributed significantly to achieving one of the important goals of *Theatre Bootcamp* — the bonding of the student cohort into a cohesive and workable team (Daniels, 2000).

Another important aspect of this dance class was the interaction that the first-year students had with an experienced senior student. This aspect of modelling serves as an example for the students in terms of their own personal achievement. Furthermore, the interaction between student and student-teacher aided in developing strong ties within the wider student cohort, thus assisting in the development of a cohesive and functioning student team (Brown, 2007).

**Vocal Class**

After the dance class, the students would then work on vocal technique and the production of vocal tone. This class was led by the full-time vocal lecturer who has a wide experience in training young voices, both male and female, in a range of vocal idioms. The focus of the vocal training was to work in three main areas:

1. The projected speaking voice
2. The use of ‘head-voice’ in classical singing idioms
3. The use of ‘chest-voice’ in contemporary/music theatre singing idioms

This daily class would typically run for between sixty and ninety minutes. The students would learn vocal warm-up techniques and these were linked to an understanding of the physical processes of singing. One of the major focuses of the singing program is to develop a singing technique based on a clear understanding of the anatomy of the vocal mechanism and the role each part of the body plays in the creation of various vocal sounds. In addressing the three areas of vocal development outlined above, the students are challenged to differentiate between each sound not only on its aural characteristics, but also on the various physical engagements required to produce each sound. Taught over the three years of the degree, this vocal technique includes posture, breathing, support, larynx control, pharynx resonance enlargement and the complex integration of these systems (see for instance Sataloff, 1981, 1987). Many muscles have to be activated in just the right sequence to fully realise the potential of the voice and much time is needed to fully understand how these muscles work as well as having some sense of the physical control over them.
The aim of *Theatre Bootcamp* is to start this process of individual exploration of the human voice, and for each student to begin his or her learning journey in singing. The research literature in vocal pedagogy indicates that students will take over a year or more to develop the ability to control many of these physical processes in a consistent and reliable way (Balog, 2005; Nielsen, 2004; Schindler, 2009). The process of learning to sing with confidence and the ability to create a wide variety of vocal colours as appropriate to various styles of music is a long one (Melton, 2007). *Theatre Bootcamp* merely starts this process, but it does so in an intensive manner that engages students in a fun and non-threatening way.

**Acting Class**

Each day in the intensive period, the students also participated in acting classes. These classes built on the work already developed in the dance and vocal technique class. In particular, this class focused on the aspects of the development of the projected speaking voice and the confident physicality of a theatre performer and this is particularly useful for both music theatre and drama students (Melton, 2007). The students spent some of this class working as a large group on various drama exercises to build trust and confidence, and then split into smaller groups to work on five small plays that would form part of the final public performance. The students also took on the challenge of learning to juggle. It develops important skills in hand-eye coordination and physical dexterity, which are important skills for actors supporting Burgess’ (1974) observations that juggling is a natural conclusion to the continual development of movement skills and part of the movement repertoire for an actor. The element of fun that was derived during this activity also supported the development of the teamwork skills and social cohesion of the group (Larson & LaFasto, 1989).

**The Public Performance**

The inclusion of a public performance at the end of *Theatre Bootcamp* is also an important part of the learning journey. Anecdotal evidence from students reveals that many undertake a tertiary theatre degree because they have had extremely enjoyable and rewarding theatre experiences during their high school years. These experiences have validated their growing performer identities and led them to consider making a career in the theatre. A public performance is the climax of this program and a very important part of the journey (Westney, 2003). It is, in a way, the reward for all the hard work undertaken.

**Data Analysis**

The analysis of the student questionnaires found that *Theatre Bootcamp* introduces the following core domains of learning at an introductory level:

- Knowledge and skills integration: Demonstrate the skills and knowledge of the practice, languages, forms, materials, technologies and techniques in the creative arts discipline; and
• Individual and collaborative practice: work independently and collaboratively in the creative arts discipline in response to project demands.

_Theatre Bootcamp_ introduces the concept of the discipline specific skills and knowledge necessary for students to complete a theatre degree with specialisations in music theatre and drama through the daily program of workshops in dance, voice and acting. It also has an underlying aim of creating a cohesive and workable team that will enable the students to learn to work collaboratively in response to the various projects that they will encounter during their tertiary studies. It is in the establishment of an environment where collaborative learning, at an introductory level, can effectively and meaningfully take place that gives _Theatre Bootcamp_ one of its most important learning outcomes.

**Discussion**

**Knowledge and skills integration**

The students’ responses highlighted the importance of the _Theatre Bootcamp_ program in providing them with the introductory knowledge and skills to set them up for their program of study: singing, dance and acting. _Theatre Bootcamp_ introduces this core learning at the introductory level, as this project occurs at the start of these performing arts students’ program of study. Barrie (2006) acknowledges that these core learning outcomes, that many universities map across the entire rage of courses within a program (Treleaven & Voola, 2008) can be introduced at introductory, intermediate and graduate levels within courses to ensure that the students’ learning is scaffolded across their full program of study.

**Social cohesion**

Another interesting outcome of the analysis of the student survey data indicated that _Theatre Bootcamp_ provided a significant stepping-stone in creating social cohesion within the student cohort. The majority of the students come from out of town, with some students coming from interstate. Many students struggle to settle into their new environment in the university college as well as the university learning environment, and many experience homesickness in the early weeks of settling in. These early weeks in a new course, in a new city can be very unsettling, and can easily become a trigger point for student attrition. Students are also weighing up whether they like the course, or they think the course is suitable for them, so their impressions of the first few weeks of study are extremely important. During _Theatre Bootcamp_, the staff members place high expectations on the new students. They challenge them with new concepts and new learning and teaching styles. Some students find this very personally challenging, but the group dynamics that come into play are an important in helping to create a cohesive and strong student body (Salmon & Meyer, 1992).
Before rehearsal, during breaks and after rehearsal, students mingle, console and encourage each other, which quickly leads to friendships being formed. These friendships provide support for these students and help them to overcome the personal challenges they face in the first few weeks of their university experience (Daniels, 2000).

To further improve this aspect of social cohesion, we are hoping, in 2011, to include the second and third year students in Theatre Bootcamp, involving them as rehearsal directors for the plays and in other areas of mentoring for the first year students, continuing on and expanding the work that is established by student mentors in wider university Orientation experience (McCarthy & McLeod, 2008).

**Work Ethic**

The third significant theme that arose from the analysis of the student surveys indicated that they became aware of the personal work ethic that they would need to cultivate in order to be successful in the degree. Theatre Bootcamp is organised around intensive rehearsal periods where students are expected to be able to focus on set tasks for around two hours at a time. This skill is important in for the remainder of their tertiary learning and also later in the profession where ‘calls’ for rehearsals are usually two to three hours in length, and full concentration is required. From the very first day, students begin work on several songs, a dance routine, and an extended dramatic work of about six minutes duration. This involves a lot of learning and memorisation from the students. They are expected to spend time after class learning these words and doing their own study into the performance pieces.

The first week of Theatre Bootcamp focuses on the initial learning of the material, and during the second week, the students are able to refine their performances, leading up to the public presentation of their work. They are encouraged to learn their work quickly in the first week and there is a strong emphasis on teamwork and cooperation to achieve these goals. This emphasis on teamwork and personal contribution to the overall team result means the students are expected to work hard to have lines and routines memorised. This is an important part of being a performing artist and an essential skill for their future studies (Hanrahan, 2005).

**Conclusion**

Theatre Bootcamp was implemented for the first time in term 1 2010, involving all newly enrolled students in this performing arts program at a regional Australian university. There are two specialisations within this degree and all students participated in the same Theatre Bootcamp program. This program has several learning goals including the introduction of discipline specific skills and learning within the framework and ethos of the performing arts program, and the broader goal of introducing, at an introductory level, some of the graduate attributes required of university graduates including those related to collaborative learning and being able to operate in a cohesive and functioning team.
The second and third year students who were observing Theatre Bootcamp and its effect on the students’ life at the residential college commented positively to the staff members about the broader Theatre Bootcamp learning outcomes. They observed strong friendships being formed within the first-year group and a sense of student bonding that was positive and constructive. The second and third year students, seeing the value of the Theatre Bootcamp experience and its positive outcomes for students, also expressed that they would like to have participated in Theatre Bootcamp as well. These comments have been taken on board by staff and will be included in the planning for the 2011 Theatre Bootcamp.

Through the professional conversations that occurred after Theatre Bootcamp part-time staff members, who had no direct involvement in the project, commented on an increase in focus with the first-year student cohort. They commented positively on this specific outcome of the Theatre Bootcamp experience and noted that this was a change from previous years where first year students took several months to adjust to the expectations and learning experiences that are part of this performing arts program. The full-time staff members were also keenly aware of the increase in focus from this group as the Theatre Bootcamp experience progressed. It is too early to know exactly how this Theatre Bootcamp experience will impact on all aspects of these students’ studies, but the positive evaluations from the first year students indicates that this program, at the beginning of their first year of study, is worth continuing for future groups of first-year students.

References


Barrie, S., Hughes, C., Smith, C., & Thomson, K. (2009). The National Graduate Attributes Project: Key issues to consider in the renewal of learning and teaching experiences to foster Graduate Attributes. Strawberry Hills, NSW: Australian Learning and Teaching Council Ltd.


Holmes, J. (June 2010). *Creative and performing arts: ALTC learning and teaching academic standards project update*: Australian Learning and Teaching Council.


Abstract

This paper focuses on the research methodology and findings of my current study. The main aim of this research is to look into the areas of knowledge and skills, of novice teachers in Kuala Lumpur who are practicing in their private studios. My main research question is “What are the knowledge and skills that new teachers need, to teach a quality music program successfully in Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia?”

The research instruments were designed to draw out the important issues, and problems facing the small teacher population, through survey questionnaires and interviews. I targeted piano teachers with at least two years teaching experience or more to respond to the questionnaire, and to qualify for interviews, teachers need to have a minimum of five years working knowledge and teaching experience. A teaching population of sixty was given questionnaires and fifty-nine responded to the structured and open format. Ten respondents were then interviewed with open-ended questions, which emphasized on the knowledge and skills for teaching, music curriculum and general areas of concern in music education in Kuala Lumpur.

Questionnaires and interview questions were based on the needs of good basic foundation for all students, common problems of students, how to improve practice, how to encourage sight-reading, what is the normal teaching program, what are the advantages of group teaching, the pros and cons of examinations and what knowledge and skills are necessary for teachers to become successful in their teaching careers. Emerging from the findings is a book, which has been developed to assist new piano teachers take smooth journeys to reach their destinations for successful, satisfying and fulfilling careers. Through my survey questionnaires and interviews, some commonly faced problems and points of interest are highlighted and supported in my writing. The literature review has widened many areas of my research and this enhances more interesting facts, ideas, concepts that I include into my writing to further provide holistic views in teaching, learning and their applications. Some changes may be required now that we are living in the twenty-first century. The resultant text may serve to refresh experienced teachers in piano teaching and may assist them to broaden their thoughts and to review and improve their present teaching styles.
Stuart Wise: University of Canterbury

Students’ perception of digital technology in Music Education

Abstract

The music industry in the twenty first century uses digital technology in a wide range of applications including in performance, composition and in recording and publishing. Much of this technology is freely available via downloads from the internet, as part of software included with computers when they are purchased and via applications that are available for some mobile phones. This technology is transforming music and the way people approach many traditional music activities. The adoption and implementation of digital technology may have also challenged some of the basic conceptual frameworks that have underpinned many of the approaches to music teaching common through the world.

The purpose of this research is to consider how the impact of digital technologies is perceived by both students and teachers and what implications this may have for music education and provision of secondary teacher education programmes in music. This paper examines quantitative data gathered from students in the participating schools.

Judith Brown: Central Queensland University

The collaborative performance experience: Results of an autoethnographic study of flow for a piano accompanist

Abstract

The American psychologist Mihaly Csikszentmihalyi first defined the term ‘flow’. He described flow as an intensely enjoyable phenomenon that occurs when one is totally absorbed in a challenging task, with clear goals and clear feedback, that gives a sense where nothing else mattered but the task at hand. Flow is a personal and subjective experience and I have used autoethnographic methods to explore this phenomenon in my own piano accompaniment experiences. This case study of the self draws upon data in the form of narrative vignettes that provide the reader with evocative accounts of the phenomenon as experienced in piano accompaniment situations. The data has been analysed for themes and compared with the dimensions of flow as defined by Csikszentmihalyi. This paper will report on this analysis and the development of a theory for understanding the phenomenon of flow for a piano accompanist.
Helen Lancaster: Griffith University

Exemplars in education, transitions in training: From school to a professional music career

Abstract

Recognising that the conservatorium model is no longer the only available option for musicians who are considering post-secondary music education and training, the Music Council of Australia is currently undertaking a comprehensive audit of the range of opportunities available across Australia via university and vocational education (private providers as well as state), non-award mentoring opportunities and internships. In alignment with Hannan’s comprehensive listing of professional careers in The Australian Guide to Careers in Music (2003), the research will cover a broad spectrum of music genres and potential roles which provide experience and training at different levels. Further, the project will also consider those schools which allow students to commence university and vocational studies prior to matriculation.

This paper will summarise the research findings to date, examining issues of access, ease of transition into higher education and vocational programs, and their relevance to eventual employment opportunities. It will be of great benefit to those teachers who advise students interested in a music career.

Peter DeVries: Monsah University

Being a parent-researcher: Reflections on this unique role

Abstract

This presentation will report on my role as a parent-researcher over an eight year period. As a parent-researcher I have researched my son’s engagement with music from birth to age 8. Reasons for being a parent-researcher are outlined, specifically within a sociocultural-historical framework. Advantages of using the parent-researcher paradigm are discussed, including role immersion as researcher, access to the research participant and co-researcher’s world, and insider knowledge being a parent and researcher. The presentation will also chart my move to researching with my son, who became a co-researcher with me in his own musical engagement. Challenges using this paradigm are also explored, including coming to terms with the multiple roles I have played as a parent-researcher and confronting ethical dilemmas and bias. Examples from this research will be provided throughout.
Details of another Australian National Curriculum were released in March 2010. 1 The Australian federal government expected that schools would commence teaching English, mathematics, history and science in 2011 and the Arts, Arts from 2013. 2 Music is to be one of five national Arts subjects. 3 A previous attempt to establish an Australian National Curriculum during the late 1980s was thwarted by political and philosophical differences between the Australian states and the federal government. Instead, the Australian states developed their own curriculums that were based on documents prepared for the National Curriculum. 4 In Victoria, issues arose regarding standards-based music education and the cutbacks that have occurred to classroom music programs in primary and secondary schools. 5 Disagreement with the Australian states has once more postponed the introduction of the proposed National Curriculum until at least 2013, presumably with the Arts to commence sometime from 2015. 6 There are a number of similarities between the 1980s National Curriculum and the proposed 2010 model. Developing a National Curriculum for music is fraught with difficulties as was experienced in the UK when music, art and PE were introduced last in 1992. 7 This decision created many difficulties for music teachers and school administrators in the UK. 8 In Victoria, there has been a continual flow of curriculum initiatives in state secondary schools since the late 1960s that has made many music teachers sceptical about the benefit of further curriculum changes. This paper discusses the issues and difficulties music teacher in Victoria and the UK have encountered working with curriculum documents prepared for a National Curriculum.

2 Ibid.
Patrick Shepherd: University of Canterbury

A World of sound and Colour: How do synaesthetes perceive their world? What are the personal experiences of synaesthetes, particularly relating to music, and how might these findings better inform music education and arts education generally?

Abstract

Synaesthesia is a condition where people ‘have anomalous perceptual experiences that are triggered by activity in another sensory modality’ (Ward et al, 2008). It often manifests itself as hearing colours or tasting sounds, or attributing colours to words and numbers, and is a condition experienced by many famous creative people eg Kandinsky, Messiaen and Scriabin. The theory of synaesthetics clearly underpins the theory of Integrated Arts, though is only ever implicit. However, recent studies show that synaesthetes may number as high as 1 in 23 (Simner et al. 2006), showing that many of our children are synaesthetes but hide the fact, in worst cases regarding it as an affliction when in actual fact it could be used as a positive tool in the teaching of the Arts.

In 2010 I launched an ongoing study to talk to synaesthetes about their condition. This paper traces some of the initial findings of the study so far and identifies areas for development in the projected second and third stages.

While the study explore synaesthesia in its broadest sense, participants were specifically asked to comment on any ways in which their own learning might have been enriched by their synaesthesia, if they felt it made them more or less creative and any ways in which synaesthesia/synaesthetics (as they perceive them) might be used in education, particularly with regards to music and the Arts.

Dawn Bennett: Curtin University

Reinvigorating student learning with conversations that enhance identity development

Abstract

The development of self-regulation and self-esteem are strongly related to envisioning the future self. For adolescents, this development often involves ‘trying on’ possible selves without a sense of permanence or expectation. However, university students are attempting to develop much more permanent self-structures (salient identities) as they negotiate potential career paths associated with their studies. It is for this reason that students should participate in life-career planning. Given that transition and identity development are processes that occur over time, students really need to re-identify with their learning at each point of educational transition: for example, from undergraduate to graduate study.
This paper reports on the experience of trialling strategies designed to engage students with thinking about their salient identities. Whilst the strategies were first implemented by the author, who had developed and refined them over time, the real challenge arose when the strategies were adopted by educators not otherwise associated with the project. Two of the major challenges encountered within the project were finding curricular time for the activities, and managing the activities with students who had not previously engaged in this type of thinking. One of the unexpected findings was the impact on educators, who found themselves in the same self-reflective mode as their students, and who reported a personal benefit. Implications include increased student engagement as the relevance of educational content is better understood; the potential for learners to engage in a dialogue with their learning; and improved motivation to learn as students (re)conceptualise their strengths, interests and goals.

**Julie Tann: Griffith University**

*Piano Graded Examinations, Friend or Foe: The Relevance to Piano Teachers in Singapore in the 21st Century*

**Abstract**

In Singapore, piano lessons and piano exams are inextricably linked. Since its inception in 1948, the influence of the British music exams, the Associated Board of the Royal Schools of Music (ABRSM), has so significantly moulded the local pedagogical practice and music education that the focus and direction of many piano teaching studios centre on the preparation of students for these exams. However, underlying concerns arise from an exam syllabus which focuses on ‘select’ musical skills. When teachers work exclusively from the syllabus, other areas of musical development are often overlooked since they are not ‘examined’ per se. Consequently, this breeds the popular notion of only ‘what is tested is what is taught’. Questions loom: What impact(s) arise from such reliance especially in the long-term? Do the exams hinder or enrich learning? Do they inhibit the advancement of teaching?

Furthermore, considering more than 40,000 candidates undergo the ABRSM exams each year whereby in excess of SGD9 million (AUD 7 Million) of exam revenue is collected by the ABRSM annually, Singapore’s long-term endorsement of the British music exam system as the primary tool of assessment needs reconsideration and reflection. This paper of an ongoing initial Doctoral study in this area probes the ABRSM piano graded exam system: how it is situated and utilised in a Singaporean context. To understand how relevant the current exam system is to Singapore, findings from my recent survey on local piano teachers’ utilisation and views on the exams and their impacts are discussed in this paper.
Tim Nikolsky: RMIT University

How do you approach creating an Australian Jazz Real Book for practising and professional musicians?

Abstract

This methodology outlines a current doctoral research project which is involved in developing an Australian Jazz Real Book (AJRB) as an educational and practical resource for practising and performing musicians. The research question guiding this study is: How do you develop an Australia Jazz Real Book as an educational and practical resource for practising and performing musicians?

A mixed methods approach was used in responding to the research questions, and incorporates web survey, real book analysis, key informant interviews, and community-based participatory research. Qualitative and quantitative research methods are used to provide a robust research framework. Quantitative data was obtained through a web survey and real book analysis. With the web survey data and Real book analysis I was able to produce a draft AJRB. I embarked on a composition collection process, accepting submissions from composers and attempting to locate particular compositions that were mentioned in the web survey. The draft AJRB has been used for comment and criticism by key informants in a series of individual interviews.

Key informants have been identified to represent a wide cross-section of the Australia Jazz community, having been identified as leaders in the fields of education, performance, curriculum development, and Australian Jazz history. These people have 'insider' knowledge of the history and development of Australian Jazz. Qualitative data was obtained from this.

It is anticipated that the AJRB will be used by the Australian Jazz community, and as such it is important to work closely with them to create a resource based on their needs and requirements appropriate in educational and practical contexts.

Cade Bonar: Griffith University

“To me, music is…?” Initial dialogues with year 8 Music students

Abstract

The statements: a) “To me, music is …?” and b) “To me, school music is…?” were posed to two focus groups of four Year 8 Music students (same-sex groups of four male and four female students) within the piloting of a semi-structured interview schedule. These two questions were central to the interview schedule, and student responses formed the basis for further exploratory questioning. The piloting of data collection instruments is strongly recommended in the research literature (Creswell, 2008; Mertler, 2006); however, much piloting focuses on surveys (van Teijlingen & Hundley, 2001). Social researchers van Teijlingen and Hundley (2001) recommend the use of in-depth interviews or focus groups as a precursor to the survey, to establish the issues and themes to be addressed, and to identify potential problems. This paper will unpack the preliminary data gained from these
diagnostic interviews. These data will contribute to the development of research themes and the construction (and subsequent piloting) of a survey that will investigate the levels of engagement students have with music in formal and informal contexts. Together with pilot survey data, these preliminary interview data will be used to inform a larger research project currently being conducted by the author.

Cade Bonar: Griffith University

Are we ready for actions to speak louder than words? A case for action research in music education

Abstract

Action research in education is defined as systematic inquiry conducted by teachers or other educational stakeholders in the teaching and learning environment for the purpose of improving the ways in which their particular educational setting operates, how they teach, and how their students learn (Gay, Mills & Airasian, 2009). Action research is often characterised as research that is done by teachers for teachers; therefore, it is also known as ‘practitioner research’ (McNiff, Lomax & Whitehead, 2003) and ‘teacher research’ (Gay, Mills & Airasian, 2009). Research that is done by teachers for teachers can present potentially strong connections between theory and practice by addressing the apparent failure of research to reach ‘where it matters’ – the classroom. Despite the growth in popularity of action research in education – not to mention the increased acceptance of the action research methodology (Herr & Anderson, 2006) – it has not significantly impacted music education. This paper makes a case for the increased need for action research in music education contexts. The power for action research to affect change in the classroom and ‘speak’ on behalf of theory – to put it in action – requires a sound notion of what constitutes action research. But what does quality action research look like? This discussion includes an analysis of action research studies conducted in music education using the principles of action research as defined by Zuber-Skerritt and Fletcher (2007). This paper seeks to equip teacher-researchers with a set of principles to guide quality action research in their classrooms to produce relevant knowledge and improve practice.

Marilyn Chaseling: Southern Cross University

The King’s Speech, Patriotism and the Rose

Abstract

The multi-award winning film, ‘The King’s Speech’ tells the story of the Duke of York who was crowned King George VI in 1936 after the abdication of his brother.
Unable to speak publically without stammering, the Duke overcame his speech impediment with the help of the Australian-born speech therapist, Lionel Logue. The King’s Speech has another historical connection with Australia. In 1927, The Duke of York, accompanied by his wife, made his only trip to Australia. On the fourth day of the visit, to honour the Royal visitors, 45,000 delighted spectators crowded into Sydney Cricket Ground to observe a spectacle of song, dance and tableau performed by 10,000 excited Sydney public school children. This paper provides an in-depth account of the occasion through the lens of music. It concludes that the NSW Department of Education used music at such events to assist in the development of patriotic sentiments and so further socialise children into the dominant British culture of the day.

David Forrest: RMIT University

Australian music in schools

Abstract

The paper reports on a sample of responses from a research project on Australian music in schools in Australia. The project is concerned with two complementary components: 1. Australian music used in primary and secondary schools, and 2. Schools that commission composers to write music for school ensembles to perform. This study builds on previous work (Forrest, 2009, 2008, 2007) undertaken on curriculum and policy analysis which was concerned with the major policy documents that identified composed Australian art music and not the identification of Australian popular or indigenous music (and arts) in the curriculum. The intention of the study was to establish the range of Australian music that is being used at the different levels of schools (primary, secondary compulsory and senior secondary). The focus is on music used for listening activities and did not intentionally deal with performance. The research questions that guided the study were: 1. What Australian music is used in the classroom? 2. How does this relate to the current curriculum?

The provision of Australian music is unequal around the education authorities across Australia. Some have a long and notable tradition of teaching and learning with Australian music. With the discussions on the Arts in the Australian curriculum, the national focus should provide the opportunity to enable a sharing of curriculum thinking and development as well as associated resources. The study also provides a discussion on the place of a nation’s music within a child’s education. This is not limited to Australia. The question of whether we need to study, appreciate, perform our music is considered.
Kay Hartwig: Griffith University

Portrait of a Lady

Abstract

What do retired music teachers do? They keep on making music…. This paper details the work of a retired music teacher who moves to a country area from the city to be close to family. How does she become part of what appears to be a closed community? She becomes part of the U3A organization and realises that music would be a wonderful contribution to the opportunities offered through this group for retired folk of the area. What commences as a fun activity becomes a lifeline for the music teacher herself – continuing to use her music skills and engaging in music making with others.

The music activities including a choir, recorder group and a music history workshop also become the beginnings of wonderful friendships and social gatherings. The music gatherings become a feature for not only the music teacher herself but for all the participants. As well as the weekly musical gatherings performances in the community have also evolved. The conductor and a number of the participants were interviewed. What commenced as a means to an end has become both a social and well bring activity for the conductor and the participants as well as enabling the development of musical skills and knowledge.

Dawn Joseph and Jane Southcott: Deakin and Monash Universities

Student teachers’ voices: understandings of authentic engagement and music education in Victoria

Abstract

The arts embody and enact a nation’s identify. By engaging and preparing future teachers in the compelling cultural medium of music we create empowered agents of change. This creates a challenge for teacher educators to find ways in which to incorporate deep immersion experiences in music of other cultures for student teachers so that they will become more inclined to include such experiences in their own teaching. This paper is based on data collected as part of a wider study situated in Melbourne, Victoria, Intercultural understandings of pre-service music education students (2005-2009), which had two aims: to explore students’ understanding of cultural diversity in music education and to discover how they envisaged multicultural music teaching in schools. This particular discussion focuses on one facet of this study, understandings held by participants concerning artists-in-schools programs in Victorian school music. All interview data were analysed thematically using Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis and direct
quotations of student voices were employed to illustrate their understandings of the role and need for artists-in-schools programs. An additional lens was added to the student understandings by the commentary and observations of one of their tertiary music educators. Throughout this discussion we have explored the nexus of practice and theory both during their teacher education program, and the ways in which our early career teachers may address the rich musical and cultural diversity which will contextualise their future teaching.

Rowena Riek: Griffith University

*Parents and music education:* how is it valued and where do they see it fitting into the education of the child?

**Abstract**

Music education in Queensland for most government primary school students consists of a thirty minute lesson that is taken by a specialist music teacher, as well as the opportunity to be involved in the Instrumental Music Program in either stringed instruments from year three or concert band instruments from year five. There have been numerous studies and reports over the past decade detailing the challenges music programs face in terms of inadequate resourcing, the tensions that exist between pre-service teacher education and the classroom requirements, and issues relating to the quality of programs within schools.

There is now an added tension in music education with Australian schools now working in what can be called a performative culture with the introduction of national standardised testing. This performative culture has affected parental expectations of schooling and it also has implications for music education. How do parents value music education when they have to compare it to the maths and sciences?

There is a gap in the research recording and examining the voice of the parent in regards to how they see and value music education in the primary school setting. This study hopes to fill this void by investigating whether or not parents value music education, and to what extent it is valued and how they see it playing a part in the education of their own children. Through the use of qualitative and quantitative data, a picture will be drawn about one Queensland primary school community and how a group of parents prioritise educational choices in this performative culture.

The paper will demonstrate that there is a great need for a clearer and more rigorous articulation of the benefits of a quality music program and that the dichotomy between subject areas that currently exists in schools is unproductive. Using the data from interviews and surveys, this research gives priority to the parental voice and it demonstrates how parents value and perceive music education.
Jennifer Rosevear: Elder Conservatorium, University of Adelaide

Student evaluations of learning and teaching in a tertiary environment

Abstract

This paper addresses the processes which are in place at The University of Adelaide in which students provide regular evaluations of their experiences across all of the courses (ie subjects) for which they are enrolled. In addition to evaluations of individual courses, there are also program evaluations which can be undertaken which seek to gauge the students’ opinions of their overall degree program. Such program evaluations are more closely related to the national Course Experience Questionnaire (CEQ) administered to all graduates of degree programs.

The University of Adelaide’s Elder Conservatorium of Music initiated program evaluations in 2003 and these have since become standardised across the University. The program evaluations provide a picture of student responses to a range of generic aspects, and there is also scope for individual student comments to be included. The paper will discuss trends that have emerged in the data collected through these program evaluations.

David Sell: University of Canterbury

CANMusic – a chord in a community

Abstract

CanMusic is a study of the interaction of music education with the community that benefits from and contributes to it. The study subscribes to the premise that every musical experience is a learning experience, whether deliberately designed as such, or educational by informal exposure. It is a study of music activity in a single community, the city of Christchurch, and the musical organizations within it. It is planned as an ongoing study, the first part of which is identifying and collecting information on musical organizations that drive and influence growth and activity.

The study is in two parts – a database of musical organizations in Christchurch, and more detailed profiles of the impact on the community of three musical organizations in the city.
Musical participation is a powerful form of community participation, positive ageing and the maintenance of well-being. Community music endeavours usually involve active music-making and acquisition of musical skills and understandings. Participants in such programs elect to become involved, often taking responsibility for the survival of the group.

This case study explores the understandings of members of a community band, the Second Wind Ensemble, formed in 1998 in Adelaide, South Australia. Initially, the band offered late starters the opportunity to learn an instrument. The ensemble now has approximately sixty players with a regular program of concerts, rehearsals, tutorials and social gatherings. Concerts range from a roadside performance for an annual fun-run to concerts for senior citizens clubs.

The band conductor is a professional music educator. All other members are amateurs who have assumed the organizational roles. In this case study, the founder, conductor, organiser and a number of participants were interviewed and data analysed using Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis. The themes identified from these multiple perspectives have revealed a number of issues. Some are expected such as emphases on well-being, sense of active engagement with community, and the development of musical skills and understandings.

Other findings reveal different understandings. The conductor perceives the band to be a fine balance between the social and the musical. The multiple perspectives of the ensemble stakeholders reveal tensions in the understandings of the meaning of ongoing commitment to the band. These tensions need to be recognised and resolved to ensure the longevity of such ensembles beyond the first generation.
From Singing to ‘Kinging’:
Finding the Imperial Voice in Tom Hooper’s 2010 film, The King’s Speech

Abstract

In Tom Hooper’s The King’s Speech, Colin Firth’s Albert, Duke of York (destined to become King George VI, but known to his family as Bertie), and Geoffrey Rush’s Lionel Logue (self-invented antipodean speech pathologist) engage in a particularly intimate, confronting and highly energetic style of educational ‘conversation’. Logue, using what are – for the time – rather idiosyncratic and eccentric methods (but which, interestingly, are not too dissimilar to present-day singing teaching techniques), endeavours to assist the inveterate stammerer and reluctant heir to the throne to find and own both his voice and his sovereignty.

This paper explores some of the auditory and oral aspects of the ‘heroic’ learning journey whereby Bertie finally arrives at the point of being able to deliver a pivotal speech to the British people after war is declared on Hitler’s Germany, symbolically affirming the united stance of king and country – of the masses, the empire and the armed forces – in the fight against fascism. Fittingly, the film’s culmination features the telling use of the respective slow movements of the Seventh Symphony and The Emperor Concerto (Piano Concerto No. 5) of Ludwig van Beethoven, a composer who also battles a debilitating impediment and harbours an equally equivocal attitude (for very different reasons) to the role of emperor, as enacted (in Beethoven’s case) by Napoleon Bonaparte.

Introduction

For the twenty-first century student, engagement with multi-media is a given. Digital text in its many forms is thus necessarily a huge contributor to student learning, be it either informally or by design. Until recently, formal education has emphasised visual literacy, but the rise in the number of texts on cinematic sound testifies to the fact that the vital role of sound in textual interpretation is gradually receiving greater recognition. (For a recent Australian text, see for example Andrew Ford’s 2010 book The Sound of Pictures.) Music educators are in a prime position to engage with students in decoding the aural landscape of digital text.

In looking specifically at recent films about British royalty, Flinders University’s Giselle Bastin points to a new era, in which the visual dominance – the extravagant pomp and grandeur of earlier historical/biographical films – is being displaced by the greater importance given to the auditory, the verbal and the oral.\[9\]
Bastin suggests that Hooper’s *The King’s Speech* exemplifies a change in focus whereby royalty becomes more accessible to the ordinary person: the human voice is mapped onto the historical through exploration of smaller stories. Thus, this sub-genre of film, which previously could be characterised as a biopic – at best a sop to grandeur and imperial history, and at worst, a soap opera – now displays the potential for more subtle and telling social commentary.

Bastin notes that the trend of taking a small element or time period, a micro-history, a private slice of royal life, to explore wider public implications was first apparent in Stephen Frears’ 2006 film, *The Queen* (starring Helen Mirren), which examines the relationship between the public and the royal family around the time of Princess Diana’s death. As Bastin remarks, *The King’s Speech* is a continuation of *The Queen* in exploring the public/private aspects of a royal crisis, with the title referring both to the public performance of a crucial wartime speech and to the private battle to speak at all. Both films examine the ellipses, the gaps, the spaces between - literally in the case of *The King’s Speech*, with its focus on speech as spoken, of the stutterer; we as audience are suspended in the gaps between actual speech and sound as we wait for the next utterance to occur.

George VI (George the faithful), one of the least known of the British monarchs, is an unlikely hero. As Bastin notes, in Waris Hussein’s 1978 television mini-series, *Edward and Mrs Simpson*, Bertie was a shadow, a walk-on, in his brother’s dramas with Wallis Simpson. Giles Foster’s television film, *Bertie and Elizabeth* (2002), was made primarily to honour the beloved (late) Queen Mother, so that Bertie played second fiddle to his wife. Even in Hooper’s *The King’s Speech*, where Bertie/Duke of York finally takes centre stage, his status – unusually for a royal – is definitely that of the underdog. Shy, unconfident and physically not very strong, he requires hard work, dedication and courage to face and overcome his personal fears in order to fulfil his public role. This perhaps contributes to his everyman status, in that his human weakness appeals (in the end) both to his subjects and to us as film audience. His story certainly resonates with a fellow stutterer, David Seidler, the writer of the film’s screenplay that so powerfully depicts Colin Firth’s Bertie overcoming immense personal barriers to find the strength to assert: “I have a voice!”

The oral and auditory aspects of *The King’s Speech* present several key points of interest to the music educator: the pertinence of the latest audio technology both to public performance and to the private teaching process; Logue’s use of inventive and energetic teaching/coaching approaches – not unlike modern-day singing teaching techniques – to disinhibit mechanical and psychological facets impeding effective vocal production; and the featuring of singing itself and of recorded music as part of Logue’s teaching methodology. Of further interest is the film’s powerful use (both diegetically and non-diegetically) of music from the German canon (particularly Beethoven) at key points in Bertie’s ‘heroic’ journey towards finding and owning the imperial voice and asserting his right to sovereignty. This music forms a counterpoint to the relatively bland (and sometimes almost – I think intentionally – ‘stuttering’) original score by Alexandre Desplat, who also wrote the music for *The Queen*. I will address each of these
areas briefly, and roughly in this order, although there is necessarily a great deal of overlap between these auditory domains.

**Personal struggle, public performance and audio technology**

The emphasis on the oral and the auditory is particularly critical in *The King’s Speech*, given the advent of new technology at the time, which facilitated mass communication in an unprecedented form. ‘Live’ radio broadcasting and audio recording, the phonograph player, the microphone and the public address system all figure largely in the film. Whereas previously, communication between the royals and the people was through a kind of ‘courtly ventriloquism’, whereby all statements were issued through the palace, now suddenly, by way of direct broadcast, the monarch was able to be present ‘live’ in the homes of ordinary people for the first time, providing unparalleled immediacy of access to, and potential identification with, the public.

With the coming of radio and the mass media revolution, there was a profound shift to leadership being about performance, about one’s ability to project emotional connection with the audience; this anxiety about leadership persists to this day. As Bertie’s father, George V, remarks to Bertie, “being king used to be about cutting a good figure in dress uniform and not falling off your horse, but now we must invade people’s homes and ingratiate ourselves with them. The family has been reduced to that lowest and basest of all creatures. We’ve become actors.” (This is interesting, not only in its highlighting of the notion of performance, but also in its implied contempt for the likes of Bertie’s speech therapist-to-be, Lionel Logue, whose background is in acting.)

From the outset, the film sets up a personal predicament, a subjective point of view that draws sympathy, yet involves public performance on the national stage. The opening shots of the film put the new audio technology front and centre, with stills of a huge torpedo-shaped microphone (one of the original, personalised microphones made for the royal family and used for Edward VIII’s abdication speech). When in 1925, George V asks his second son, the Duke of York, to give the closing speech at the Empire Exhibition in Wembley, London, not only is the shy stuttering Bertie confronted face to face with this giant, hostile-looking new apparatus; he also must endure the weight of family and historical expectation, for Wembley is where his father has already successfully ‘performed’ and where his brother gave his first broadcast. (A scene later in the film, when Bertie attempts to practise broadcasting, emphasises the link between the technology, the establishment of power and sovereignty, and even battle. His father exhorts him to: “Let the microphone do the work. Sit up, straight back, face boldly up to the bloody thing and stare it square in the eye as would any decent Englishman. Show who’s in command.”)

At the opening of the film, the Duke of York’s everyman status is established. No regal attire marks his royal standing; dressed in ordinary clothes, he looks very exposed in front of the huge microphone, portrayed as an amateur compared with the professional radio announcer, who engages in a of ritual throat-spraying and
gargling in his preparations as a professional broadcaster. The duke’s own attempts to speak are excruciating to watch; the feedback delay of the Wembley venue – sometimes as much as two seconds – is a stutterer’s nightmare, not only magnifying any impediment by repetition, but also confusing the speaker and further confounding his futile attempts to articulate.

The duke is deeply scarred by this experience, and it is obvious that something must be done if he is to carry out a six-month tour of empire, during which he will be required to give dozens of speeches to thousands of strangers. What allows him to recover from this first disastrous speech at Wembley, to the point where he is able to successfully carry out the opening of the Australian parliament in Canberra, is his work with one Lionel Logue, self-styled speech pathologist. The duke’s engagement of Logue’s assistance marks the beginning of a life-long, particularly intimate, confronting and highly energetic style of private educational ‘conversation’ to achieve this public performance.

An educational ‘conversation’

It might be said that both the Duke of York and Logue in their own ways construct themselves as performers: both are self-invented, with the duke engaging in a great deal of practice in order to perform his royal role, while Logue does a great impression of a speech therapist. The relationship between Albert, Duke of York (and future king), and antipodean commoner, Lionel Logue would seem, at first glance, an ill-fated alliance. At the time of their meeting, the duke had already tried nine speech therapists without success, and is very tired. That an Australian with no formal qualifications – only a background in amateur dramatics and experience in working with shell-shock victims – could succeed where so many others had failed would appear a dubious proposition.

Logue is cast as an outsider, an inferior, according to the prevailing social mores of the time. He speaks the king’s English with a colonial accent, but has the confidence – or perhaps to British aristocratic eyes, the temerity – at the age of forty-four, to move his family to London from Perth, Australia, rent rooms in Harley Street, and erect a plaque: L. Logue, Speech Defects.\textsuperscript{v} By imperial standards of the time, the teacher is of lesser status than learner. Furthermore, he is unorthodox, eccentric, flamboyant, a challenger of conventions, no bower and scraper nor observer of traditional forms or practices.

As a practitioner, Logue requires absolute equality and trust in his consultation room, insisting that he be called Lionel, and addressing the duke (and future king) as Bertie, the sobriquet used only by his immediate family. Logue ironically asserts to his future ruler and sovereign: “My game, my turf, my rules”. Moreover, despite the royals’ assertion that they never talk about their private lives, Logue breaks down even these barriers to pioneer an almost psychotherapeutic approach to speech therapy.

Director Tom Hooper describes the evolving relationship between the two men, with its changing dynamics over an intensive series of sessions, as a ‘bromance’,

76
or brotherly love story, one which plays somewhat fast and loose with history to provide Hollywood-style rows and reconciliations – and one which contrasts markedly with the story of the relationship with Bertie’s actual biological brother, David (better known – if briefly – as King Edward VIII), to whom everything comes easily, and who cruelly teases Bertie about his difficulty with speech.

**Singing and audio recording as means to owning the imperial voice**

As teachers, we know that psychological support, as well as technical training, is necessary in helping students to perform, especially with the voice, where there is no hiding place – you *are* your voice. However, the royals, in their wish to avoid the personal, ask that Logue deal just with the mechanics of vocal production and articulation. Although of course there is overlap between the mechanical and psychological, Logue agrees to this, but needless to say, does not stop there.

In his very first session with the duke, Lionel demonstrates that Bertie can in fact already deliver a speech and articulate without hesitation, thus showing that his speech problem goes beyond the physical. Lionel uses music as an aid to this, again highlighting new technology in the form of recording – describing Silvertone recording/playing equipment as “the latest thing from America”. Logue asks Bertie to put on headphones, through which he plays Mozart’s *The Marriage of Figaro* overture very loudly as he records him reading the famous Hamlet “To be or not to be?” speech. It is perhaps no accident that this piece of music (one actually used by the ‘real’ Logue), happens to be about the crossover between classes, presenting a challenge to the born-to-rule sense of entitlement of the aristocracy. Alternatively, perhaps it is just a wonderfully energetic piece with which to drown out self-listening and self-sabotaging thought processes. Lionel’s exercise with Bertie serves to demonstrate that so much of singing (and of playing and performing in general) is about finding the means, or developing the skills, to get out of one’s own way, psychologically as much as physically.

**Mechanical aspects**

In the arena of the mechanical, Logue works on many of the exact same things we do in singing to this day – breathing exercises, engagement of the diaphragm, relaxing of the jaw muscles, vocal exercises, gargling, developing strength and flexibility of the tongue by repeating tongue twisters – and uses actual singing to encourage continuous airflow, fluency of utterance and vocalisation. As we do in singing, Logue deconstructs the actual production and articulation of sounds, breaking down consonants and vowels into the physical elements needed to produce them. The glimpse we have of the manuscript of the final king’s speech shows it as annotated and marked up as one would a piece of music to sing, with breathing places and cues as to how to slide into a word, where more emphasis is needed and so on. Logue became a kind of speechwriter, checking and removing difficult words or phrases where necessary.

Equally important is the more vigorous physical regimen employed by Logue, who encourages Bertie to engage in a range of ‘unregal’ energetic activities, singing, yelling, and even allowing himself to be human occasionally by having a joke or
sharing an anecdote. A montage of Logue and Bertie working together – to the (non-diegetic) accompaniment of the first movement of the Mozart A major Clarinet Concerto – shows them burbling, rolling, swaying, jumping up and down, breathing, intoning, projecting vowels, repeating consonants. At one stage the duchess sits on Bertie’s diaphragm, rising and falling as he breathes; on another occasion, Logue, the duke and the duchess practise the sustaining and projection of continuous sound, by intoning vowels loudly while standing in front of an open window in order to imbibe fresh air and encourage free movement of the diaphragm. Logue’s approach may seem eccentric to the uninitiated, but is standard to physical theatre warm-ups and is in fact not unfamiliar to many of us who have studied for example, Feldenkrais, in conjunction with singing.

Psychological aspects

As Logue himself says in the film, daily practice, physical exercises and tricks are important, but they deal only with the surface of the problem. The voice is linked not only to mechanics, but also to confidence, to projection of character and performance of self. For stammerers, there is an additional emotional angst inherent in the constant struggle even to speak, and to be heard. One of Logue’s ‘real’ patients reports feeling as if he is in prison looking out through bars preventing him from communicating. From diaries recently rediscovered by Logue’s grandson, we learn that the duke himself described as ‘hell’ the way he felt when he had to give a speech.

Thus, part of Lionel’s work is to engage positively with the emotions and facilitate the releasing of inhibitions. Logue exploits swearing as a cathartic outlet, and uses actual singing to encourage Bertie to articulate what he finds too painful to say. What distresses him mainly concerns the Duke’s relationship with his family, particularly with his father, who endorsed a regime of fear, and with his older brother David, the charmer of all. Bertie reports that his father, George V, acts on the maxim: “I was afraid of my father and my children are damn well going to be afraid of me.” He shouts unhelpfully at Bertie to “Get it out, get it out” when he stammers, which of course only increases his stress and therefore his inability to speak.

Through singing, Lionel helps Bertie to share his debilitating childhood experiences and to begin to defuse their power, so that he is eventually able to regain a sense of self-worth and dismiss his hesitancy about his right to be heard. With the aid of the songs Swanee River and Campdown Races, we learn that not only did Bertie stammer from an early age, but that he was compelled to wear leg irons day and night to straighten his legs, and was also forced to become right-handed. He reveals that his first nanny preferred his brother, pinched Bertie to make him cry during the daily showing of the children to the adults, then refused to feed him – something his parents failed to notice for three years, and which caused him stomach problems that persisted into adulthood.

Additionally, there was the death, at age thirteen, of Bertie’s younger brother Johnnie, who was hidden from view because he suffered from epilepsy and mental instability. Sadness about Johnnie’s fate resonates with Bertie’s own anxiety about
incipient madness, and raises the spectre of his ancestor, mad King George III. But ultimately Bertie proves to be the more sane - and also more statesmanlike and 'kingly' - than the naturally confident and charismatic David, admitting that at the time of the abdication, “I fear my ... brother is not of sound mind... at this time.” Additionally, it is their father, George V who terrified Bertie with his ranting, who finally presents as incoherent and rambling; it is his words that become impotent and incomprehensible as he nears death.

Nevertheless, Bertie’s relationship with his father remains crucial. Logue’s diary reports on an actual letter the duke wrote to Logue soon after treatment started, speaking of ‘the joy with which he said, “I can talk to my father again.”’ When the duke is crowned, he takes the name George to keep continuity with his father, and also maintains his father’s tradition of the Christmas speech. To Logue, Bertie reports that he was informed after the fact that his father’s last words were: “Bertie has more guts than the rest of his brothers put together”, and laments that “He couldn’t say that to my face.”

The sort of daily courage required not only to negotiate everyday life, but also to perform on the public stage, breeds a strong person, as Lionel Logue acknowledges. At a critical point in the film in the cathedral before the coronation, the duke demands to be listened to because, he asserts: “I have a right to be heard! I have a voice!” Logue echoes the sentiments of (the late) George V by affirming: “You have such perseverance, Bertie. You're the bravest man I know. You'll make a bloody good king.”

Non-diegetic music and imperial voice

In the coronation rehearsal that follows the outburst referred to above, it is notable that Alexandre Desplat’s musical score is used to express the fun and joy of the friendship between the two men, rather than build the tension to the coronation as a climactic point in the film. As director, Tom Hooper reports, a musical climax at this point would undermine the film’s denouement with the delivery of the wartime speech, and create a false, or double, climax. Thus, music is used here to defuse a possible a structural problem in the film. In general, Desplat’s original music charts the evolving relationship between the principal protagonists. It also often mirrors the stammering, stuttering motif of the film by its use of a repeating single note, as if the music is stuck.

Desplat’s score is perhaps intentionally bland to create a counterpoint with the music chosen from the German canon to heighten the impact of the film’s culmination. Perhaps somewhat ironically given the wartime situation between Britain and Germany, it is Beethoven that we hear in the final scenes, underlining Bertie’s personal courage and triumph over adversity in the service of his people. (To explore all the resonances of the choice of Beethoven – which might include the German ancestry of the British royals, the place of Beethoven in European culture overall, the use of Beethoven motifs in mass communication during wartime and even Beethoven’s attitude to Napoleon – would be a whole other conversation, one which is beyond the scope of this paper.)
Tom Hooper relates that the decision to use Beethoven at the final climactic point was made by the film’s editor, Tariq Anwar, a judgement later endorsed by the director himself: Hooper regards Beethoven as existing in the public consciousness, and that the use of his music elevates the final speech scene to the status of a public event. On a personal level, as Lisa Schwarzbaum puts it: ‘the majestic music composed by a musical titan who was losing his hearing, is used to intensify the effect of words spoken by a monarch just coming into his voice’, a king who is just learning that he has a right to be heard.

On another level, Bertie’s struggle can be seen as the battle between a man who can’t speak and a man whose delivery is terrifying in its power of persuasion. When a brief item in a newsreel during the film shows an example of Adolf Hitler’s aggressive staccato utterance, one of the princesses asks the king what he is saying. Bertie replies, “I don’t know, but he seems to be saying it rather well.” Throughout the film, the power of the voice is continually emphasised as paramount. Later, when rehearsing for his own wartime speech to the nation, Bertie asks Lionel: “If I’m a king, where’s my power?”, declaring that he is not actually able to take any meaningful action. His only role is to be a good speaker, “Because the nation believes that when I… I speak, I speak for them. But I can’t speak.”

The king’s speech at the denouement of the film is delivered to the hesitant beginnings of the slow movement of Beethoven’s Seventh Symphony. Lionel has created a comfortable, intimate space for Bertie, so that he can say the speech to Logue “as a friend”; Lionel has arranged for the light of the microphone to be turned off so that the “evil eye” is not staring at him and he has opened the window for fresh air. At the beginning of the speech, Lionel encourages and ‘conducts’ Bertie through this public ‘performance’ on national radio. Like the Beethoven, Bertie’s speech is halting and uncertain at first, but becomes gradually more assured. Lionel stops conducting as the king continues on his own; meanwhile, the accompanying Beethoven gathers momentum to emerge as a brooding anthem with overtones of war. The king stands calm and firm as he exhorts his people to unite in this time of trial. Bertie himself already has demonstrated courage on a personal scale through his work with Logue, just to enable him to deliver this speech.

Lionel Logue was with the king for every wartime speech thereafter. Through his broadcasts, King George VI became a symbol of national resistance, with a voice that to this day remains individual and identifiable. Not only did his slow, deliberate speech – featuring the rhythm of taking the pause, learnt from Logue – have a certain gravitas, but it also displayed evidence of wit. As the film shows, when Logue, after congratulating the king, says, “You still stammered on the w”, Bertie replies, “Well I had to throw in a few so they’d know it was me.” (This is a direct quote from Logue’s diary.) In the final interchange between the men in Hooper’s film, after their successful duo ‘performance’, Lionel is addressed by the king as “my friend” and Bertie is addressed by Logue as "your Majesty". The men’s body language shows Lionel giving Bertie the nod to finally assume his rightful role as sovereign.
The sublime music of the second movement of Beethoven’s ‘Emperor’ Concerto accompanies the closing shots of the film where the king, having successfully delivered his stirring speech to the nation over the radio, moves with his family to the balcony of the palace to acknowledge his people in person. The ‘Emperor’ title is not used in Germany for this Beethoven piano concerto, but it seems fitting in association with this British king who, through great personal effort, courage and commitment, has earned the right to his imperial voice. In Beethoven’s ethereal slow movement, at the point where the piano enters, there is a final mid-shot of the king, followed by a final shot of Logue, cementing the ultimate connection of an unlikely performance duo, who indeed remained life-long friends.

**Conclusion**

Although Albert, Duke of York’s ‘heroic’ learning journey enabling him to fulfil the role of King George VI is played out on the public stage of history, it is nonetheless a highly personal story, one that invites broad empathy and identification from the audience. As Geoffrey Rush comments, the royal evolution is “a journey towards becoming a king, or becoming a human being, in a funny sort of way.”\textsuperscript{xi} Thus, Albert’s transformation ‘from singing to kinging’ through his work with Logue, so movingly depicted by actors Firth and Rush (respectively) in Hooper’s film, serves to illustrate music’s educative power as a developmental life skill, in its capacity to unlock potential, encourage confidence and enhance personal growth overall.

Hooper’s cinematic text can be seen, therefore – at least in part – as a metaphor for the potential of music and/or singing to help every person, whatever their situation in life, to become more fully human, to affirm their identity and ‘find their voice’ amidst the stresses and demands of contemporary life. As we music educators witness daily, singing – and all forms of music making, whether undertaken in the form of an individual study, or as part of a group enterprise, either formally or informally – has the powerful potential to change lives in ways that extend far beyond the mechanics of musical practice.

*The King’s Speech* finally both illustrates and affirms the power of music in general, through its use of the Beethoven, with its capacity to embody simultaneously both the intimate and personal, and the grand and universal. In this cinematic context, the Beethoven both reflects the personal and public journey of Albert/King George VI and his ongoing relationship with Logue, and resonates with the audience’s own struggles and triumphs, imbuing them with a sense of connection, a universality that transcends the individual, inspiring in us all the great courage and perseverance required to ‘sing our own song’, to find our ‘voice’ and fulfil our special role in the world.
Abstract

Though the Queensland Department of Public Instruction attempted to deliver a comprehensive school music education through the introduction of a new and revitalised syllabus in 1930, the reality was that the most pervasive and effective music education for children and adults in the 20th century in Cairns, and indeed for most of Australian society, was provided by community music groups often supported by the work of private music teachers and/or significant families. This article documents community groups from the Anglo-Celtic, Aboriginal and Torres Strait cultures in Cairns which had strong senses of self-identity, relied on many donated hours of amateur and professional goodwill, involved cross generational music making activities that was most marked in particularly influential families, provided regular performance opportunities and gathered support and funds to supply instruments, rehearsal venues and ultimately, music education for their members. Bartleet, Dunbar-Hall, Letts and Schippers (2008) have identified similar significant factors including infrastructure, organization, social engagement, dynamic music-making, engaging pedagogy/facilitation and links to schools in the dynamics of successful community music making in contemporary Australia.

Community music education was generally delivered through particular cultural methods and procedures. This paper documents the activities of a number of co-existing musical communities in Cairns in a multi-cultural population (where multi-cultural describes different cultural groups co-existing alongside one another rather than interacting with each other), each being largely independent and relatively narrow in its activities. Despite this, there is some evidence that shows that some musical activities tended towards intercultural musical processes and others were culturally imposed, such as Western music being taught in schools and churches to all cultures. The paper offers an insight into community music education practices in a remote country town in Australia as advances in the technologies of wireless, film and gramophone began to play increasingly pervasive and influential roles in formal and informal music education practices.

Keywords

Cairns, music education, history, music learning and teaching, community music, Aboriginal, Torres Strait Islander, Anglo-Celtic.

Warning: Indigenous Australians are advised that images or names of people now deceased are included.

Community music education in Cairns: 1920 to 1950

Music performance, learning and teaching occur in communities over a wide range of settings, contexts, styles and functions that relate to culture and cultures. Music making in pre-contact Indigenous societies on the Australian continent took place...
in both formal and informal settings. Since white settlement, formal and informal community music making in Australia has been practised in almost all regional and metropolitan towns and cities in many contexts and forms that include brass bands, choirs, orchestras, church music groups, Indigenous groups and ethnic cultural ensembles such as Chinese opera groups. Bartleet, Dunbar-Hall, Letts and Schippers (2008, p. 21) describe contemporary community music making as encompassing:

a wide and diverse range of musics, which reflect and enrich the cultural life of the participants and their broader community. Common features of these activities are a primary focus on the specific competencies and ambitions of the participants (rather than didactic teaching of a predetermined repertoire), and a sense of social cohesion that supports musical development, often with a strong drive for excellence in process as well as product.

Many features of community music life in Cairns in the period of 1920 to 1950 resonate with this description as will be seen, and continue to do so to the present day. However, in contrast with the bracketed section of the statement above, there is evidence that didactic teaching of a predetermined repertoire was present in the period.

Bands, Choral Societies, Orchestras in Anglo-Celtic Cairns

The remote township of Cairns in Far North Queensland from 1920 to 1950 was musically active with numerous music groups operating regularly in the Anglo-Celtic community. These community music groups had strong, established traditions of rehearsal, recruitment and performance that had managed to withstand and also possibly benefit from, the increasingly musically invasive innovations in, and availability of, entertainment media technology such as radio and gramophones. These associated, registered organisations with constitutions, executive officers, rules, bank accounts etc. have provided and continue to provide organised, often sequentially graded music learning and performance opportunities for community members. It needs to be acknowledged that these musical groups were not the beginnings of a musical community in Cairns. Groups had been operating in Cairns since before the turn of the century and many performances were presented by church groups as well as some individual producers (Dawson, 1998). Community music groups were a feature of early Australian townships as Whiteoak (2003, p. 287) notes:

Wind band music has been part of Australian life from the beginning of colonisation. Reed and brass and all-brass bands became central to the fabric of the social and cultural life of a vast number of small and large communities beyond the chief cities.

The brass band movement of British origins, thrived on uniformity to achieve its musical goals. For example the three valve instrument design for all instruments excepting the slide trombone, allowed for ease of acquisition of skills that were transferable to other band instruments as required. Also, all parts were printed in
the treble clef, including the bass instruments, to ensure all members developed the same skills (Whiteoak, 2003). This uniformity extended to the desired composition of each band being 24 male members, similar to the concept that a cricket or rugby team has a certain number of members, each with his own task to fulfil.

Brass band music activity, or ‘banding’, began soon after the white settlement of Cairns in 1876. According to the historian of the Cairns Municipal Band, “Photographic records show the commencement of banding in the late 1880s which has continued in an unbroken line of community and cultural activity since.” (Cairns Municipal Band, 2001) A number of bands operated in Cairns and district throughout the 20th century including The Cairns and Citizens Municipal Brass Band, The Yarrabah Brass Band, The Cairns Concert Band, The Cairns Railway Band, The Cairns Boys’ Band (later to become the Cairns Combined Schools Band), and the visiting Army Concert Band. There was also a Cairns Pipe Band (Highland pipes).

In the early 1930s, the Cairns Citizens Band changed its name to include “51st Battalion” to reflect its association with the local militia. In 1936, this band travelled to New Zealand and won the New Zealand National Championships under the baton of James Compton, said to be “one of Australian’s finest cornet players” (Greaves, 1996, p. 66). Compton was recruited from his role as conductor of the Bondi Beach Concert Band to Cairns to conduct the Cairns band and to teach some of its junior members. The enormity of this international trip and its musical implications were reflected in an article in The Cairns Post in November of 1935.
that included excerpts from a letter from the secretary of the Wellington Brass and Pipe Bands’ Association:

I feel I would be lacking in my duty as the representative of approximately 400 bandsmen in Wellington, if I did not do all in my power to ensure the success of such a courageous undertaking as the visit to New Zealand band contests, and the terrible amount of hard work and self sacrifice that you no doubt have already put in . . .

The Schipke family were, and still are, central to the success story of brass banding in Cairns. Brothers Fred and George Schipke, now both in their 80s, still play the cornet and trombone respectively in Cairns’ bands. Their grandfather was the conductor of the Cooktown Rifle Club Band before moving to Cairns in 1930. As a young boy Fred had lessons on cornet with James Compton.

Plate 2: The 51st Battalion Band marching in Cairns, 1934. Photograph from the Cairns Historical Society collection. City Place, Cairns.

George Schipke, born in 1930, recalled that at his first rehearsal with the Cairns Combined Schools Boys’ Band, he had no idea how to read music or play the trombone: “as you learned to play the instrument, you learned to read music” (Schipke, personal communication, 2011). This band rehearsed under the Schipke family home in Upward St. in the late 1930s. George went on to win Solo Australian Champion of Champions at the national championships in the 1950s while only having limited private lessons on trombone. He has also won Champion Tenor Trombone Solo at the Queensland Band Association competitions in 1952, 54, 58 and 79. Almost all of his learning and development occurred in the band rehearsals. This is a story of a completely developed musician who has been

2 It is possible to hear recordings of both James Compton (1927) and the Cairns’ Citizens Band (1936) on the Soundabout Australia double CD The Great Bands of Australia.
engaged musically at a high level all his life. George came to teaching later in his life when in his 60s, and he is acknowledged by Greg Aitken, Lecturer in Euphonium at the Queensland Conservatorium, as being one of his teachers (Bone & Paull, 2007). The Cairns Boys’ Band provided instruments, sheet music, weekly lessons and rehearsals for a small fee to auditioned recruits from three local State schools.

Plate 3: The Cairns Combined Schools Boys Band in 1936. George Schipke’s older brother Fred, is in the back row, 6\textsuperscript{th} from the left. Fred still plays Principal Cornet with the Cairns Brass Band at 88 years old. He has been an active member of Cairns Brass for 80 years. Photograph from the Cairns Historical Society collection. City Place, Cairns.
Choral Societies provided somewhat more accessible forms of community music making experiences than bands since instruments did not need to be purchased, maintained, taught and practised, and women could also participate. The Cairns Choral Society was formed in 1923 and has maintained an almost unbroken record of activities since that date. Through the 1920s and 30s the Choral Society performed primarily at the North Queensland Eisteddfod as well as staging a “Grand Concert Series” of three concerts in Cairns over a year in association with the Lyric Orchestra. At one of these concerts, a “visiting artist” would perform, often a vocalist or violinist. Such artists were brought to North Queensland by a networked, collaborative effort between the Townsville, Cairns and Charters Towers Choral Societies where the artist would perform at many concerts in a tour of North Queensland. Works on one program in 1933 included an orchestral overture to open each Act, choir items by Parry, Elgar and Davidson, a madrigal by Morley, other duets and solos, and operatic arias and other songs of the era performed by the guest artist Miss Gwladys Evans who was billed as a “Dramatic Soprano from Sydney”.

Plate 4: The Cairns Pipe Band is shown marching in the 1930s. The marching Pipe Band appears to be of adult males in full uniform, complete with band master, spats and sporrans. Photograph from the Cairns Historical Society collection. City Place, Cairns.
Plate 5: Cover of the 1933 Cairns Choral and Orchestral Society Second Grand Concert.

The program is a presentation of “serious” music taken from the art music canon that required a high degree of skill and preparation and would not have been viewed as light entertainment. Miss Evans’ final bracket of songs by Hughes of settings of nursery rhymes may have been the lightest musical offering for the evening.

Plate 6: Cairns Choral Society, Women’s Chorus, 1934 with Mr. Victor Ennis, conductor. Photograph from the Cairns Historical Society collection. City Place, Cairns.
Plate 6 is a formal photograph that shows adult women in similar but not identical white dresses, black shoes and haircuts. As with the brass bands, the wearing of a uniform or uniform type of clothing was a feature of community music performance groups that helped to promote a strong sense of identity.

At the same time, community orchestras were also functioning in Cairns. The Cairns Post reported in 1924 of the Lyric Orchestra that “the orchestra will exist for the sole purpose of giving assistance at public functions and at entertainments in aid of deserving institutions.”

Plate 7: The Cairns Lyric Orchestra, portrait in 1950 Symphony Concerts program.

The Cairns Amateur Operatic Society was formed in 1928 by Mr. Victor Ennis for “the purpose of producing Musical Comedy, firstly to educate, secondly to assist charity.” (Dawson, 1998, p. 91) It is interesting to note that the first reason for producing musical comedy was seen to be for community education rather than entertainment. The Lyric Operatic Society operated during the 1930s and finished around or before 1937 with the Cairns Operatic Society operating somewhat in competition with it. In a promotional article in The Cairns Post in May, 1935, for an upcoming Cairns Choral and Orchestral Society Third Subscriber’s Concert, the supporting orchestra was described as being comprised of “young players, many of these are following in their parents’ footsteps and making music their hobby.” This indicates strong family commitment to community music.

Community music was supported by the ongoing work of private instrumental teachers. Private teachers taught students in their own homes or in hotel lounges during school lunch hours, before and after school, and on weekends on a weekly basis for a negotiated fee. Private teaching was not regulated in any way with a teacher’s reputation being built from successful outcomes in Australian Music Examinations Board (AMEB) and other boards’ examinations and Eisteddfods.
Like the AMEB, the Eisteddfod movement regulated and defined formal music education, but through the competition of community ensemble and solo public performances. Eisteddfods were administered by committees under a Constitution as music festivals. The committee oversaw events, selected repertoire that was linked with graded standards of performance, organised adjudicators and set rules and procedures. The AMEB and Eisteddfod movement relied heavily on the work of the private, suburban music teachers noted earlier, who were, and continue to be, central to the workings of these organisations. Eisteddfods began in North Queensland in 1888 when the first “Musical and Literary Festival Eisteddfod” was held in Charters Towers, at that time Queensland’s second largest city. The North Queensland Eisteddfod Council was formed in 1921 to oversee annual competitions staged at Easter and which, as far as road and weather conditions would allow, rotated the event among the townships of Charters Towers, Ayr, Townsville, Innisfail and Cairns. This tradition is still enacted today. In February 1924, the Cairns Post commented that “inter city competition of this kind will tend more than anything to raise the standard of music in Cairns, and with it add considerably to the social amenities of life in the Far North.” Winners were noted in the local press.

The Objects of the Constitution of The Eisteddfod Council of Queensland in 1939 were:

(a) The promotion and regulation of Eisteddfodau in Queensland.
(b) To foster and promote in every worthy manner the love of music, art and literature.
(c) To establish scholarships of bursaries to aid the development of musical, artistic and literary talent.

Points of interest in the 1939 Cairns program are that the Welsh National Anthem was to be sung at the commencement of each session of the Eisteddfod and that all performers, excepting conductors and accompanists, must be amateurs (Eisteddfod program, 1939). The level and breadth of community involvement and interest in the Eisteddfod can be gauged by the number of advertisements in the official programme for teachers, accompanists, beauty shops, hat shops, dance and drama studios and more. Eminent and successful musicians were engaged to travel to North Queensland to take on the role of adjudicators, thus maintaining links with musical society in metropolitan centres.
Music and religious ritual are deeply connected in almost all cultures. By the 1930s in Cairns, there were many churches operating regularly. Church services, Masses and special events, all contained a musical element to some degree. An article in the Cairns Post of October 19, 1929, described the music provided at a Pontifical High Mass at St. Monica’s Cathedral on the occasion of the laying of the foundation stone for St. Augustine’s College: “The choir, under the baton of Miss Eileen O’Hara, B.A., L.A.B., rendered Gounod’s Convent Mass. Mr. A. W. McManis was the organist and Mr. R. Ryan rendered the chanting.” Gounod’s Convent Mass would provide a major challenge to any SATB choir (Soprano, Alto, Tenor, Bass) and would require clear direction and reasonably skilled choristers to present such a work.

In 1938, the combined choirs of the Central Methodist Church and St. Andrews Church presented a performance of “The Messiah”. As with the Choral Societies’ Grand Concerts, the combining of community groups assisted in providing the necessary numbers and expertise to produce large scale works under the direction of a single conductor.
Plate 9: Cover of the program for the Central Methodist Church “The Messiah” 1938.

It is apparent that the combined choirs were to present the whole of this well known and popular oratorio that requires complex, four part singing, and vocal solos along with competent organ playing. This would have been a major project that would have required great commitment in time and energy to prepare from all those involved. A member of this choir recalled that she was occupied every night of the week and all weekend in some form of community music making (Kelly, personal communication, 2010). From the presentation of such works, it is obvious that the collective community desire to present complex liturgical works was present. Without recordings of these choirs to refer to, it is almost impossible to determine the standard of performance that was reached.

However, the fact that there were conductors, singers, instrumentalists and others who were prepared to work towards presenting such music, that copies of the sheet music had to exist in Cairns, and that there was enough common cultural knowledge familiar with the genre reveals that the culture of liturgical singing was quite advanced and widespread. Churches also ran junior choirs that provided a steady stream of choristers into the adult choirs. A photo of the St. Andrews Presbyterian Church Junior Choir in 1935 shows Reverend Smith as the conductor.
The music activities of the Anglo-Celtic community were in essence, transplanted structures from traditional Anglo-European cultures. Modes of transmission tended towards the analytic and literate except perhaps in the case of the young recruits to the Boy’s Band who were forced to learn by immersion, therefore tending towards holistic and aural learning styles when they began rehearsing (Schippers, 2010, p.136). Continuing this trend sees musical interactions that were strongly gendered and highly organised with long-term goals as seen in the male only brass bands and lengthy rehearsal periods required to present *The Messiah* and major concerts.

**Aboriginal communities**

In contrast to the static, monocultural and notation-based type of transmission which best describes most Anglo-Celtic music teaching and learning styles, Aboriginal groups in Cairns largely used aural/oral teaching and learning processes. At the Lyons St. Aboriginal settlement, a photograph from the 1940s shows players posing in playing position and holding a clarinet, three guitars of which two are held horizontally, a banjo mandolin, and a button accordion. There is one woman in the middle with no instrument, identified by Bill Ellwood as a missionary\(^3\), and a range of ages present. George Skeene (2008, p. 39), growing up in the Lyons St. Aboriginal reserve remembered:

\(^3\) Bill Ellwood is an Irikandji man living in Cairns.
Grandad Harry played the piano accordion and harmonica. My father played the guitar, the accordion, banjo mandolin, steel guitar, ukulele and harmonica. My father taught Mick and me to play the guitar and banjo mandolin... we never read music, we played by ear.

George recalled being taught English songs and dances at school along with lessons on reading music but he “never picked it up” (Skeene, personal communication, 2011).

Retired Bishop James Leftwich (Leftwich, personal communication, 2011) recalled that music was an integral part of community and church life in the Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander community he grew up in during the 1940s and 1950s:

Aunty [learned to play the accordion] at Bible college in Brisbane, she then taught the other Aunty Joan. Uncle Kevin just picked it up. A lot of people were playing those instruments at social engagements, in the church, steel guitar, accordion, ukeleles, mandolins. They were quite keen and good with it. I don’t remember anyone getting taught by any professionals, they played by ear, there was no sheet music.

Interestingly there was no Indigenous cultural practice allowed in his church even though it was run and attended by Aboriginal people. If Aboriginal people wanted to sing and dance their traditional songs and dances, this was done on special social or recreation days. While the music groups within the Aboriginal community were not formal like European music groups, their constant musical interactions in a variety of family, social and religious settings were integral to this community’s music learning and teaching processes. Such processes related more to holistic
and aural modes of transmission than to segmented, sequential, notation based teaching and learning.

Torres Strait Islander communities

Prior to World War II, the first migration to Cairns from the Torres Strait had occurred on only a small scale. Many of Cairns’ Torres Strait Islanders lived in a small community about a kilometre away from the centre of town called Malaytown, which does not exist today. Malaytown was where most non white residents of Cairns lived, including also South Sea Islanders, ‘Hindus’, Chinese, Japanese, Jamaicans, Filipinos and some Aborigines (Hodes, 1998). Facilities and infrastructure such as electricity supply at Malaytown were not as sophisticated as in Cairns city and it was a place free from official European surveillance, creating a relaxed tropical ambience. Much informal music making happened in the unique community atmosphere that prevailed there. Pearling and trochus boats came to Cairns and the crews would visit Malaytown, much as they did at the nearby mission settlement of Yarrabah, and spend the evenings dancing and singing. “The music and songs and the beating of the drums, mostly on kerosene tins created a very happy atmosphere. Even the white people who lived in Bunda and Kenny streets would wander down to listen and watch.”(Guivarra, 1996, p.4) Malaytown was a geographically, socially and culturally separate area from Cairns and many Cairns residents were not aware that it existed.

Plate 12: Malaytown on a tributary of the Cairns inlet in the 1930s. Photograph from the Cairns Historical Society collection. City Place, Cairns.
Writer, unionist, female liberationist, traveller, Communist Party member and activist, Jean Devanney wrote about the dynamic music making at Malaytown in 1938:

The natives’ orchestra supplied the best dance music in Cairns. Its rhythm was an incitement, its personnel intriguing. A grand orchestra for dancing beneath tropical skies! The melody was pure and true as a bell. Music for sensuous and languorous dancing, the waltz time always in the Italian beat...the accordion, the clarinet, the guitars and violins. (Devanney, 1944, p.69)

This quote describes an intriguing intercultural musical scene where displaced Torres Strait Islanders are playing European dance music on European instruments in remote tropical North Queensland. In her unpublished memoire, Nancy Guivarra recalled:

Most Saturday nights, dances would be held . . . and the whole community would gather there to dance to the lively music; supplied by the Jacobs and Pitt families. We had Benny Jacobs on the turtle back mandolin, Doug Jacobs on the steel guitar, also Tom Guivarra, Francis Guivarra on the banjo mandolin and Arthur Pitt on the Spanish guitar. Now and again the boys would switch and play Spanish. It was here I learned to dance (waltz) and sing some beautiful songs. And it was here the Pitt sisters, (Dulcie, Sophie and Heather) made their singing debut singing “Pidgin English Hula”. (Guivarra, 1998, pp 1-2)

Douglas Pitt, a former resident of Yarrabah, was a noted musician who played in the Yarrabah Brass Band as well as singing and playing the accordion. His daughters, Heather, Dulcie and Sophie and son Wally, formed a singing group called The Harmony Sisters who became popular on a national scale. After successful performances in Sydney in 1944, the group disbanded with Dulcie then adopting the stage name of Georgia Lee. She continued her singing career to become an international performer and recording artist who was to become the first Indigenous Australian to record a full LP record (Walker, 2000). Dulcie Pitt’s niece, Wilma Reading, who spent her childhood in Cairns, has also performed and recorded internationally in an extraordinary career covering several decades. She is now living and teaching music in Cairns (Australian Broadcasting Corporation, 2011). These are clear examples of how the dynamic community music making of Malaytown laid the foundations for future music making at national and international levels.

The second wave of migration occurred in 1942 when some of the Torres Strait Islands were evacuated. All women and children were forced to leave Thursday, Horn and Hammond Islands due to the imminent threat of warfare, while most of the men remained behind and enlisted. A third migration wave was to occur from the 1950s onwards. It was the evacuations of 1942 that would accelerate

---

4 There were to be 800 Torres Strait Islander men in the Australian Defence Forces.
intercultural music transmission in Cairns as there were also large numbers of American defence personnel based in Cairns at this time. The American services provided live music performances to boost morale and had bands stationed at major bases along the East coast. In Cairns, the US Services Pacific Band was led by Bob Lyons (Walker, 2000). Many of the Americans had musical skills and played jazz and blues:

The ‘coloured evacuees’ organised their own entertainments to keep their spirits up. With the massive American military presence along the coast, and greater exposure to radio and movies, American, and more especially, Afro-American and hula musical influences were more pervasive than ever (Mullins & Neuenfeldt, 2005, p. 115).

Plate 13: The Tropical Troubadours from Malaytown. Photograph from the Cairns Historical Society collection. City Place, Cairns.

The large music and dance group pictured above were called the Tropical Troubadours and performed in Malaytown in the 1940s. Note the ukuleles, guitars, mandolins, clarinets, banjo-mandolins, grass skirts and laes. The men would provide the instrumental music while the women would sing, dance and also play ukuleles out in front. The Pitt sisters and members of the Guivarra family are in this photo. “Hula” music was regularly performed and developed by Torres Strait
Islanders in Cairns during the war and was influenced by Islander interactions with black American soldiers based in Cairns. Black American soldiers were not permitted to drink in mainstream hotels and therefore socialised with the Islander community in Malaytown. Auntie Mary Bowie, an enforced evacuee from Horn Island to Cairns, remembered hearing black American soldiers singing the blues in a striking example of an intercultural, informal, aurally based style of learning:

(We) Learned all by ear, we heard the American soldiers sing, and in the movies, and on the radio. Singing TI (Thursday Island) songs as well “The old TI”. There were weekend dances at a certain house with all the TI people. Played guitars and banjos and got their guitars in Cairns. Everyone knew each other (Bowie, personal communication, 2009).

Conclusion

The formal activities of the Anglo-Celtic bands, orchestras, choral societies and church choirs promulgated, maintained and developed traditional Western musical forms whereas the more informal community music groups in the Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander communities of Cairns and Malaytown showed more openness to musical change than adherence to a static tradition. However such divisions were not exact, with some formal music groups demonstrating informal learning processes and vice versa. The formal groups were inclined to the standard, inherited musical canon while the Indigenous informal groups appear to have been more experimental across a range of styles. Learning was more likely to be holistic and aural among the Indigenous groups, with little formal authority recognised in teaching, as opposed to the highly stratified authority inherent in the AMEB/Eisteddfod model except where members of the Indigenous church were required to learn church songs in English.

Two significant features emerge from the operations and successes of the community music groups mentioned in this article. The first is that leading roles were played by influential outsider experts such as Compton and the American soldiers, who facilitated and provided engaging pedagogies in music making processes, and the second is that local, well known musical families such as the Schipkes and the Pitts, with several generations involved, provided sustained high quality contributions to the activities of the community.

Cairns today has a vibrant community music culture that exhibits remarkably similar traits to those documented in this paper and identified by Bartleet et al (2008). New community groups such as junior choirs and string orchestras, and the staging of community music workshops in a range of 21st century styles, run by the government agencies for youth, Indigenous peoples and others, have appeared. School music education practices have developed profoundly since the 1920s yet community music groups continue to play an influential, educational and forming role in the development and lives of musicians, young and old in Cairns.
References


Cairns Eisteddfod Program. (1939). Cairns.


Central Methodist Church. (1938) *The Messiah.* Cairns.


Marist Brothers’ College. (1929, October 19). *The Cairns Post,* p.5.


All Photographs and Programs sourced from the Cairns Historical Society
Ethics approval to research with Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islanders has been obtained from governing University.
David Salisbury: James Cook University

“I Can’t Get No Satisfaction”: An inquiry into “Thematic Communication” as a motivation approach to encourage students continuing music after it is no longer compulsory.

Abstract

The paper builds on research by Hartwig (2003), Lowe (2008 and 2010) and Wise (2010) that establishes the issues in declining numbers of students taking up music after year eight compulsory classroom music. The data for this enquiry is based on a Townsville secondary school as a case study and develops a qualitative and quantitative analysis of what motivates students to continue music after year eight.

After a series of elicitation interviews with students a survey is constructed, based on “Persuasive Communication Theory” or “Theory of Planned Behaviour” as outlined by Ajzen (1991) as well as Ham et al. (2009). These results are then coded and analyzed within the categories of “Behavioural Beliefs”, “Normative Beliefs” and “Control Beliefs”.

The survey results showed that some of the issues that concerned students were the complexity of advanced music studies, busy schedules and the usefulness of music for their future career path.

The outcome of this analysis enables the development of a “Thematic Communication” approach that may influence year eight students to continue music in years 9 – 12.

Introduction

When I'm drivin' in my car
and that man comes on the radio
and he's tellin' me more and more
about some useless information
supposed to fire my imagination.

(Excerpt from I Can’t Get No Satisfaction copyright Jagger and Richards)

The above lyrics point to an obvious response by students in almost any classroom across Australia but especially a music classroom where in many ways the deluge of information about the inner workings of music may even be an intrusion on a contested territory as most students would be possessive or even defensive about their favorite music of choice.

This is something Lucy Green points to when discussing the “entanglement of musical meaning, values and experiences” (Green, 2006). There is a sense of ownership in students of their music. This friction may even be more exaggerated if the teacher is using contemporary or popular music examples as a window or lure.
in the hope of bringing students to learn to appreciate a more meaningful music
namely classical music (Green, 2006)

Hartwig makes the point that although music lessons should be an enjoyable
experience many students have a negative view of classroom music and choose
not to take music electives in their senior years of high school (Hartwig, 2003).  
Lowe furthers this argument when describing expectancy judgments that he
encountered when surveying students in year eight classes in West Australia.  He
breaks them down into four categories of expectancies: academic; physical; social
and general.  Students make judgments on their ability to ‘understand the musical
concepts’ and if they are ‘physically able to undertake this task’.  Whether they are
‘capable of interacting with others’ and will they ‘succeed in completing learning
activities’ (Lowe, 2008).  In a more recent article Lowe states:

   One of the difficulties encountered by music teachers is that many students
enrolling in lower secondary class music programs lack the skills to engage
in practical learning activities at a meaningful level (Lowe, 2011, in press).

Lowe also refers to the 2005 National Review:

   For many students, class music experiences in primary school may have
been limited to generic musical activities such as choir and in many
instances, may be reflective of no formal class music experiences at all
(Lowe 2007, pg. 4).

This is reinforced by Lowes findings when he states in his discussion:

   This study revealed that Year 8 student valuing of class music learning
activities declined over the course of the year.  Of the three values
components, the interest component declined the most, indicating that
students were not largely enjoying the learning activities being presented.  A
strong cause inferred from student focus groups was a high level of
theoretical, notation based written learning activities, which students often
described as too challenging, irrelevant, of little interest and of little use,
largely regardless of how these activities were presented by music teachers
(Lowe, 2008b, pg. 8).

When discussing the Queensland “Arts Syllabus Years 1 to 10” delivered initially in
2003 Hartwig points out that the syllabus focuses “on an outcomes based
philosophy” in which there are three main outcomes of being able to recognize,
produce and notate music does not include the “words ‘create’ and ‘listen’ and
there is no mention of other types of scores or representations of music and
“computer music technology”.  She goes on to state:

   I believe that for those music teachers who insist on teaching the theory of
music, as in the Silent Music Room, with little or no time for “music making”
the new Arts Syllabus [the music component] will do nothing to change the
style and content of their teaching (Hartwig, 2003, p81).
So how do teachers make the ‘boring’ bits of music more interesting and enjoyable? Wise reports that while teachers he surveyed still looked at traditional Western Art Music as an important part of their teaching strategies they also recognized the use of technology in the classroom allowed “students to use their own particular aural skills to respond to set tasks” (Wise, 2010). The important point here is that there is the acknowledgement that students have skills they bring to the classroom acquired outside of school.

Lowe (2008) reports that only 2.8% of West Australian students choose to study music as an elective after year 8 which is comparable to the situation in the rest of Australia. This introduction shows the reasons why this is the case which then leads onto the question - is the decline in the number of students choosing to continue with their music education important?


> It is obvious that proficiency in music must be taught and learned. Not so obvious but equally true is that meaningful appreciation of and participation in music must be taught and learned as well. Thus the full worth of music demands music education as its natural counterpart.

In other words if we as a society want to fully celebrate and engage in music, we need to ensure that our schools are equipping students with the tools to continue our musical heritage.

It is important to understand the reasons for the decline in student numbers to be able to address the issues and reverse the current trend. Therefore the aim of this study is to survey year 8 students to find out what factors motivate or discourage students to continue their music education in years 9 and above. Based on these survey results a “Thematic Communication” approach can be developed that may encourage students to continue music in years 9 – 12.

**Methodology**

In psychology, the theory of planned behaviour is a theory about the link between attitudes and behaviour. It was proposed by Icek Ajzen as an extension of the theory of reasoned action (Ajzen, 1991). It is one of the most predictive persuasion theories. It has been applied to studies of the relations among beliefs, attitudes, behavioural intentions and behaviours in various fields such as advertising, public relations, advertising campaigns and healthcare. There are three main areas of beliefs that influence people’s decision-making process:

Behavioural Beliefs – A person’s belief that behaviour leads to certain results and his or her evaluation of these results.

Normative Beliefs – A person’s belief that specific individuals or groups think her or she should or should not perform the behaviour and his or motivation to comply with their wishes.
Control Beliefs – A person’s belief that certain factors either facilitate or inhibit performance of the behaviour and his or her assessment of the degree to which each makes the behaviour easy or difficult.

Figure 1 Theory of planned behaviour model (Ham et al., S. et al, 2009)

The first objective is to establish what questions will represent each of these three areas of belief. The manual of Persuasive Communication Theory says:

… you probably could sit at your desk and come up with your own list of beliefs for most behaviours, or you could possibly generate a list of beliefs based on somebody else’s research. But experience shows that doing either of these would be a mistake (Ham et al., 2009, p13).

The answer is to go directly to the target group to get the base information you need. In order to establish the questions on the survey I first conducted an elicitation interview with a sample of year eight students. I initially intended to survey four schools but was only able to survey one of the four so this represents a preliminary outcome. My interviews were with a group of year 8 students at one of the schools.

I first asked some general questions about their consumption of music and how often and what duration they listened to music as well as the type of music and
what playback device they used. Next I asked questions that were more directly related to their behavioural beliefs about taking music after year 8 broken into the three categories of Behavioural, Normative and Control beliefs:

**Behavioural Belief Questions**

1. What do you see as the advantage or good things that could occur by taking music after year 8?
2. What do you see as the disadvantage or bad things that could occur by taking music after year 8?

**Normative Belief Questions**

3. Who (individuals or groups whose opinions you consider personally influential) do you think would support or approve of you taking music after year 8?
4. Who (individuals or groups whose opinions you consider personally influential) do you think would object or disapprove of you taking music after year 8?

**Control Belief Questions**

5. What factors or circumstances enable or make it easy for you to take up music after year 8?
6. What factors or circumstances make it difficult for you to take up music after year 8?

The outcomes of the interviews were then collated into a spreadsheet in order to identify commonalities in the replies. The table below presents the findings:
Table 1 Elicitation Interview Results

Note that there are the two categories of Compliers and Non-Compliers, this represents students who indicated they intend to take music after year 8 and those who intended not to. In question 6 there was no single answer that stood out but answers 2, 4, 7 & 9 all have the connection of time constraints. Even answer 1 and 5 have some relation to this concern. Answers 3 and 10 are clearly about the potential degree of difficulty in upper levels of music or a lack of confidence of the student’s sense of their ability to succeed in the class.

The next step is to design a questionnaire that reflects these results and focuses on the belief strength and evaluation for behavioural beliefs; belief strength and
motivation to comply for normative beliefs and belief strength and power for control beliefs.

**Behavioural Beliefs**

*Overall I think taking music after year 8 would be:*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Not Very Beneficial</th>
<th>Very Beneficial</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Learning more about music after year 8 is:*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Good</th>
<th>Bad</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>+3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Normative Beliefs**

*I believe my parents and friends think:*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I Should Not</th>
<th>Should</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Take music after year 8*

*When it comes to doing what my parents and friends think, taking music after year 8 is:*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Not At All Important To Me</th>
<th>Very Important To Me</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>+3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Control Beliefs**

*Overall I think taking music after year 8 is easier if it does not conflict with other subjects or activities:*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Extremely Likely</th>
<th>Extremely Unlikely</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*The more complicated music becomes and having a busy schedule makes taking music after 8:*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>More Difficult For Me</th>
<th>Less Difficult For Me</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>-3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>+3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Ham et al. states in his manual that it is problematic if you deliver the survey in the original order with the values aligned equally from left to right so I reordered my questions. The more complicated music becomes and having a busy schedule makes taking music after 8:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>More Difficult</th>
<th>Less Difficult</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>For Me ______</td>
<td>For Me ______</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

I believe my parents and friends think:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I Should Not</th>
<th>Should</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>______</td>
<td>______</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Take music after year 8

Overall I think taking music after year 8 is easier if it does not conflict with other subjects or activities:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Extremely Likely</th>
<th>Extremely Unlikely</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>______</td>
<td>______</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Learning more about music after year 8 is:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Good</th>
<th>Bad</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>______</td>
<td>______</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When it comes to doing what my parents and friends think, taking music after year 8 is:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Not At All Important</th>
<th>Very Important</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To Me ______</td>
<td>To Me ______</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall I think taking music after year 8 would be:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Not Very Beneficial</th>
<th>Very Beneficial</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>______</td>
<td>______</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2 below displays the results of the year eight survey with (n=42).
### YEAR EIGHT RESPONSES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>BB S</th>
<th>BB E</th>
<th>BB CP</th>
<th>NB S</th>
<th>NB MTC</th>
<th>NB CP</th>
<th>CB S</th>
<th>CB P</th>
<th>CB CP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>R1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>-3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>-2</td>
<td>-12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>-2</td>
<td>-10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>-2</td>
<td>-12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>-9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-2</td>
<td>-4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-2</td>
<td>-2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R10</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>-5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R11</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-2</td>
<td>-6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R12</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>-6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R13</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R14</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R15</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R16</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>-2</td>
<td>-12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R17</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R18</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>-12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R19</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R20</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R21</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>-15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R22</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>-9</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R23</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R24</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R25</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-2</td>
<td>-4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>-12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R26</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-2</td>
<td>-6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R27</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R28</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>-4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>-4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R29</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-2</td>
<td>-8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R30</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>-3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R31</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R32</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>-18</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R33</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>-18</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R34</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R35</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R36</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-2</td>
<td>-8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R37</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>-3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R38</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-2</td>
<td>-8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R39</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>-3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-1</td>
<td>-4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R40</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R41</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The key to the column abbreviations is:

BB = Behavioural Belief; S = Strength; E = Evaluation; CP = Cross-Product; NB = Normative Belief; MTC = Motivation to Comply; CB = Control Belief; P = Power.

The ranges are 0 to 6 in column one; -3 to +3 in column two; 0 to 18 or 0 to -18 in column three; 0 to 6 in column four; -3 to +3 in column five; 0 to 18 or 0 - -18 in column six; 0 to 6 in column seven; -3 to +3 in column eight and 0 to 18 or 0 to -18 in column nine.

The Cross-Product represents the cumulative scores for the three categories of beliefs. This obtained by the multiplication of each response in each belief area. So if a response in Behavioural Belief has a Strength of 6 and the Evaluation score is +3 the Cross-Product value is 18 out of a scale of 0 – 18. This is the score that represents the person’s tendency to carry out the behaviour. The more positive the greater the tendency the more negative the lower the tendency.

**Analysis of Survey Data**

A quick look shows that there is mostly a positive response to the survey questions until the area of Control Beliefs that shows some negative response values. The following breakdown illustrates what the findings mean.

**Behavioural Beliefs**

Under the Behavioural Beliefs columns, in terms of belief Strength the results above indicate that 3.62 on a scale of 0 to 6 or over 60% of the students thought taking music would be beneficial and that learning more about music is good 1.69 on a scale of -3 to +3 or a little over 56% in terms of Evaluation response. However, when factored together the Cross-Product produces only 7.79 on a scale of 0 to 18 or a bit over 43% would consider taking music after year 8. So there is some concern that students do not really value learning more about music after year eight.

**Normative Beliefs**

Under the Normative Beliefs column in terms of belief Strength 4.26 on a scale of 0 to 6 or over 70% believed that their parents and friends would think continuing music was good, but in terms of Motivated to Comply only 0.31 on a scale of -3 to +3 or 10% thought that was important to them. So this influenced the Cross-Product considerably with only 3.19 on a scale of 0 to 18 or a little over 17% would have the tendency to carry out the behaviour.

**Control Beliefs**

110
Finally under the Control Beliefs column although 3.76 on a scale of 0 to 6 over 62% thought that in terms of belief Strength taking music after year eight was extremely likely if it did not conflict with other subject choices, in terms of control Power a significant -1.02 on a scale of -3 to +3, over 33.9% (negatively) indicated that the complexity of the musical materials and the conflict of a busy schedule would make taking music after year more difficult resulting in a -3.57 on a scale of 0 to -18 or a 19.81% (negatively) Cross-Product.

Conclusions

Issues have been raised in regards to student's perceptions of classroom music after year eight. Although a high percentage of students, currently in music class, believe that continuing music is good and that their parents and friends would support them the basic problem is the competition of other activities or subjects with some concerned as to whether they would be able to keep up in more advanced levels of music. There are some underlying issues highlighted in this paper such as teachers using only Western Art Music or classical model for the basis of their pedagogy and a lack of technology in the classroom. Many students coming in to a year eight classroom have had negative experiences in music previously and the lack of participation or actual music making is a ‘turn off’ to some students.

In developing a persuasive communication effort the main aim is to make sure the message encourages the target audience to “give considered thought to what you’re saying that is, to elaborate” (Ham et al., 2009). In other words to make them simply think hard about the message when they are processing it in order to consider the pros and cons of complying with the projected behaviour. The main issues raised in the survey were busy schedules, how taking music applies to career paths after school and whether they would be successful in getting good marks in upper level music subjects. To address the findings the Thematic Communication strategy in a year 8 classrooms may be:

- How to balance a busy schedule and still be able to take music
- Taking music broadens a students profile when applying for university places
- Raise student confidence in their abilities to successfully accomplish the requirement of higher-level music

Recommendations

Two recommendations generated by this study include:

- Continue this research with students in other Townsville schools to generate further analytical data
- To create a Thematic communication strategy to encourage students to continue with their music education past year 8.
References


Lowe, G. (2008b, October). *This task is really boring: examining the impact of class music learning activities upon Year 8 music student values*. Paper presented at the XXXth Annual Conference of the Australian and New Zealand Association for Research in Music Education (ANZARME), Melbourne, Australia.


But we had no song: a study of the long-term effects of a staff singing group on the status of music in an early learning program

Abstract

This research has been conducted over a number of years and the aim has been to investigate music and its place in the early childhood program. The current paper reports on aspects of a teachers’ singing group initiative. This initiative was designed to promote the visibility of music across the centre in a way that included specialist and generalist teachers and their different learning contexts. The teachers’ singing group was established in 2008 and was documented as a practitioner driven research project from its inception. Returning to the study was initially prompted by an invitation from the centre’s director who sensed that a number of participants viewed the experience as ‘unfinished business’. We report here on the teacher’s reflections of the singing group and the impact it had on the music program in the early learning centre.

Key words: early learning centre, music program, teachers’ singing group, practitioner research

Introduction

This research has been conducted over a number of years and whilst the aim has always been to investigate music and its place in the early childhood program, the research has had a number of facets. Topics have included children’s musical competence, children’s right to music, the role of the specialist music teacher and this current paper reports on aspects of a teachers’ singing group initiative. This initiative was designed to promote the visibility of music across the centre in a way that included specialist and generalist teachers and their different learning contexts. The teachers’ singing group was established in 2008 and was documented as a practitioner driven research project from its inception. The focus of the research was to seek ways to strengthen the music program by building a community of practice (Lave & Wenger, 1991) with staff sharing experiences with music, sharing repertoire, and developing understanding and awareness of each others musical activities. A major strategy for the singing group project was the plan to culminate in a staff performance for the children. This performance raised strong emotional reactions from the staff, who recorded their feelings about the experience in interviews a number of days after the performance. On the day of the performance the children’s reactions were also strong. It was the emotional strength of the performance, as an event, that has made it into an ongoing story for those involved. In this paper we revisit the teachers’ singing group to explore whether there were long-term effects on the status of music in the program that could be accorded to the singing activity, either directly or indirectly. It is perhaps unusual in a discrete research project to revisit data and participants after so much time has elapsed. Returning to the study was initially prompted by an invitation
from the centre’s director who sensed that a number of participants viewed the experience as ‘unfinished business’.

The emotional impact of the experience of the singing group and of the performance meant these music making activities emerged as a powerful memory for participants in post-performance interviews in 2008 and again in 2010 when the events of two years before were reconsidered. In teasing out possible meanings of the strong emotions that have been expressed, we have considered Wordsworth’s description of the power of recollecting emotion and how this process influences the possibility of regaining the strength of these feelings in a different and more reflective way once they are in the past.

I have said that poetry is the spontaneous overflow of powerful feelings: it takes its origin from emotion recollected in tranquillity: the emotion is contemplated till by a species of reaction the tranquillity gradually disappears, and an emotion, kindred to that which was before the subject of contemplation, is gradually produced, and does itself actually exist in the mind (Wordsworth, 1802 in Bloom & Trilling, 1973: 608).

As stated above, the suggestion to revisit the events of 2008, the singing group, performance and post-performance interviews, came from the centre director, who was under the impression that participants still wanted to explore the potential of the singing activity. Some of the participants wanted to establish, in their own minds, whether the singing initiative had made an impact on the program. Some were considering the idea of re-establishing the group. Having been struck initially by the impact the performance had on the participants, it was decided to reinterview the performers. The narrative that unfolds in this paper is one that has occurred across time; there were actions and events and then reflection. The story itself is embedded in a socio/cultural/historical context in that the actors were engaged in joint cultural activity and co-constructed meanings about music within the centre (Vygotsky, 1978). Greenhalgh et al (2005) suggest these are “defining characteristics of narrative” (p. 443). One of the themes explored in this research is the expression of powerful emotions and this is the rationale for using a literary strategy to describe the research. Wordsworth’s description of an emotional event that can be “recollected in tranquillity” and then return as a powerful, though less immediate, feeling later, is a useful way to shape the discussion as a story. By considering this research to be across three stages and, so far, across two years, we are drawing on a series of events from which we can extract narrative meaning (Bruner, 1991).

In this paper we briefly outline the history of the research, describe the project and identify the theoretical references we used to interpret our data. Implications, conclusions and future directions are discussed.

**The setting**

The site for the research was a university preschool providing an extended hours service for children 3 – 6 years. The centre is located in an inner suburb of a large city and is close to natural and community resources that have been included in
the program, including the music program. The centre has a research, as well as an educational agenda, and employs a number of specialists to develop special projects with the children and families. Music is one area of the program that has a specialist teacher and is also encouraged as part of the generalist program in the children’s home rooms.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Emotional aspects</td>
<td>Events</td>
<td>Theory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outpouring of emotion before reflection. The immediate impact of the staff performance (Wordsworth)</td>
<td>A study of participation in a staff singing group in an early childhood centre</td>
<td>A community of practice (Lave &amp; Wenger, 1991)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Young children and music, constructing meaning through a performance</td>
<td>Belonging and joint activity (Socio-cultural theory drawing on Vygotsky, 1978, Rogoff, 2003 &amp; Dewey, 1934)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Musicking (Small 1999)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Emotional aspects</td>
<td>Events</td>
<td>Theory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The aftermath of the event when the actors are able to reflect on the emotional impact of their actions (Wordsworth)</td>
<td>Post performance interviews with the performers</td>
<td>Depicting emotion and creating narrative meaning (Hogan, 2003)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Positioning theory (Harre &amp; van Langenhove, 1999)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stage 3: 2010</th>
<th>Stage 3: 2010</th>
<th>Stage 3: 2010</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Emotional aspects</td>
<td>Events</td>
<td>Theory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Strong emotion has now become a story of the mind (Wordsworth)</td>
<td>This research: Interviews to study the long-term effects of a staff singing group on the status of music in an early learning centre’s program</td>
<td>Positioning theory (Harre &amp; van Langenhove, 1999)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A community of practice (Lave &amp; Wenger, 1991)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Narrative meaning to past and future events (Hogan, 2003)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1. History of the music project

**The participants**

The centre’s director was a key player, as the instigator of the original singing group project, a member of the singing group and one of the performers who sang for the children. She also suggested revisiting the project. The music specialist had a pivotal role in that she had previously encouraged staff singing in meetings and provided the initial inspiration for a joint music activity. A self selected group of educators – teacher and specialists – made up the singing group and the performers.
The present research

This research was conducted in 2010 and consisted of semi-structured interviews with teachers and specialists who had previously participated in the staff singing group of 2008. This stage of the study involved interviewing the original participants to investigate their perceptions about the long-term effects of the project. The following table presents the three identifiable chapters of the singing group story. In the first column the stages of the events are linked to the emotional side of the story. The middle column lists the events themselves and the third column indicates the theoretical references we have used to describe the experiences of the participants.

Almost two years had elapsed before the director suggested the singing group and the events of 2008 be studied again. Memory of the initiative was still strong amongst the staff; some wanted to restart the singing sessions and two staff members, no longer at the centre, expressed an interest in returning to the centre to be interviewed and discuss the experience. One of these staff members was the music specialist.

Three interrelated theoretical frames are used to discuss the dynamics and activities of the singing group. These are the concept of socially constructed relationships within a specific context (Harre & van Langenhove, 1999), the significance of participation (Lave & Wenger, 1991) and lessons about emotion and positioning that can be gained from literature on narrative form (Hogan, 2003). The participants in the research were protagonists in that they voluntarily participated and actively positioned themselves in the activity. There was constant grouping and regrouping as participants decided on the role they would play in, for instance; leading or supporting parts/harmonies, proposing songs, supporting song choice, their level of engagement with individual songs, voicing opinions and decisions about attendance.

The first interviews, in 2008, indicated the singers had a number of motivations when they chose to participate in the group. Their strong emotional responses to events were voiced in a variety of ways, with different reasons given in the explanations of what the experience had meant for each one. The concept of positioning (Harre & van Langenhove, 1991) complements the idea of a community of practice (Lave & Wenger, 1999) and can also be seen to belong to a narrative expression of experience, since events have meaning in the past, present and future (Hogan, 2003). The singing group was a learning community. This was an activity that could only exist as a group endeavour, and the staff had a shared purpose, a domain and a shared repertoire. This was a situation of co-construction of knowledge through shared activity (Leon’tiev, 1978). The following section summarises the interview data from 2010.

The interviews – the following are précis of the interviews

To support the staff in positioning themselves in relation to the performance and its growth as a narrative within the centre, interview questions resembled those used in the first interviews conducted in the immediately after the performance. Staff could clearly recall the strength of their feelings and most said they would welcome
a return of the singing group. Four questions on the impact of the singing group and performance were added to the interview schedule. Participants were asked: did the practice of singing to the children effect visibility and significance of music in the centre program; did the singing group encourage more singing in the rooms; how did the children respond to teachers singing to them; and did the singing group help strengthen links between the specialist music space and the classrooms? The interviews were semi-structured and interviewees were invited to reflect and answer at length. In some instances lengthy answers were given that also potentially answered other questions. Probe questions were used where necessary. Questions had been submitted ahead of time and two participants came with lengthy and comprehensive notes.

The director’s interview

The title of the paper has been taken from the director’s interview as she reflected on the impact of the singing group. She thought that in 2009, the year following the singing and the performance for the children, the ‘heart’ had gone out of the idea of shared singing within the program. She thought this might have been due to a lack of shared repertoire, which had been one of the outcomes of the singing group. As someone in a leadership position in the centre she also used terms like ‘social capital’ and ‘dollar return’. The latter referred to the effectiveness of the singing project in developing staff confidence and energy, far more successful, she thought, than paying for a commercial in-service activity. She described the music singing group as a ‘community of practice’ and regretted the ‘limited evidence of singing the following year’. She recalled that during an assembly in 2009 she suggested that staff and children should sing a song together, but they discovered as she said, “We had no song”. For her there had been an immediate excitement with the singing group in 2008 but this had not carried on into the following year. She was not sure a new group could be established and also expressed some caution, in that the initial group had created unexpected exclusions amongst staff because of the staff members who had chosen not to participate.

The music specialist’s interview

The music specialist had been the group leader during the singing group project and thought music had found a reference point and been more visible in the centre during the time of the group. She expressed the idea that setting up the singing group as a research project had probably been necessary as an initial impetus but would not be needed again, and if it were to be repeated it should be less formal in nature. As the music specialist and the group music leader she also wanted to find a place for her own relationship to music within the project. She wanted to express her personal vision, ‘not just about singing – I want to bring what inspires me’. Success was measured in the act of sharing, ‘people had songs in their heads’ and a possible future direction would be a ‘vision of a music culture that would involve families, community and outside musicians’. This was a complex answer, a concept that would require time and possibly the development of a new culture about music and participation within the centre if such ideas were to find a philosophical place.
The educators’ interviews (specialists and teachers)

The educators agreed on a number of points. They felt they had gained confidence and an ability to be more spontaneous with their use of song, and they enjoyed the shared repertoire. They were amazed at the children’s response to the staff performance for the children; ‘children thought we had the roles back to front’. All would welcome the return of the staff singing group. Although most mentioned that the group had been set up with a research purpose, they did identify with the distinction made by the music specialist about the singing group being practitioner research initially that could become a less formal arrangement in the future. The educators acknowledged the research agenda, but none mentioned research in relation to a future singing group.

In addition to the common ground described above, a number of individuals expressed additional thoughts about benefits of the group. One thought the isolation between rooms had broken down, another started to use her voice and improvise in ways not previously apparent in her practice, one enjoyed the act of singing together and one said spontaneously making up contextual songs with children was more ‘my type of singing’. These points illustrated how some educators’ practices had changed because of the singing group. For these individuals there was an on-going effect of the singing group that some could still appreciate. They were also the educators who were most enthusiastic about revisiting the experience and did not appear to have the reservations of the director, or the desire to go further, in a slightly different direction, as expressed by the music specialist.

Discussion

In this discussion section we use the idea of positioning (Harre & van Langenhove, 1999) as an analytical tool to describe changing perceptions of participation across time. We therefore look at how participants positioned themselves at the beginning of the experience, how others in the group view themselves in relation to the position taken, did the person re-position themselves in relation to others as time elapsed and was there a redefinition of the person’s perception of the project. We also consider the extent to which the activity might be considered a community of practice. (Note – this could go at the top of this para, if the positioning is part of the notion of c of p

The Director’s interview

The Director’s position was a complex one in that she also saw herself in a clearly defined role as opposed to a self-selected position (Turner, 2001). She was Director, leader and to a certain extent the protagonist. Her reflections are therefore more in relation to the impact on the centre, staff morale and on the creation of “social capital” within the workplace. The initial position of the Director was layered. She was the Director and therefore in a position of responsibility, she was a member of the singing group and tried to position herself as one of the group following the specialists lead, she shared the excitement of the experience. The relationship with the specialist was the position where there was a need to
negotiate with the other. The role of Director did not fit easily with being one of the
paragraph. The suggestion of ownership is also extant in her comments and the title of
the paper refers to the result of the Director asking that staff and children sing a
song in assembly the year following the singing group. Whilst trying hard to be a
member of the group the role of director becomes dominant in her forced self-
positioning and could be seen even in the performance that occurred at the end of
the initial project. At this assembly she directed the proceedings and also did a solo
performance. In the final interview she has re-positioned mainly through the role of
Director and now comments on the value of the group but would not necessarily
welcome re-visiting the experience as the outcomes for the centre as a whole were
mixed.

Perhaps what the director’s interview indicates is that she was always aware of her
role, she did not need to appropriate power as she never moved beyond the formal
fixed role she saw herself in and therefore her positioning was mainly on the
interpersonal level of social and public action. This provides a context for the other
participants.

The music specialist’s interview

The music specialist gave a more complex view of the music group and how she
had positioned herself within it. That she had not been a protagonist in the
beginning she acknowledged and thought the outside idea of a research project
was a necessary impetus. The role she took as the music specialist was one of
advocacy for the music. She expressed a desire for a less formal arrangement.
This would lead to very different dynamics and possible power shifts. The music
specialist was the designated music leader and this led to forced self-positioning as
others were dependent on her skills. However, her reflective comments in the final
interview also reveal a person with a strong personal vision. She did have a desire
to reposition herself within the music and the shared experience of music. This
would require a redistribution of rights and duties in regards music within the
centre.

The educators’ interviews

The educator’s were volunteers in an existing project. There were similarities in
some of the interview responses. Their reflections were on a more immediate level
than either the Director or music specialist. They commented on enjoyment, the
children and the repertoire itself. Most would welcome another singing group in the
centre. The changes in positioning that occurred across time were described
largely as benefits to the centre. A material outcome was that most described how
there own individual practices had been changed by the experience.

The above descriptions of the interviews using the notion of how each positioned
themselves in relation to the singing project has indicated three very different
approaches from the staff members involved. The Director never moves out of her
perceived role as the leader and manager and although a part of the singing group,
does not comment on her participation at an individual level. Her perception of
herself is that she is responsible for the group, she has directed the agenda and
reflection revolves around intended and unintended consequences. In contrast, the
music specialist is concerned about the music in the centre and her own personal
vision for music. Her reflections include changes that occurred at the time and what
she would envisage in an ideal future. Motivation, formality and more fluid and
inclusive taking of responsibility for the music are suggested in her comments. The
educators were grouped together because their approach to the singing group, as
reflected in the interviews, made this possible. For this group there was a
suggestion that some felt personally empowered in their daily practice. Most would
repeat the initiative and there was a sense that benefits of the group were still felt
in some areas.

**General discussion**

The director’s initial vision of the singing group was that it would encourage the
development of a community of practice. Wenger (1998), suggests that a
community of practice is characterized by a group of people who choose to learn
together in a field in which they have a common interest. Participants meet in order
to develop skills and knowledge, in a collegiate fashion. The group’s members
should develop the kind of relationship that allows them to learn together and, as a
result, they should develop shared experiences, mutual resources, ideas and
stories. In a successful community of practice group members develop a shared
practice through participation and learning in the social context. This was the kind
of enterprise the centre’s director had in mind for the staff singing group.

The interviews from two years after the initial interviews suggests all participants
had recollected aspects of the experience that indicate that the community of
practice had some lasting benefits. However, it is interesting to note that at this
stage all identified with their formal roles within the centre and work relationships,
not necessarily in evidence during rehearsals, were now defining features of the
retrospective reports from the staff. The community of practice had a joint purpose
that was shared and the group, together, developed a common repertoire of
songs which they all considered a valued resource. Wenger (1998) might
recognise this as participants developing skills and knowledge together. The notion
of shared repertoire operates at different levels. At a purely practical level, the
shared song repertoire allowed teachers to learn and practice new songs
accurately in a supportive environment, a circumstance likely to reinforce their
willingness to sing these songs with the children in their own rooms, integrating
songs into their own program. In this regard, the singing group, operating as a
community of practice, helped the music program in a very practical way.

A number of the educators recollected that their practice regarding singing with the
children in their rooms had been influenced positively, at least for a time after the
experience. The ways in which these teachers changed their practice differed.
The nature of this experience ensured that each of these individuals was free to
work out for themselves how they might use singing and music with the children as
part of their program; it is possible to speculate that this is a more powerful
response than might have resulted from a more formal in-service singing activity,
foocussing on teaching practice options.
The experience of singing together, of making music together, was powerful. All participants recollected the emotional impact of singing together, and of performing together, particularly for the children. The benefits of singing are, in a sense, self-evident. Singing is a universally characteristic human activity, as a vehicle for culture, and with a significant role in ceremonies and as a means of expressing communal and individual heightened emotional states (Unwin et al, 2002). Hargreaves and North (1999) suggest that the social functions of music in everyday life relate to the domains of self identity, interpersonal relationships and mood. For the teachers, shared recollections of the experience of making music together as staff members, along with the recollections of the performance as a ‘gift’ they, as teachers, were able to give the children, were both shared memories and shared emotional resources. In a professional context, this might be particularly valued by virtue of its being unusual.

Implications

During the life of the singing group there was the opportunity to step into a special shared community space during singing practices. Usual roles and responsibilities were set aside. In the everyday the Director would be seen as responsible for the centre as a whole, the music specialist is expected to bring music to the children and the educators had either their own specialisations, or were responsible for general programs on their own room, which might, or might not, include music. Role delineation is a possible reason why the Director perceived the need for a musical community of practice to break down some of these role boundaries. The shared repertoire that came out of the enterprise was valued but not sustainable once the shared practice space was no longer available when the project was finished.

This experience was different and more influential than a usual professional development session for music. The Director identified this point in her interview. Furthermore, the fact that memories are still strong and participant’s are still telling their individual stories after two years is a measure of the narrative power of the event. The characteristics that allowed this narrative to develop were a special space, shared time during which there was implicit permission to put their working roles aside and a belief and commitment to the role of music in everyday life. This was a time when they had “songs in their heads” (Music specialist’s interview). The title of the paper and the reference to Wordsworth’s views on the power of recollection of strong emotions leaves a sense of nostalgia. By exploring the experiences and memories of the singing project educators may be able to identify the elements that created this particular experience and develop an understanding of how a shared musical culture might grow.
References


Amanda Watson: Department of Education, Victoria

Reviewing the conversation about professional teaching standards. What have we learned from the literature?

Abstract

The release of the *National Professional Standards for Teachers* (AITSL, 2011b) has re-ignited the conversation about the place of professional standards in the context of teaching in Australia. Two major topics of discussion are the reasons for developing professional standards for teachers and the development of a formal certification process in recognition of achievement of a level in a standards matrix. This article presents the literature associated with the development of teacher standards. Firstly, subject-specific standards – initially in English, mathematics and science developed by the relevant national professional teaching associations – and secondly, generic standards resulting from the re-introduction of teacher registration boards in states and territories in Australia. The national approach to the development of generic standards was a project of Teaching Australia, completed by the Australian Institute for Teaching and School Leadership (AITSL), with early discussion about usage by the National Institute for Quality Teaching and School Leadership (NIQSTL).

Key words: accreditation, certification, domains, professional teaching standards.

Introduction

With the release of the *National Professional Standards for Teachers* in February 2011 (AITSL, 2011b), a timely opportunity is now available to revisit the literature associated with the discussion, development and use of professional standards for teachers in Australia. This article presents the historical background linked with a range of published documents over nearly two decades. It documents the literature and events from a national focus – encompassing work undertaken by the National Institute for Quality Teaching and School Leadership (NIQSTL), Teaching Australia and the Australian Institute for Teaching and School Leadership (AITSL). Other events include the development of subject-specific standards by professional teaching associations, and generic teaching standards in conjunction with the re-introduction of teacher registration boards in states and territories in Australia.

Significant published writing on the development of professional teaching standards for music underpins this article – being the previous work by Watson, Forrest and Jeanneret (2003a, 2003b, 2003c, 2004a, 2004b, 2004c, 2004d, 2004e, 2004f, 2004g, 2005a, 2005b, 2006), Watson (2004a, 2004b, 2004c), Forrest, Jeanneret and Watson (2005), Jeanneret, Watson and Forrest (2005), and Jeanneret, Forrest and Watson (2007). Much of the literature acknowledges that, if professional standards are to be embraced by those for whom they are written, direct involvement at all stages from practising teachers is crucial. Reference has been made to that literature in the acknowledged papers (above) and it is does not require further repetition. Ingvarson has made two points that are still current (and remain unresolved) in any discussion on this topic in 2011. Ingvarson (1998)
argued that following the development of professional standards, the profession must preserve an essential link between standards setting and teacher professional development. He observed in *Research Highlights* (2002) that:

We need tools that will build strong links between standards and action; otherwise standards will remain on the shelf. Assessment is an essential tool in building these links... The hard question is how we move from where we are to a profession that actually has some real responsibilities, such as certification, with which is it entrusted. (2002, p. 15)

Sachs (2003) has supported the issue of ownership and she remarked that certification and career progression are “the most political dimensions of the standards schema” and are therefore the most difficult areas for teachers to control or influence, a reference to prior unsuccessful attempts (p. 183). Later, Sachs (2005) has summarised her thoughts with five points – the need to talk about *teaching* standards not teacher standards; standards which are developmental (not regulatory) to support and enhance quality teaching; the implementation of standards have effects on both teachers’ work and their attitude to their work; the values informing teaching standards are owned and internalised by teachers, with teacher involvement in their development and oversight; and that implementation and monitoring requires a time and energy investment by school systems and individuals (p. 9).

Ingvarson (2010) provided an historical account from the 1970s of attempts in Australia to develop a system of professional certification. He noted that other than the USA, the mobilisation of professional associations to develop professional standards is a unique feature of Australian education (p. 56). He addressed arguments for and against possible structures that could be used for certification for teachers, reflecting that generic standards are limiting and those of specialist fields are better placed to identify professional learning needs (p. 63).

**Historical Background - Significant Reports**

The Australian Teaching Council (ATC) – a potential national body – established by the Commonwealth Labor Government in 1994, conducted the early activity in the development of professional teaching standards. Prior to the demise of the ATC in September 1996, when the Commonwealth Coalition Government withdrew their subsidy and directed funds to the establishment of a new national body, the ATC published the *National Competency Framework for Beginning Teaching* (1996). This document represented the draft national guidelines on teacher education and induction as part of the National Project on Quality Teaching and Learning.

In October 1996 a consultation paper was released titled *Enhancing Teacher Professionalism: Towards a New National Body for Teacher Professional Associations*. The paper grew from a Commonwealth Government Ministerial initiative announced on 29 May 1996 with the intention to provide funding for the establishment of a National Forum of Teacher Professional Associations to promote teacher professionalism. Addressing the meeting on this initiative, the
Minister for Education, Hon. Dr David Kemp, strongly advocated that teachers should play a stronger role in communicating their own standards and promoting excellence in teaching (Kemp, 1996). Part of the consultation paper brief was to address the issue of the development of professional standards for teachers. The paper identified that work on professional standards had commenced around three focal points – entry requirements, course accreditation and career paths – and it acknowledged the benchmark for the teaching professional set by the National Competency Framework for Beginning Teaching.

The Teacher Education Standards and Guidelines Project (1998) was completed by the Australian Council of Deans of Education. In the same year, the Senate Inquiry into the status of the teaching profession in Australia resulted in the publication of A Class Act: Inquiry into the Status of the Teaching Profession (Australian Senate, 1998). In this, establishing professional standards was acknowledged as being “unavoidable and absolutely necessary” (1998, p. 16), and the establishment of a national body with the responsibility of setting standards of practice and regulating the profession was recommended. The report acknowledged professional teaching associations as an important stakeholder that should play a significant role in the development of standards.

A national forum convened in Melbourne in February 2000 set a framework for developments that occurred later that year by identifying nine strategic intentions for the development of professional teaching standards. These intentions – Focus, Ownership, Rationale, Links, Coherence, Rigour, Collaboration, Resourcing, Capacity – were published as Professional Teaching Standards: Towards Collaborative and Strategic Action (April 2000).

In September 2000, a national discussion paper, Standards of Professional Practice for Accomplished Teaching in Australian Classrooms (ACE, 2000) was prepared and released by the Australian College of Education, the Australian Curriculum Studies Association, and the Australian Association for Research in Education. The paper was informed by work that was currently underway in developing subject-specific standards for teachers of English and Literacy, Mathematics and Science. The writers sought to respond to the fundamental question, “What Constitutes Accomplished Teaching”, expanded into sub headings as questions, three of which were:

- Why does teaching need standards of accomplished professional practice?
- Who would benefit from the identification and end use of standards of accomplished professional practice?
- Upon what premises and principles ought the construction of standards of accomplished practice be based? (ACE, 2000, p. 2)

An analysis of the submitted responses to the discussion paper published by ACE in February 2001, acknowledged that whilst there was general support from the peak educational bodies for the descriptors by which Australian teachers should demonstrate their professionalism, most concerns were raised about their use in the assessment process (p. 8).
Funded by the Commonwealth Department of Education, Science and Training, the National Meeting of Professional Educators project took place in April 2002. A substantial report was issued titled *Teacher Standards, Quality and Professionalism: Towards a Common Approach*. The action plan detailed in the outcomes statement had a specific task:

> to develop a national statement, code or declaration for the teaching profession that makes explicit what Australian teachers know, value and believe about their work and their profession. (ACE, 2002, p. 22)

In November 2002, the Teacher Quality & Educational Leadership Taskforce (TQELT) prepared a paper titled *A National Framework for Standards for Teaching – A Consultation Paper*. In response the Western Australian College of Teaching remarked that the intricacies of teaching need to be incorporated into a national framework and the structure must allow for the provision of subject-specific standards (2003, p. 6). The Australian Curriculum Studies Association (ACSA) published the *National Statement from the Profession on Teacher Standards, Quality and Professionalism: A Working Document*, influenced by the aforementioned consultation paper, in December 2002. ACSA identified that standards should be used to provide a framework and guide for:

- teacher education and continuous professional learning
- reflecting on and assessing professional teaching practice
- recognition and certification of teachers who attain standards for highly accomplished practice. (ACSA, 2002, p. 3)

The responses to the consultation paper were collated and in July 2003 the Ministerial Council on Education, Employment, Training and Youth Affairs (MCEETYA) approved a national framework for professional teaching standards. Shortly before in May 2003 the *National Statement from the Teaching Profession on Teacher Standards, Quality & Professionalism* was published by the Australian College of Educators. The Commonwealth Department of Education, Science and Training (DEST) produced an expanded publication combining both the *National Statement* and responses from MCEETYA personnel in September 2003.

The Ministerial Council on Education, Employment, Training and Youth Affairs, Teacher Quality & Educational Leadership Taskforce (MCEETYA TEQLT) published *A National Framework for Professional Standards for Teaching* (November 2003). It acknowledged previous, ongoing and future standards work thus:

> This current National Framework for Professional Standards for Teaching provides an architecture within which generic, specialist and subject-specific professional standards can be developed at a National and State and Territory levels. It provides an organising structure which establishes, at a national level, the agreed foundational elements and dimensions of effective teaching. (MCEETYA TEQLT, 2003, p. 2)
The framework identified four career dimensions as graduate, competence, accomplishment and leadership and four professional elements as professional knowledge, professional practice, professional values and professional relationships (p. 9).

Commentary

Each of these significant national reports has identified a need for generic professional standards for teachers, subject-specific standards and the involvement of teachers in the development process. Although the events and reports are linked by the common theme of the development and use of professional standards, activity from February 2000 was more aligned. The career dimensions and professional elements published in A National Framework for Professional Standards for Teaching (2003) provided a structure that could be adopted by professional teaching associations (including music) for the development of subject-specific standards. Endorsement of the framework by MCEETYA enabled associations to develop subject-specific standards guided by a consistent structure.

National Professional Teaching Organisations

A further initiative at this time was the decision by the Australian Government to establish a National Institute for Quality Teaching and School Leadership, with a proposal that one of its five functions might be the development of professional teaching standards. The National Institute for Quality Teaching and School Leadership (NIQTSL) was established by the Australian Government in 2004. From this point on, national professional teaching associations were actively supported to develop subject-specific professional standards and funded to attend network meetings. In August 2005, NIQTSL convened a conference titled Sharing Experience: ways forward with standards. The Australian Society for Music Education (ASME) was the only national music professional teaching association to attend this conference and a workshop was presented to a capacity-filled room.

This meeting was the catalyst for intense work over the next five years (2005-2009) on the development and use of national professional standards, including consultation with professional teaching associations, and resulting in many publications. Outcomes of the meeting also affirmed the standards work that had been completed and published by a number of professional teaching associations in the years prior to this event. The first attempts at accrediting teachers using standards for accomplished teachers were presented by the Australian Association of Mathematics Teachers and the Australian Science Teachers Association at the NIQTSL conference. Both associations presented selected teachers as Highly Accomplished Teachers of Mathematics and Highly Accomplished Teachers of Science.

Teaching Australia – Australian Institute for Teaching and School Leadership Limited was established in November 2005, and a standards reference consultation group was established. A nominee of ASME served on the consultation group. The Teaching Australia Network, formed in 2007, was a formal
collaboration of more than 30 national professional associations representing teachers, principals and teacher educators, and Teaching Australia Network Fora were convened in 2007, 2008, and 2009. ASME was the only national music professional teaching association that was member of the network and representatives attended the fora in each year. Publications were regular and authors were funded by Teaching Australia to conduct the research. Those with a specific focus on national professional standards are listed here.

Louise Watson (2005) presented an extensive scan of research findings on professional standards and she suggested some specific uses if they were to have any impact on teaching and learning. These included being used to identify a person as a professional teacher (certified to teach), to increase and maintain membership of professional teaching associations coupled with support for professional learning, recognising and rewarding teachers who demonstrate advanced standards and to sanction members of the profession who do not uphold standards (pp. 31-49).

Ingvarson, et al. (2006) reviewed the literature in Australia and overseas to explore the development of professional standards for school leadership, their impact on professional learning, assessment processes and certification. Bishop, et al. (2006) sought to identify if the mathematics standards, which were written to describe individual ‘excellence’, could also be used as a group approach to professional learning (p. 1). Their research question was:

To what extent are the AAMT Standards for Excellence in Teaching Mathematics in Australian Schools able to be used to support the professional learning of teachers of mathematics in the context of in-school, collaborative professional learning programs? (p. 2)

Although not a Teaching Australia publication, in a similar approach to mathematics, Meiers (2006) edited a publication on teachers’ stories regarding the use of the English and literacy professional standards.

Ingvarson and Kleinhenz (2006) were funded to review national and international events in the development and use of professional standards. Unfortunately the report made detailed reference to only the Australian accomplished standards for English, Mathematics and Science with marginal reference to others, these being school librarians, teachers of ESL and modern languages. In response to recording the missing data, Hayes (2006) was commissioned to interview personnel from the other professional teaching associations who had developed or were considering development of advanced/accomplished professional standards. Although with a broader brief, (Zammitt, et al. 2007) addressed teaching and leadership with a focus on ‘quality’ in Australian schools. They considered the impact and implementation of professional standards on quality schooling through a review of research-based knowledge.

Teaching Australia (2007, 2008) produced two consultation papers discussing national professional standards for advanced teaching and school principals. The first was linked to the statement Our Profession Our Future (2006) and made
reference to the structure and capabilities of existing subject-specific standards and included preliminary work on a charter for the teaching profession. It proposed principles and a model for advanced professional standards that were refined in the second consultation paper. Mayer (2009) presented a paper in which she argued that voluntary certification for highly accomplished teachers must be part of a professional accountability system that is developed, implemented and managed by the profession. She proposed a conceptual framework for the recognition and certification of teachers at this level.

The Teaching Australia Network (2009) published a summation of the two consultation documents and associated with this was funding for four groups to write professional standards. Science revised their original document and republished in August 2009; primary, early childhood education and principals commenced writing advanced standards. Draft primary standards and the principal activity have passed to the new national body, the Australian Institute for Teaching and School Leadership Limited (AITSL).

Between 2002 and 2010 it is possible to identify highly accomplished professional standards written and published for teachers of English and literacy, mathematics, science, school librarians, special education, music, English as a second language, languages and culture, history, careers and geography. Competencies have been developed for teachers of dance, information and communication technology, physical education, and hearing-impaired, with drama developing working conditions. Ingvarson (2010, p. 55) noted that in 2009 there were in excess of 20 associations who had developed or were developing professional standards. And he stressed this point with the statement ‘they want to use them to provide a certification system for those who meet them’ (Ingvarson, 2011, p. 38). Further, Ingvarson (2011) asked whether the Ministerial Council for Education, Early Childhood Development and Youth Affairs (MCEEDYA) would enable AITSL to invite professional associations to take the responsibility for implementing a voluntary certification system. With the publication of Certification of Highly Accomplished and Lead Teachers (AITSL, October 2011a) it is clear that professional associations will not have an implementation role in the certification process, although individuals may be trained as assessors.

In January 2010, the Australian Institute for Teaching and School Leadership Limited (AITSL) was established and the National Professional Standards for Teachers (2011b) were approved in December 2010, released in February 2011 for implementation at the commencement of 2012 school year. Although AITSL has acknowledged the value of professional teaching associations, no reference is made in the national standards to the advanced standards that have been developed and published by these groups. The generic national standards encompass four levels – graduate, proficient (matching the compulsory provisional and full registration requirements of current practice) and the two voluntary levels of highly accomplished and lead.

**Commentary**
The activities and publications of the national professional teaching organisations have focussed on issues around national professional standards for advanced teaching and school principals. Significant consultation with the teaching profession took place in fora and research for publications. The topics investigated included the use of advanced standards, designing a model for the development of advanced standards and the approaches used by teaching associations that have developed advanced standards. With the establishment of AITSL, the standards work completed by professional teaching associations will not be accepted for certification purposes. The AITSL briefing (2011c) for the Australian Professional Teachers Association recommended that these subject-specific standards could be used for the development of learning area statements across the domain stages, and to annotate illustrations of practice.

**Teacher Registration Boards**

Running parallel to the work of Teaching Australia and the development of subject-specific accomplished standards has been the re-introduction of teacher registration boards across Australia. Known as colleges, institutes or registration boards, states and territories have established bodies with registration and disciplinary powers and written generic professional standards for a number of levels. Each has the responsibility for certification of teachers and has generic standards that stipulate compulsory expectations on entry to the profession at graduation (provisional registration) and after a period induction and mentoring (full registration). Some jurisdictions have standards at a higher voluntary level. Each teacher registration board also accredits pre-service teacher education courses according to their own criteria. The career dimensions and professional elements published in *A National Framework for Professional Standards for Teaching* (2003) are evident in this work.

**Conclusion**

This article has documented the many publications and events from an Australian national perspective that have occurred on the writing, use and implementation of national professional standards. It has drawn a focus to the value and use of the subject-specific standards that have been overshadowed by the plethora of generic standards at the state, territory and national levels.

Although the subject-specific standards published by the professional teaching associations are redundant for the purposes of certification, these standards will continue to have other uses as they describe the relationship between teaching and learning. As evidenced by *Arts Education* (1995) – the report by the Australian Senate – they have a use in teacher education courses as requirements at the under-graduate and post-graduate levels. This report addressed the issue of professional teaching standards in arts education, making a recommendation that detailed competency standards both for specialist arts teachers and for generalist primary teachers teaching arts should be developed (p. 64).

The *ASME National Framework for Music Teaching Standards* (2005) has possible uses in structuring and guiding professional learning presented by music
professional teaching associations, school systems, in-school programs or teacher-initiated in the classroom. Studio music teachers working outside the school environment, where their teaching is more exposed and not regulated by teacher registration boards, could use and further develop professional standards to maintain a level of practice.

References


The innovative approach to music education developed by Émile Jaques-Dalcroze was taught in New South Wales during the 1920s by several enterprising individuals with a range of life experiences. The first was Mary Whidborne. She saw a demonstration by Jaques-Dalcroze in Berlin in 1910 and later attended his Hellerau-Dresden College. During World War 1, she joined the British Women’s Air Force and, upon demobilization, migrated to Australia. For five years she taught at Frensham School, Mittagong and conducted classes in Sydney until leaving to continue studies in Paris.

Eliza Gormley, inaugural Instructor of Women’s Physical Training for the New South Wales (NSW) Department of Public Instruction, took study leave in 1919 to complete a Masters at Columbia University and attend the Dalcroze Center in New York. On her return to Sydney she incorporated the principles in her work. A tour in 1923-24 by Ethel Driver, Mistress of Method at the London School of Dalcroze Eurhythmics (LSDE), accompanied by Australian graduates, Cecilia John and Heather Gell, stimulated interest in Sydney which saw Dorothea Michel leave for London to take the three-year course. A Dalcroze Society formed in Sydney in 1924 and, in 1925, welcomed two LSDE graduates, Phyllis Crawhall-Wilson and Katherine Haynes. They undertook a taxing round of school and private teaching for over three years before returning to Britain.

Dalcroze Eurhythmics then lacked any qualified teachers in NSW and sadly enthusiasm dwindled. Little more happened for a decade. Then, in 1939 two rival teachers, Heather Gell and Mary Whidborne, established themselves in Sydney. Several themes are posed in this paper: why did this work depend so heavily on individuals, and what inhibited its absorption into the school curriculum?

Key words: Dalcroze : Eurhythmics: historical: biographical; women; Australian.

Introduction

This paper is one in a series of historical studies investigating the years during which graduates from the London School of Dalcroze Eurhythmics (LSDE) first commenced teaching in several Australian States and in New Zealand. (Pope, 2006a. Pope, 2006b. Pope, 2006d. Pope, 2007. Pope, 2008). Contemporary music educators know little regarding the relatively early introduction of this method to the Southern hemisphere, and which now, entering its second century, is enjoying a resurgence of interest amongst educators, musicians, performance artists and therapists in countries far beyond its origin. Swiss musician Émile Jaques-Dalcroze developed an innovative approach to music education through
physical movement experiences at the turn of the twentieth century which was, in the English-speaking world by 1911, known as Dalcroze Eurhythmics. The somewhat loose use of the neologism ‘eurhythmics’ by physical training teachers and ‘interpretative dance’ exponents, without the specific definition of ‘Dalcroze’, caused considerable confusion in the years after WW1, as it was enthusiastically applied to a wide spectrum of recreational dance and fitness activities for women. Each of the snapshots of the qualified Dalcroze teachers described below note their exasperation with the situation in NSW during the 1920s. Confusion still exists today due to the use of a similar term ‘eurythmy’ employed by proponents of Rudolph Steiner.

The first teacher of Dalcroze Eurhythmics in NSW

Research focussed on New South Wales reveals several enterprising women, trained and inspired by Jaques-Dalcroze, who travelled from England to earn their living and proselitise. The first was Mary Catherine Whidborne (1884 - 1970) from Exeter. In her twenties she undertook advanced piano studies at the Stern’sche Konservatorium, Berlin and there, in 1910, she saw Jaques-Dalcroze present a public demonstration of his teaching methods, described as ‘Rhythmishe Gymnastik’. It was announced that his new College at Hellerau, near Dresden, would open the following year. This was a defining moment for Whidborne who later wrote, ‘the system aims to give students a complete feeling for rhythm throughout the whole body’ (Journal, DSGB. 1934. p.15). On her return to England she joined the staff at St. James School in Malvern. When Jaques-Dalcroze visited England in 1912 he presented a series of demonstrations and children from this school participated, a fact of which Whidborne was extremely proud (Tingey. 1974). She attended the 1913 Summer Training School at Hellerau, and was about to return to Germany to continue training with Dalcroze when war broke out in 1914. Instead, she enrolled at the recently established LSDE. Volunteering for war service in 1915, Whidborne worked in the British War Office in London, then as an Officer in the Royal Women’s Air Force in France (Pope. 2006c). After demobilisation she travelled to Australia and by April 1920, commenced a teaching position at the progressive school, Frensham, in Mittagong. Whidborne remained on the staff until October 1925. Her account of this period is enthusiastic.

To anyone keen on adventure, there is nothing more thrilling than pioneer work. To travel 12,000 miles and at the end of the journey to find that no-one has ever heard of the word ‘eurhythmics’, and that it was up to you to ‘tell the world’, and prove it was very worthwhile as part of the education of the rising generation, was a thrill indeed (Journal of DSGB.1934. pp.15-17).

At the end of first term in 1920 she presented her debut demonstration in the school’s amphitheatre, ‘The Holt’, which she described as ‘an ideal setting for Transcendentalism in Movement.’ Lindley Evans, well-known pianist and accompanist on the staff of the Sydney Conservatorium, attended this recital and wrote a detailed account. For him the display at Frensham was a revelation. He praised the wonderfully developed rhythmic sense and muscular control shown, and perceptively singled out a key principle of Dalcroze eurhythmics which is:
that students have to think out and work out their own ideas. There can be no such thing as copying others, or pretence, on insincerity. If you wait to see what someone else is doing it means a loss of time and puts you out of rhythm. Absolute attention is essential for the immediate ‘realisation’ of the mental effect produced by the rhythmical sounds from the accompanying piano. The brain must receive the message and send it with lightning speed to the various muscles of arms and legs. A feature of the demonstration was the mental alertness of the girls and the speed and ease with which they carried out various commands. The girls, dressed in loose tunics, with bare arms and legs, were like nymphs in the charming wooded surroundings, and with a small creek running in the distance the whole physical display was attractive (Evans.1920. p.15).

Evans concluded that for young people contemplating musical study it would be invaluable and posed a hypothetical question; ‘would it be possible to acquire in one branch of study, concentration, alertness of mind, independence of thought and instantaneous action therein, without its effect being felt throughout all other studies?’ (Evans. 1920. p.17). Clearly, he was begging the question.

In June 1922, Whidborne gave a public demonstration in Sydney at His Majesty’s Theatre in the presence of the wife of the Governor of NSW, Dame Margaret Davidson, and the Lady Mayoress, Mrs William McElhone and the considerable amount of over £300 was raised for the Citizens’ Returned Soldiers Benefit Fund (Daily Telegraph. 28-06-1922). The twenty participants were her Frensham pupils and Dame Margaret requested lessons for her two young daughters. Whidborne noted that Dalcroze Eurhythmics ‘became quite fashionable’ after she formed a weekend class in Sydney and she could hardly cope with the demand. It was with relief when a student friend from Hellerau days, Loulette Badollet (now Mrs. Cook), chanced to arrive in Sydney. Badollet had been one of the forty students from Geneva who moved to Hellerau with Jaques-Dalcroze forming an advanced class. Badollet took week-day classes in Sydney while ‘Whiddy’ continued full-time teaching at Frensham. The length of Badollet’s sojourn in Sydney has not yet been established.

Their names feature in an advertisement in the Physical Culture Magazine issued by Withrow’s School of Physical Culture, Sydney which states that they are ‘The Only Authorised Teachers of the Dalcroze Method in New South Wales’ offering classes for adults and children (Withrow’s. January, 1923. p.7). It stresses that Mlle. Badollet is a Certificated Teacher of the Dalcroze Method, and that Miss Whidborne, LRAM, had been a pupil of Jaques-Dalcroze. Whidborne at this stage was, strictly speaking, unqualified, but she had obtained permission from ‘M’sieur Jaques’ to undertake certain aspects of the work. He had been alerted to a number of teachers purporting to teach his Method and was already extremely strict with regards to examinations and satisfactory demonstration of his principles (Pope, 2005a).

Withrow’s magazine was generally devoted to health and exercise matters but several issues included articles about Dalcroze’s original approach to rhythm through carefully designed movement studies. A.L. Kelly, a music lecturer at the
Sydney Teachers’ College described it as a ‘system of complete musical training which has music as its basis, and the body, the whole of the body, as its instrument.’ He continued:

There exist excellent systems of physical training which employ exercises in rhythm, and yet they are by no means Dalcrozan. There should be no confusion of these with Eurhythmics. Then too there are those numerous schools of dancing based on the idea of plastic poses and claiming to renew the ideals and practice of the ancient Greek Dance ... but there is no connection with the art, aims and methods of Dalcroze. At once it will be seen that it is more than dancing, and it is more than gymnastics. It embraces both of these, though not in the conventional sense ... the big fact about the system is that the very life and soul of physical action are the things to be regulated, brought under the control of the will, and prepared for the spontaneous and beautiful expression of music (Withrow’s. 1923. pp.7-9).

This is an insightful exposition of the Dalcroze approach and it would be interesting to learn where, or from whom, Kelly gained his insights. The method was further brought to public attention when a Harold Cazneaux photograph captioned ‘Mary Whidborne’s eurhythmics students’ was the frontispiece of a stylish Australian arts journal of the day (The Home. November, 1924). The publication of an artistic photograph showing a graceful group of women posed in the gardens of the Sydney Conservatorium by this well-known photographer was valuable publicity for the Dalcroze work in Sydney.

**A promotional tour to the Commonwealth**

Whidborne played a role in the visit to Sydney by Ethel Driver in late 1923 (Pope, 2005b). Driver, Mistress of Method at the LSDE, was sent by Percy Ingham, the Honorary Principal, on a six-month promotional journey to Australia. Driver, accompanied by Heather Gell from Adelaide and Cecilia John from Melbourne, the two most recent Australian graduates of the LSDE, presented lectures, demonstrations and intensive courses in various Australian and New Zealand cities. At Whidborne’s suggestion, Driver visited Frensham School and used a group of students for her demonstration in Sydney. This was at the Conservatorium on 21 December 1923 and John reports that ‘the attendance was not so good but the enthusiasm made up for lack of numbers’ (LDTU Newsletter, 1924. p.2). Following a tactic favoured by Jaques-Dalcroze, an audience member was requested to offer an extempore theme as the basis for a piano improvisation. Driver invited Frank Hutchens from the Sydney Conservatorium, to provide one, and when writing to Jaques-Dalcroze noted that ‘the musical side was particularly well presented and Mr. Hutchens, one of the foremost piano teachers of Sydney, gave a very beautiful theme which was developed at a second piano by Miss John’ (Le Rythme, December, 1924).

Discussing the tour in The Australian Musical News Thorold Waters noted that, whilst ‘some exponents of the Jaques-Dalcroze system’ had recently arrived in the
country, and that a number of enquiries about the topic had been received from as far afield as the Northern Territory, he feared that it ‘will not be easy for it to find a way past the barriers of official stupidity, as in Australia music still has to beg to be fully admitted into education’ (Waters, 1923, pp. 5-6).

Whidborne gave the impression that no-one but she had known of Dalcroze Eurhythmics in Australia. This however was not so, as on the other side of the continent Western Australian born Irene Wittenoom (1893 – 1968), the first Australian graduate from the LSDE in 1917, was already teaching at the Kindergarten Training College, Perth (Pope, 2007). Furthermore, Sydney teacher, Ella May Gormley, was at the time, attending classes at the New York Dalcroze School.

A Sydney lecturer visits the New York Dalcroze School

Gormley (1885 - 1948), born and educated in Wellington NZ, entered the service of the NSW Board of Public Instruction in 1904. By 1916 she was a senior swimming instructor, teaching physical training at numerous schools and Sydney Teachers’ College, and a graduate of Sydney University. In 1919 she received permission from her employer to study for a Masters’ degree in Physical Education at Columbia University in New York. Whilst there she attended classes at the New York School of Dalcroze Eurhythmics and became convinced of its value. In a letter to Peter Board, Director of NSW of Public Instruction, Gormley stated she was ‘studying rhythm in all its applications to Physical Education The short amount of time (4 hours weekly) spent with this study will not enable me to gain the coveted Diploma, or the Dalcroze Certificate’ (NSW State Records.a). Successfully gaining her degree, she travelled to England to gather additional resources and visit the LSDE. In requesting approval to stay away a short time longer, she wrote from London that:

at the LSDE some of the necessary Branches of the course are only given during the day. It is necessary to complete the course to obtain the full value of the system. The Dalcroze System in Physical Education is very excellent and far reaching and is the most valuable asset to my work that I have come into contact with ... In visiting some children’s classes I have seen wonderful work and results through its operation’ (NSW State Records.b).

Her request was grudgingly approved.

Gormley’s experience with the bureaucracy is revealing. There were many occasions when she communicated with the educational hierarchy, but few on which she was successful. Some were backed by support letters from authorities such as the Commonwealth Commissioner in the USA, who added, ‘She mentioned to me that out of her own money she is taking an extra course in the Dalcroze method which has a very high repute here. In fact, it is the system that is recognized as being superior to anything else existing in the country’ (NSW State Records. c). Upon her return to Sydney in late 1920 she was appointed Supervisor of Girls Physical Education, NSW, ‘at a salary to be determined.’ This proviso was never resolved to
her satisfaction despite the former Ministerial Head of Department, who had authorised Gormley’s expenditure being convinced it was:

evident that rational treatment of this subject is imperative in all girls schools. It appears to me that Miss Gormley’s activities should be attached to the Teachers’ College with the status of Lecturer, and that all teachers passing through the College should undergo a Course of Physical Culture with a view to being qualified to impart instruction to their future pupils. She should be available for advice not only for in the matter of formulating syllabi of instruction, not only for Primary, but for High school (NSW State Records. d).

Sadly she was not to be engaged in such training of student-teachers and found herself working at the same salary level as previously, less than that of a high school teacher. This, as she pointed out, was unrealistic given her prestigious MA qualification and overseas experience, and the fact that, in addition to her teaching role she was preparing entirely new curriculum content to benefit the entire State. In 1921, Gormley’s services were requested by no less than the Acting Prime Minister, E. J. Russell, ‘for a Special Course of Physical Culture for selected women teachers which might be held in Melbourne’ (NSW State Records. e). The NSW authorities immediately indicated she could not be spared. A six-week course was, however, arranged later that year in Sydney. This was a significant Commonwealth event and attended by a strong contingent of high-level interstate physical educators, all of whom conducted special courses for their colleagues once back in their own States. It was an admirable initiative. One participant conveyed an erroneous impression that Gormley was American, in remarking later that she ‘learnt the new craze of eurhythmic dancing from Miss Gormley, an American Dalcroze-trained physical culturist’ (Hopton, in Harwood. 1995. p.18). The remuneration difficulties which Gormley faced led to her resignation. The official comment from the Director states that ‘in the future it would be unwise to allow for provision for Females to receive assistance for study-travel purposes’ makes astonishing reading today (NSW State Records. f). The loss of such a committed person, with a potential position at the Sydney Teachers’ College, was a major set-back for the development of Dalcroze Eurhythmics in Australia.

Events following the 1923-24 tour by the LSDE

A Dalcroze Society of NSW was formed in February 1924 following the successful tour conducted by Ethel Driver from the London School of Dalcroze Eurhythmics. Prominent music teacher John McMenamin was elected President and Frank Hutchens accepted the Vice-Presidency. He was charged with arrangements for the year’s programme and plans were made for Whidborne and Rachel Lewers to give a demonstration of Dalcroze Eurhythmics. Another result of Driver’s tour was that four Australian women travelled to London to enrol in the three year course. Dorothea Michel of Sydney had attended Gormley’s earlier course covering folk dance and rhythmic movement, and was the successful candidate for a three-year scholarship at the LSDE awarded by Driver, while Jean Wilson of Perth, was offered a half-scholarship. Thelma St John George and Elizabeth Demaine, both teachers from Melbourne, financed their own studies. They were cordially
welcomed by the London committee of the Dalcroze Society although, as Wilson noted in her Diary, they were in no doubt they were regarded as ‘colonials’ (Pope, 2008). Cecilia John wrote in the Dalcroze Teachers’ Union (DTU) News-Letter that ‘Australia offered a splendid field of work for graduates if they are moved to go so far away. The ground has been well prepared by Miss Driver and work there should prove most interesting from every point of view.’ Stimulated by these encouraging remarks two Englishwomen, Phyllis Crawhall-Wilson and ‘Kitty’ Haynes, her younger colleague, set off for Australia. Who were these two adventurous teachers?

Phyllis Mary Crawhall-Wilson (1893 – 1963) from Hertfordshire, had studied at the LSDE throughout the war years. After graduation she taught at the Chelsea Physical Training College, then went to Scotland where, in Edinburgh, Glasgow and Aberdeen, the work quickly became too much for one teacher and in 1919 invited Kitty Haynes to join her. Jaques-Dalcroze visited Edinburgh and gave a well-received demonstration at the Usher Hall with their pupils. Crawhall-Wilson, was on the Council of the Dalcroze Society of Great Britain prior to her departure for Australia.

Margaret Katherine ‘Kitty’ Haynes (1897 – 1988) graduated from the LSDE in 1920 and was honoured to be invited by Jaques-Dalcroze to be one of his four demonstrators on his tour of England. Several years later Haynes and Crawhall-Wilson decided to ‘try their luck’ in Australia (DTU. 1925).

Soon after their arrival in Sydney, Haynes remarked in a letter to colleagues in England that the NSW Dalcroze Society had done very good work in a short time. She noted that:

we have a great deal to contend with as all the physical culture and dancing schools have so called eurhythmics teachers and what they teach is a form of dancing, and has no relation to Dalcroze eurhythmics though the general public think that are one and the same thing. This conception is so deep seated that we have to battle quite tactfully and firmly against it. We always call ours Dalcroze Eurhythmics (LDTU Newsletter, 1925. p.13).

At a ‘welcome’ by the NSW Dalcroze Society they presented several movement studies which were reviewed with admiration by The Australian Musical News which wrote supportively of their stimulating musical work with children (The Australian Musical News, 01-06-1925. p. 41). Later that year at the AGM of the Society held at the Sydney Conservatorium, they showed work more with children. The guest speaker Mr. Harkness, deputising for Mr. S. H. Smith, the Director of Education. Harkness was quoted in the press as proclaiming that he was so convinced of the value of Dalcroze Eurhythmics in teaching spontaneity and quickness of comprehension, apart from the obvious musical skills, that he would make every effort to have the system taught in every State School in NSW (Sydney Morning Herald, 19-10-1925. p.9h).

It appears that Crawhall-Wilson and Haynes tried to do just that and taught at Blackfriars’ Infants Practising School, Westwood School, Point Piper, St. Albans, Hunters Hill, St. Hilda’s Grammar, Abbotsleigh, Presbyterian Ladies’ College,
Turramurra Boys’ College and the Church of England Girls’ Grammar in the city (Brochure, 1925). They added more schools in 1926, namely Burnham, Kambala and Girrawheen, in the Sydney suburbs of Longueville, Rose Bay and Hunters Hill respectively (Brochure, 1926). A demonstration at the Sydney Conservatorium was held in October 1926, when Crawhall-Wilson and Haynes again presented new work with pupils from various schools (Daily Telegraph, 18-10-1926. p.10c).

Haynes was also teaching at Frensham and the Church of England Girls’ Grammar School at nearby Bowral which involved a weekly train journey of several hours and required an overnight stay at one of the schools. The Frensham Chronicle (1927.p.5) noted an Open Day, several demonstrations and stated that Haynes is ‘replacing Miss Whidborne’ who had returned to Europe in late 1925, where she intended to gain certification with Jaques-Dalcroze at his Paris School. Crawhall-Wilson and Haynes lived in Mosman, but with Sydney Harbour Bridge still under construction they used trams, trains and ferries to reach their widespread destinations. They lived near a private girls’ school, Glen Carron, associated with theosophists involved with the Star of the Sea Amphitheatre at Balmoral where ‘Greek plays and eurhythmics’ were often featured (Mosman Daily, 2-02-1924. p.3).

As both women participated in the early 1920s productions of Greek plays in Glasgow, where the artistic resources of the Scottish School of Arts were placed at their disposal, it was thought by the author that they may have been involved with this Sydney enterprise but no records of such links have been traced (DSGB Minutes.1922).

**Dalcroze Eurhythmics; ‘eurhythms’ and ‘eurythmics’**

At the annual ‘conversazione’ of the NSW Dalcroze Society in 1926, Crawhall-Wilson spoke on the aims of Dalcroze Eurhythmics and ‘how they differed from other eurhythmics of a purely physical movement kind.’ The continual use of the word ‘eurythmic’ (sic) in relation to physical culture and dance made it difficult to keep it separate in the public eye from the musically focussed Dalcroze Eurhythmics. It was not only a problem in Australia as comments from Great Britain and the USA at the time raise similar concerns. During 1926, when Jaques-Dalcroze conducted a Summer Course in Geneva, the first meeting of an International Union of Teachers of his Method (UIPD) was established and stressed the importance of maintaining his standards and examination requirements in relation to the term (Le Rythme. 1926). How one might ‘police’ such a desire world-wide was not specified!

Many photographs captioned eurhythmics appeared in the Sydney press in the 1920s, but none can be associated with Haynes and Crawhall-Wilson. The Sydney Mail carried photos of girls from Glen Carron, ‘the Garden School in Mosman, practising their eurhythms’ (Sydney Mail, 28-04-1926. p.1). Other images resembling eurhythmic groupings were found in Louise Lightfoot’s archive. Lightfoot gave creative movement classes for children and adults in the artistically influential Sydney suburb of Castlecrag, but it remains unknown whether she was informed about Dalcroze Eurhythmics (Lightfoot Archive). The magazine of Sydney
Teachers’ College, the Kookaburra, carried full-page advertisements for the Langridge School of Physical Culture promoting classes in ‘Eurhythmics, Grecian Dancing, Deportment, Physical Culture and Ballroom Dancing’ (Kookaburra. 1926). Some featured Gladys Talma, described as ‘the only exponent in Australia of the famous Isadora Duncan School of London’ teaching eurhythmics and interpretive dance (July, 1922). Withrow’s magazine published articles by Duncan’s brother Raymond, with whom one of their staff had worked in Paris (Withrow’s Physical Culture, July 1924. pp. 2-6). Such references to the word ‘eurhythmics’ indicate the problem for practitioners endeavouring to differentiate the Dalcroze identity.

The NSW Dalcroze Society

The NSW Dalcroze Society was active during 1926, not least in raising funds with Card Afternoons and Tea Dances for Dorothea Michel’s London studies now in their final year. The presidency had changed at the first AGM in May 1925. The incoming president, Dr Mary Booth a former medical practitioner, was a leader in feminist, health and peace associations, and a formidable personality who sat on numerous governmental committees. However, in 1927 the situation in Sydney changed. The Dalcroze Society must have heard with great disappointment that Michel, who graduated in July 1927, had decided to marry and remain in England. Some months later Haynes returned to London in 1927 after three years in Australia (Journal of DSGB, May, 1928.p.15). How Crawhall-Wilson managed the round of teaching she had established with Haynes in Sydney is not known, but the following year it was announced that as Crawhall-Wilson was also intending to return to England, the Sydney Centre would close (Journal of DSGB. 1928). Crawhall-Wilson resumed a post as lecturer at the Academy of Arts in Glasgow which was supportive of her work in the field of Eurhythmics applied to Drama and Opera productions. One year later a brief announcement in Le Rythme noted that no graduate was available to continue the Sydney connection (Le Rythme. 1929).

Little has been found in the histories of the several schools at which Crawhall-Wilson taught. The Rayner sisters, Betty and Joan, are mentioned as taking eurhythmics at Kambala from 1929, but there is nothing further from other Sydney schools. Thus the Dalcroze interlude in Sydney came to an abrupt conclusion.

What a loss it was for Australia that Michel did not return to her home town, and these other talented and energetic Dalcroze teachers did not stay and initiate a training centre in Sydney. One can but regret that the Conservatorium of Music in Sydney had not recognized the opportunity whilst they were in NSW. No more news of the Dalcroze Society of NSW has been located and it appears that no-one mourned its passing after four busy years. No records have been found in the Defunct Associations Register, which suggests that the association had not been formally incorporated (NSW Public Records Office). It would be a decade before Dalcroze Eurhythmics was again taught in Sydney, and then, in an ironic twist, by two teachers proceeding quite independently of each other. One was Mary Whidborne who returned from England in late 1937 and established a studio in Rowe St in the heart of the ‘bohemian’ set; the other was Heather Gell, well-established in Adelaide since 1924, but who in late 1938 relocated and opened a studio in Sydney only several streets away. Her decision was linked to the potential for the federal Australian Broadcasting Commission to conduct ‘Music through
Movement’ broadcasts to schools. Both women applied for the position and Gell was selected.

**Concluding remarks**

In review, it is clear the enthusiasm for the Dalcroze initiatives could not be sustained without individual teachers obtaining the stringent qualifications required by Émile Jaques-Dalcroze. This demanded at least three years of full time study overseas covering music disciplines of ear training, singing and pianistic skills as well as highly developed movement studies and the desire to be formed as a teacher. The possibility that enough teachers in State schools would ever gain such additional qualifications with such a major commitment of time and finance was a doubtful proposition then, as now. Although a number of private, independent schools were eager to employ Dalcroze-trained teachers on a part-time basis, such teachers holding the Licentiate, were themselves not permitted to train others, as Jaques-Dalcroze insisted on a higher degree, Diplôme, and the presence of at least three staff members with this qualification, to establish a training school in his name. This was practically impossible in Australia in the 1920s and remains so to this day when there are only two Australians with the Diplôme actively teaching, and a mere half dozen with the Licentiate in the entire continent. Enthusiasm alone is not enough to secure the rights.

**References.**


Dalcroze Teachers’ Union (1924). *Newsletter.*


Pope, J. L. ‘Mary Whidborne: The first teacher of Dalcroze eurhythmics in New South Wales?’ Ausdance, Brolga 24, June. 2006c.


Abstract
The purpose of this paper is to address the issues relating to the assessment of creativity and describe the development of constructs that are used in the Assessing Creativity in the Arts (ACA) Questionnaire. This questionnaire is intended to uncover teachers’ views on creativity assessment and compare the views of different groups such as primary and secondary teachers and music and visual arts teachers. The design of the ACA questionnaire was based on a preceding qualitative study involving interviews with teachers and pupils from four primary and secondary schools in East Anglia. (The study not only investigated teachers’ and pupils’ views, but also examined actual assessment practices.) Results of the statistical analysis will include the major themes arising from, and the significant differences between, teachers’ views, compared by subject, teacher practice, background and sectors. The report will conclude with comments on the use of the ACA in future research and the wider use of arts-based research paradigms.

Keywords: creativity, assessment, arts practices, questionnaire

Introduction
Assessment of creativity is a hotly debated and difficult issue for primary and secondary music and visual arts teachers. Despite the long-standing challenges of classroom-based assessment of creativity in music and the visual arts, the development of a systematic approach to the assessment of creativity and the constructs used by primary and secondary teachers in assessing young people’s creativity in music and the visual arts, remains a slippery, highly contested and under-researched area (Black et al, 2003; Amabile, 1983). In the absence of extensive research, we do not know with any accuracy what we are talking about when we speak of creativity assessment in music and the visual arts. We know little about what constructs primary and secondary teachers use in assessing creativity in children and young people’s work in music and the visual arts, nor the extent to which these constructs are modified for different arts subjects and school sectors (Murphy & Espeland, 2007; Eisner, 2007).

A seminal study by Hargreaves and Galton (1996) reported substantial agreement about the quality of different pieces of work across all scales and between the different rating scales employed in each of the art forms in the creative arts in British primary schools. Challenges for assessment in the arts remain concerning where creativity resides in the assessment of different arts disciplines. Other challenges concern what it is that teachers are assessing (i.e. the construct) and how teachers of different arts disciplines judge creativity consistently. What are the creativity constructs teachers use?
Widely recognised as a challenging educational issue is the extent to which there are differences between teachers of different subjects, with respect to different age groups, and between students and their teachers (Daugherty et al, 2008; Hickey and Lipscom, 2006; Mellor, 1999).

Background

Despite the long-standing challenges of classroom-based assessment of creativity in music and the visual arts, the development of a systematic approach to the assessment of creativity by primary and secondary teachers remains a slippery, highly contested and under-researched area (Cochrane, 2008; Burnard, 2002; Colwell, 2002, 1999). In the absence of adequate research we do not know with any precision what we are talking about or looking at; neither do we know what constructs primary and secondary teachers use in assessing creativity in pupils’ work, nor the extent to which these constructs are modified for different arts subjects and school sectors.

There is a small body of literature providing clear and concrete evidence of English primary teachers’ constructs of creativity in their assessment practices of children’s paintings, compositions and creative writing. In a seminal study called the DELTA Project (Development of Learning and Teaching in the Arts), Hargreaves and Galton (1996) devised a methodology which claimed to make explicit the implicit criteria which teachers used to make judgments about children’s products. The findings for music made ground in helping to develop a language of assessment.

As with other school subjects, assessment of creativity in the arts is a hotly debated and difficult issue for primary and secondary music and visual arts teachers. The starting assumption of this enquiry is that research into creativity assessment, or anything similar, is an educational inquiry into formative and summative forms of assessment, although there is a tendency for these to be disproportionately focused on the construction of composed objects and the skill-set demonstrated, at the relative expense of the meaning and the message. Given that there are contextual issues that apply specifically to visual arts and music, the appropriation of both arts domains in research is problematic. However, combining music and visual arts in particular is at the heart of arts education debates. Both music and visual arts have the potential to play a powerful role in pupils’ creative development. They can inspire, inform and expand the horizons of young people, challenging their thinking and provoking creative responses in both written forms on paper and in multimedia forms. For these reasons and framed by the need to facilitate reflection upon assessment themes by pupils and teachers in primary and secondary school contexts, this research aims to further understanding about creativity assessment by collecting data on both music and visual art. The detailed analysis of extant literature, contextual issues and overview of the data sets, however, are not addressed nor unpacked in this paper, due to word restrictions.
The Purpose

In this paper I will report on the details of the research methodology, methods and some aspects of the broad relationships between the construct of ‘creativity’ and its assessment in primary and secondary school music and visual arts practices and to further our knowledge about the construct of ‘creativity’ as it applies (and is located) in arts assessment practices.

The analysis was designed around the key question: ‘What is the construct ‘creativity’ and how is it expressed in assessment practices in different regions in secondary school music classrooms in England?’

Methodology And Methods

Informed by the framework of Johnson and Onwuegbuzie (2004), the study employed a combination of qualitative data collected by interviews (and contextual observations) and an on-line survey, distributed via email to key music personnel across a range of secondary schools in five local education authorities. There were two main stages of analysis.

Phase One (Qualitative data collection and analysis) – the research process focused on classroom observation followed by interviews (individual teacher and focus group with pupils) and artefact collection in four schools. A social constructionist perspective (Bryman, 2001) was applied to the qualitative data analysis, informed by constructs related to assessment for learning and socio-cultural theories.

During the interviews (see Appendix 1), the participants were asked exploratory questions regarding the nature of assessment, the demands and challenges when creativity is assessed, what forms are used, how they engaged creatively in assessment tasks and what they felt they gained from these creative opportunities. Photo elicitation, a technique which involves photos, videos and other forms of visual representation, used in an interview with participants who are asked to comment on the images with the aim to encourage and stimulate discussion about their values, creativity constructs, assessment tasks and outcomes.

One specific interview question dealt with arts activities, namely ‘Would you please give examples of activities that you have used in visual art/music which you consider a successful and valuable experience for the students?’

The construct descriptions were collated and edited so as to combine those with similar themes or aims. Teachers were asked to make comparative judgments between triads of these selected activities by ‘describing ways in which two members of the three are alike and thereby different from the third’, thereby producing a series of bipolar constructs which were subsequently used as rating scales for further elements. This procedure was systematically followed. Subsequently these constructs were inspected and their content analyzed by two independent raters.
Phase Two (Design, development and piloting the questionnaire and conducting the survey) – the research process for the design, development and piloting of the questionnaire was informed by the emerging results from Phase One. The data analysis was carried out with the statistical packages SPSS and AMOS utilizing various descriptive and inferential statistical techniques (non-parametric tests, confirmatory factor analysis, and SEM based regression modelling).

**Sampling criteria**

The criteria used for selection of schools for the study were: (i) a willingness to be involved in the project for the duration of the pilot; (ii) the range of contexts to be represented in the overall sample: urban / rural; small / large; different specialism and Arts Mark status; (iii) people identified as leaders in developing ‘good’ assessment practices in a range of primary and secondary schools across a diversity of communities; and (iv) teachers who have been able to juggle policy and practice in the radically changing context of the English education system - chosen by reputation or recommended by the Local Authority Inspectorate.

**Data collection methods**

Instruments for data collection included:

a. **Observations** were primarily for familiarisation with the schools, teachers and students and for contextualising the interview questions and analysis.

b. **Interviews** included face-to-face individual interviews with the teachers and group interviews with the students from four schools (two primary and two secondary in the East region of England).

c. **Work samples / artefacts** included the collection of documentation of teachers’ practices, assessment tasks, work samples, teacher-developed tests, portfolios, critiques, sketchbooks and checklists.

d. **Survey**: The questionnaire was designed and developed over a period of four months following the data collection and analysis of the interviews, artefacts and literature. The questionnaire was piloted utilizing a review by expert teachers and feedback from a group of teachers who participated in the in qualitative phase of the project. The questionnaire included background variables as well as statements (3-5 items per concept for the development of latent variables) developed from the results of the qualitative study and the literature. After finalizing the questionnaire, it was emailed to 40 schools recruited to the CAPA project from five south-eastern English counties (Cambridgeshire, Essex, Hertfordshire, Norfolk and Suffolk). It reached approximately 120 music and visual arts teachers in primary and secondary schools. The purpose was to gain more views from practitioners on ‘creativity’ as a construct in the assessment of music. We were aiming for a 50% response rate, across East Anglia, for appropriate statistical analysis. In addition, the survey was sent to professional music education societies and appeared on several websites of these organizations. Thus, our questionnaire reached a wider audience and we were able to obtain a more diverse response.
Data analysis procedures

The interviews were recorded electronically, given an anonymous code (P1-P27) and transcribed verbatim. This involved careful and repeated reading of each interview. Initially, three transcripts were independently scrutinized by each researcher (drawn from across the range of Key Stages). The procedures of qualitative content analysis were undertaken, initially, using an open coding procedure where teachers and pupils’ responses were placed into conceptual sub-categories using emergent themes arising from sets of transcriptions across primary and secondary sectors. Following a meeting to assess inter-coder reliability the codes were refined, defined and clustered; meta-themes were used to categorize like concepts. These were grouped, and expanded to form core categories and items for the questionnaire (Robson, 2002).

The on-line format of the survey enabled us to gain instant access to the quantitative data file. The data were cleaned, imported into SPSS, and labeled. Variables were examined by producing descriptive statistical measures and charts as well as using the internal consistency of the developed constructs (Cronbach's alpha). This helped to assess the suitability of the data for analysis. In addition to descriptive statistical analysis currently we are analyzing the data with factor analytic techniques to uncover a variety of views of participants on assessment of creativity. Based on the factor analysis we aim to run regression models that enable us to assess various characteristics of participants and their particular thoughts on creativity assessment. In addition to the statistical analysis, we received a large amount of text responses and we are analyzing these responses using the qualitative analysis as a baseline and uncover new patterns in the data.

Overall, we developed an integrative analysis where interviews, artefacts and survey data informed questions relating to the construct of creativity and its assessment. Here we were particularly interested in what the data said in terms of:

(a) What constitutes creativity?
(b) How was this defined and practiced by each group at the teaching-assessing and assessing-learning interface?
(c) Where was there disjunction and conjunction between groups?

Introducing the schools

All four schools displayed a commitment to the promotion of creativity at a whole school level, although this was expressed in different ways. In both primary schools creativity occupied a pivotal role in the schools aims and mission statements. At one primary school, the school’s mission statement of Excellence through Care, Creativity and Challenge located creativity centrally although it was became evident on entry to the school that fostering creativity was located primarily through their emphasis on Art in the Curriculum. At the
second primary school, fostering creativity figured in the school’s aims and was viewed as the cornerstone of curriculum planning.

Creativity within the secondary schools was less visible at first sight. One secondary school considered creativity to be a key way of engaging learners with schooling, education and learning more generically. Another secondary school’s commitment was described by one teacher as ‘helping to make the pupils validated personally by being creative themselves and less vulnerable to media exploitation as consumers and as citizens’.

**Results**

At the end of the survey data collection we received 303 responses that we were able to include in the analysis process. As we not only obtained data from a particular set of teachers it is difficult to establish the exact response rate of the study. However, we can confidently state that the questionnaire has attracted considerable attention from teachers and school leaders. There is evidence that it is very difficult to obtain a high response rate for questionnaires from teachers and school leaders in England, but our study with its higher than 300 responses suggest that there is interest among teachers and leaders about creativity assessment.

Female responders for the questionnaire were somewhat overrepresented (65% Female, 35% Male), but this distribution is not very different from the distribution of gender representation in this profession. Interestingly, more than half (62%) of responders had greater than 10 years of teaching experience, so people with longer periods of time might be more interested in in-depth issues of creativity assessment. Unsurprisingly, there was a substantially larger representation of secondary school responders (72%) compared to primary school teachers. This might be due to the fact that secondary teachers tend to be specialists and primary teachers generalists.

The initial analysis suggest that the majority of teachers (85%) agreed (agreed or strongly agreed on a 5-point Likert-Scale) that creativity involves taking risks and developing new/unconventional ideas. 65% of participants implied that creativity can be judged by the value invested in the art process, but at the same time many teachers (40%) believed that creativity is independent of skills. In spite of this creativity can be assessed in the school setting (75%), but this judgement is often subjective (51%). Participants emphasized that assessing creativity is quite difficult and adequate training would be beneficial for their work (74%). However, only 42% reported receiving adequate training and they gained experience through their work, but only 55% declared that these experiences qualified them well for assessing creativity.

In most cases, both teachers and pupils have little notion of themselves as composers or visual artists in control of the process, rather creating is seen as performing, the content, audience and purpose of which has been determined externally rather than internally. The backwash of assessment too
tends to reduce children’s choice in composing, improvising or creating art in ways which relate to their ability to make decisions and choices about form, content, audience and purpose.

The broad relationships between: (a) what teachers do with regard to their constructed conceptions of ‘creativity’ and (b) what teachers do with regard to the assessment of creativity in music generally and composing in particular (particularly in secondary school music practices) concern pupil’s autonomy as composers. When teachers exert less control during creative activities, pupils express more interest and initiate more creativity, producing less conventional outcomes than when teachers use a highly controlling style.

A brief synthesis of the findings includes: (i) the impact of performativity agendas and the wider political contexts within which music education is currently being delivered; (ii) lack of a clear and shared understanding of what constitutes ‘creativity’ in music; and (iii) teachers’ (and pupils’) continuing struggles with assessment on a number of fronts simultaneously. Additional themes concern: significant differences between attitudes compared by subject, teacher practice, background and sectors; and the notion of what a creative response in music and arts might entail for teacher education.

Conclusions And Implications

While pupils deserve to be introduced to different views on creativity assessment they also deserve to assert their own agency as artists. The differentiated nature of what creativity might mean in relation to classroom-based assessment of music and visual arts, requires planning activities to support choice, where assessment of creativity in music and visual art fosters a growing sense of control and authorial agency can be practiced and how creativity assessment can be operationalised in both primary and secondary school contexts (e.g. where the consideration of possibilities for the alignment of curriculum and pedagogy, experience and opportunity, as well as the exploration of freedom and form has the potential to foster creativity in pupil’s music and visual art making and creating).

Creativity assessment is currently under-theorised in primary and secondary schools’ music and visual arts programmes. It is neither clear what a creative skill is nor what constitutes an effective creative stimulus that engenders meaningful creative purpose and leads to successful task completion (Fautley and Savage, 2008; Spruce, 1996; Swanwick, 1999; Spruce, 1996). Through developing an open and creative ethos in music and visual art assessment practices, teachers can encourage experimentation in providing diverse forms of feedback and assessment. Time needs to be built into creative activities for ongoing reflection, response and assessment, whether in assessing children’s progression as artists by examining a range of outcomes from different contexts such as music and visual arts and the content and potential impact of assessing creativity in poetic texts, writing and fiction texts. Either
way, if teachers focus on the surface features of creativity – the marks on the page, at the expense of responding to the originality and authorial meaning of pupils’ own arts expressions, then pupils will focus on the important minutiae at the expense of developing a sense of themselves as artists and authors with something to say. The development of the Assessing Creativity in the Arts (ACA) questionnaire in future research in teacher thinking will facilitate further investigation of arts-based research paradigms in creativity research.

References


**Appendix 1: Interview Schedules**

**Sample of Questions for Teachers**

Questions around the construct of creativity
1. The National Curriculum attainment targets in England do not mention ‘creativity’ directly. To what extent and how do you accommodate creativity in (a) teaching/lessons (b) assessment tasks?
2. What do you mean by creativity? What does it look like in your classroom practices, what challenges and opportunities in this respect; does creativity feature in all assessment tasks and outcomes?
3. Which of these images (show on screen & paper) is the most creative and why and where (see examples)?
4. Any other comments?
5. Please give examples of activities that you have used in visual art/ music which you consider a successful and valuable experience for the students?”
6. Please describe ways in which two members of the three students or assessment tasks/activities are alike and thereby different from the third.

**Sample of Questions for Students**

Questions related to perceived constructs around creativity
1. What work did you produce in the lesson (seek exemplars)-how would you describe it - what are its key features?
2. How do you decide if you are pleased with the work you produced-what qualities do you look for in your work?
3. Which of these images (show on screen & paper) is the most creative and why and where (see examples)?
4. Your work in class today-would you say it was creative-why and where?
5. Thinking about other tasks you have worked on in class, which ones can you recall as being particularly creative-was this assessed in any way?
6. Do you think your creativity is assessed in school, when, how and who?
7. Please give examples of activities that you have used in visual art/ music which you consider a successful and valuable experience for the students?”
8. Please describe ways in which two members of the three assessment tasks/activities are alike and thereby different from the third.


iv See the extra feature from the Paramount DVD edition (ibid.), THE PERSONAL DIARIES: An Interview with Mark Logue, Lionel Logue’s Grandson and Co-Author (with Peter Conradi) of THE KING’S SPEECH: HOW ONE MAN SAVED THE BRITISH MONARCHY.

v Barrie, D. (Director.) *The Real King’s Speech*. [Film]. 2011.Australia: DRG Holdings, Pty. Ltd. See interview with Logue’s former patients.

vi See the extra feature from the Paramount DVD edition (ibid.), THE PERSONAL DIARIES: An Interview with Mark Logue, Lionel Logue’s Grandson and Co-Author (with Peter Conradi) of THE KING’S SPEECH: HOW ONE MAN SAVED THE BRITISH MONARCHY.

vii Ibid.

viii See audio commentary by Tom Hooper, featured as part of the extras issued on DVD 8784, Paramount Pictures, 2011.


x Hooper reports that this inclusion was Colin Firth’s idea. See audio commentary by Tom Hooper, featured as part of the extras issued on DVD 8784, Paramount Pictures, 2011.

xi See the extra feature from the Paramount DVD edition: *Behind the Scenes of The King’s Speech*. 

155